Candidate Perceptions of Faculty Presence in an Online Principal Preparation Program
L. Kay Abernathy, Nancy Adams, Daryl Ann Borel, Lamar University

Using Active Learning Strategies in Major Assignments
Timothy J Bailey, Catherine A Hooey, Hyun Joong Kim, Pittsburg State University

The Death of Philando Castile: The Initial Media Reports
Professor Sue Burum, Minnesota State University, Mankato

A Review of Collaborative Action Educational Research: Opportunities and Challenges
Paul E. Carlson, Barba A. Patton, Diane E. Prince, University of Houston-Victoria

“MEÑ AFIME--I WAS THERE”: Multi-Disciplinary Methods For Intercultural Undergraduate Research
D.R. Elder, N.C. Crook, J. Crook, C. McClain, G. Smith, E. Hardesty
Ohio State ATI, Wooster OH

What is Aleppo? Ten things you should know about the war in Syria and Iraq
Patricia M. Kirtley, Independent Scholar
William M. Kirtley, Central Texas College

Understanding Susan Blow’s Legacy
Yong Joon Park, Indiana State University

Teaching Feminist Economics to Non-believers
Mary Tripp Reed, Murray State University

The Role of Political Culture In The Implementation of International Statute in an Unstable State: The Case of Somalia
Emmanuel Uwalaka, Chad Williams, St. Louis University

Shakespearian Philosophy and Shakespeare’s Women
Ric Williams, Glendale Community College (Retired)

Consumerism in the People’s Republic of China
Baomei Zhao, University of Akron
Yanmin He, Zhejiang University of Technology
Timothy McCarragher, Michelle Kreidler, University of Akron
Candidate Perceptions of Faculty Presence in an Online Principal Preparation Program

L. Kay Abernathy
Nancy Adams
Daryl Ann Borel

Lamar University
Introduction and Background

Faculty presence in an online environment is critical to foster student teaching and learning (Boettcher & Conrad, 2016). Creating a sense of presence in the learner requires the instructor to integrate tools and best practices that will enhance faculty presence (Samuel, 2015). Lamar University, a regional four-year university in southeast Texas, began a master’s educational administration principal preparation program in October 2007 with 340 candidates in the College of Education’s Department of Educational Leadership. In less than two months, the enrollment increased to over 900 students. A masters of Educational Technology Leadership degree program was added in 2008 and in 2014 the third master’s degree, Digital Learning and Leading, began. Currently, the online programs in the department include master’s degrees in Educational Administration, Educational Technology Leadership, and Digital Learning and Leadership, as well as Principal and Superintendent Certification programs. The online enrollment in Fall 2016 was 1986 students which included 1098 Educational Administration candidates, 140 Educational Technology Leadership candidates, 79 Digital Learning and Leadership students, 583 Principal Certification candidates, and 86 Superintendent Certification candidates. The purpose of this study was to examine online students’ perceptions regarding the usefulness of course tools and practices in an online course to enhance faculty presence.

The simplest description of presence is “being there” (Boettcher & Conrad, 2016). Faculty presence is the feeling of students that they are being taught by an individual (O’Reilly, 2009). Faculty is present when they are seen as more than just a name on a page or a person assigning a grade. Faculty presence is part of demonstrating personality, knowledge, and understanding. As a significant component of the online environment, faculty presence promotes critical teaching and learning.

In acceptance of Boettcher and Conrad’s (2016) assumption that presence is an important best practice in an online course, the researchers examined online Masters of Education students’ perceptions regarding the usefulness of course tools and practices in an online principal preparation course to enhance faculty presence in teaching and learning. The research question guiding the study was “To what extent do students perceive course tools and practices used in an online principal preparation course enhance faculty presence and the teaching and learning process?”

Review of the Literature

Hussein, Fareaj, Barak, and Dori (2012) reported that early distance education courses were described as isolating for students without adequate faculty presence. By studying student perceptions and learning experiences, course developers created and adopted interactive and collaborative tools and practices to improve faculty presence in online courses. Konings, et al. (2016) stressed that the addition of online group meetings with video conferencing helped to overcome disadvantages of student and instructors being in different locations. Akyol and Garrison (2011) emphasized the role of social presence in developing a supportive learning environment where students felt comfortable. Yang, Quadir, Chen, and Miao (2016) recommended the use of engaging tools such as live chat, discussion forums, and weekly Google Hangout meetings to enhance teaching presence as well as learning outcomes. In addition, Wang (2014 p. 357) maintained that with the increasing use of social media and tools for collaborative
learning in online courses, student interactions could contribute to the course and to the students’ performance. The Hussein, et al. study supported others who observed that the courses’ pedagogy and technology could be of better quality if students’ social interactions were enhanced by faculty presence in the learning environment.

Methodology
This study was approved by the Institutional Review Board of Lamar University. All participants consented to be a part of this study by responding to an email invitation and choosing to respond to the online questionnaire Survey Monkey link. A three-part structured questionnaire was used to collect the following: a) Demographic information, b) Perceptions of faculty presence and support, and c) Open-response questions. Questionnaire data were collected during an online principal preparation five week course in the Summer 2016 semester.

Descriptive statistics were used to analyze the quantitative data collected from the sections A and B of the questionnaire. The frequencies and percentages of students’ responses were reported. The open-response questions in section C were examined for overall trends and themes.

Findings and Discussion
The research population targeted for this study was the 317 graduate students who were enrolled in EDLD 5326 School Community Relations during the Summer semester 2016. Of the 317 students, 86 respondents completed the survey for a response rate of 27.1%. Participants for this study were invited to participate through an introductory email during the course. The survey link was distributed in the introductory email. Candidate background information was gathered in the first section of the survey, the second section pertained faculty presence and support. Two open-response questions were asked at the end of the survey. Descriptive statistics were used to analyze the collected data. The open-response questions were examined for overall trends and themes.

The demographics of the student participants were similar to the overall online student population. Data for the population were obtained from information released by the university distance education office. The majority of the respondents were Caucasian females. The largest minority groups were Hispanic students with 16 respondents comprising 18.6% and 4 African American students representing 4.7% of the total population. Approximately 88.4% of the participants were between the ages of 25 and 45. Table 1 displays the demographics of the questionnaire participants.

The survey also collected data regarding the respondents’ experience as a student in online courses as well as faculty presence associated with the online environment. The majority of the respondents (46.5%) reported an intermediate level of experience.

Section two of the survey pertained to perceptions of faculty presence and support in an online principal preparation program. Data were collected regarding sense of faculty presence associated within the online environment and the course tools that respondents perceived contributed to support and faculty sense of presence. Table 3 presents that approximately one-half (49.4%) of the participants reported that from the beginning of their program to when they completed the survey, their sense of faculty
presence associated within the online environment was satisfactory. The participants’ responses to tools used in the online environment to for support and sense of faculty presence are reported in Table 4. While students provided positive feedback on the course tools and practices as a whole, they indicated that course announcements (69.7%), course overviews (68.6%), recorded web conferences (68.6%), and emails (64%) with course professors were most helpful in supporting their course work and creating faculty sense of presence in the online principal preparation program.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Students perceived that the communication tools served to enhance clarification of performance expectations and the students’ ability to organize their coursework around their busy lives as they engaged in the five week online courses contributing to faculty presence. Additionally, students’ positive comments regarding interactions with the professors, whether through one-to-one emails or in web conferences where students saw the professor, asked questions, and participated in discussions in ‘real time’, indicated a desire for and appreciation of tools that humanized the online environment. Students’ comments expressing a desire for more discussion time during web conferences and more detailed feedback reinforced the need for tools and strategies which provide personalized support.

The researchers’ recommendations for future studies include a study to better understand how faculty actually use the features and options available in web conferencing platforms to effect student engagement, interaction, and collaboration. A study to identify tools and strategies that align with cognitive, social, and teaching presences in online courses to minimize challenges of online learning such as learner isolation, lack of experience with collaborative group work, as well as to develop higher level learning is also proposed. A study examining how faculty use features of the learning management system to effect faculty presence could provide useful insights, as well. As online courses become more prolific, it behooves faculty to experiment with the many tools and strategies available to enhance the online teaching-learning process.
References
### Table 1
Participants’ Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>70.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>29.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnicity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African-American</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>74.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific Islander</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or more races</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Range</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 – 35</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>41.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 – 45</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>46.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 – 55</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over 55</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2
Participants’ Experience as a Student in Online Courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experience</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beginner</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>46.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>36.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3
**Faculty Presence Associated with the Online Environment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sense of Faculty Presence</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None at all</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little sense of faculty presence</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat sense of faculty presence</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quite much sense of faculty presence</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>49.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very much sense of faculty presence</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4
**Tools and Practices Used to Enhance Faculty Presence**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool/Practice</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Course Announcements</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>69.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course Overviews</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>68.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recorded Web Conferences</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>68.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emails with Professors</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>64.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course Welcome Letters from Professors</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>55.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synchronous Web Conferences</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>52.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report Templates, such as Action Research</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>47.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding Remarks from Course Professors</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>40.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook Groups</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personalized Introduction Video</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Applicable</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Using Active Learning Strategies in Major Assignments

Timothy J Bailey
Pittsburg State University

Catherine A Hooey
Pittsburg State University

Hyun Joong Kim
Pittsburg State University
The Challenge: Breaking from the traditional teaching pedagogy of lectures and passive learning

This paper explores the application of active learning strategies to larger scale, time-intensive assignments in junior and senior level university classes. Activities associated with active learning methods will be assessed in the context of sustainability-related assignments in geography. While there are many quick active learning strategies: think-pair-share, one minute papers, small group discussion, brainstorming, etc., the focus of this paper is on strategies that are much more demanding and time consuming for the student, particularly assignments that contribute substantially to their final grade (typically 20-30%). Challenges to the various methodologies, including open ended student-driven learning and assessment of individual performance in group activities will be discussed.

For decades, it has been common for geography to offer formal lecture-based courses and separate lab courses, or at least lab components. These labs typically require the application of concepts that are introduced in the lecture, where information is presented via lecture delivery with passive learning by the student. Formal exams are the primary method of assessment. For many instructors, active learning has meant lab assignments and research papers for individual students. While it is not uncommon for labs to be completed by pairs of students, the numerous challenges associated with the assessment of individual performance within groups precludes other group activities.

Over the past several years, pedagogy in geography has expanded to include a number of active learning strategies that have changed the way information is presented and the way student learning is assessed. These are often perceived as a radical shift and polarize faculty in terms of what is suitable delivery and suitable assessment. This lack of consensus is due, in part, to the lack of understanding of the assumptions / pedagogy behind the application and assessment of active learning approaches.

This is amplified by the fact that there is no universally accepted definition of ‘active learning’. Bonwell and Eison (1991) note in their Association for the Study of Higher Education (ASHE) report that the term has never been precisely defined in the relevant educational literature. The authors provide a working definition: “Active learning engages students in two aspects – doing things and thinking about the things they are doing” (Bonwell and Eison, 1991:19). Berry (2008:150) refines this somewhat, suggesting that four key elements characterize all active learning approaches: “(1) encouragement of critical thinking, (2) responsibility for learning placed on the learner, (3) engagement in open-ended activities, and (4) organization of the learning activities by the educator.”

There is a growing body of research (Doyle, 2011; Zull, 2011; Prince, 2004; Weimer, 2002) that indicates that to learn, students must do more than just listen. They must engage in higher-order thinking tasks such as analysis, synthesis and evaluation. This may suit many geography courses, because field/lab assignments are a typical way of applying the concepts learned in lectures. The big difference is facilitating the learning of foundational information through other than the instructor-controlled environment of the formal lecture.
Active Learning Strategies: An Overview

Within the greater active learning milieu, there are three related approaches that have been identified as being most conducive to active learning. While all involve group activities, each has its own set of challenges with regard to level of content control by the instructor and the assessment of student learning outcomes.

Collaborative learning:
This is an instructional method where students work together in small groups toward a common goal. The core element is the emphasis on student interaction as much as it is on content learning. It is less structured than cooperative learning (see the section that follows) and the tasks are more open-ended. The instructor basically abdicates their leadership role (Cooper and Robinson, 1997; Rockwell, 1995a, 1995b). As such, it is more closely tied to social constructionism—the development of jointly constructed ideas that form the basis for our shared knowledge or assumptions (Lock and Strong, 2010; Leeds-Hurwitz, 2009). Skills gained, such as collaboration and conflict resolution, are very valuable in the real world but harder to evaluate in terms of individual contribution. Typically, assessment takes place at the group level, as individual efforts are obscured by the process itself. Consequently, high performing students may not favor this type of activity.

Cooperative learning:
This involves a structured form of group work where students pursue common goals. The assignment is typically more structurally defined than in collaborative learning, and requires greater project design and monitoring/direction by the instructor (Cooper and Robinson, 1997; Rockwell, 1995a, 1995b.). This approach is seen to better align with the methodology of building a foundational or traditional knowledge base. Typically, students are assessed individually as well as a group. Many students who are grade-sensitive feel more secure with this emphasis, knowing they will be rewarded for their individual contribution (peer assessment, self-assessment, group assessment, etc.).

Problem-based learning:
As the label implies, this begins with a problem introduced at the beginning of the instruction cycle. Students work together in small groups to solve real-world, application-type problems related to the course material. The problem, and solving it, provides the context and the motivation for the learning that should follow. It is always active, but may not be collaborative or cooperative. It also typically requires more self-directed learning on the part of the student/students (Prince, 2004). The challenge for the faculty is assessing the value of knowledge growth by the student versus the extent of project completion.

Assignments: strategies and objectives
To facilitate active learning, we have been working to incorporate these three strategies in our upper level courses, as these are most applicable to major assignments. These methods do not have to be used in isolation; combining them in different ways allows the creation of innovative and thoughtful learning opportunities. The examples that follow demonstrate the ways in which we use and combine them to different extents in our exercises. More relevantly, different methods can be used at different stages throughout the progression of an assignment.
Case study presentations and evaluations (limited cooperative group):

The overall goal of this assignment example is for each student to complete the analysis of a resolved case study in resource conflict management. As the first step in the process, in order to choose the most appropriate case study for analysis, each student presents an overview of two potential case studies to the class. Then, as a group (faculty and students), everyone helps explore the potential of each case study using a common set of criteria (identified by the instructor): policies, stakeholders, identifiable relationships, etc. The group goal is to help each student select the best case study for a follow-up in-depth study by the individual. The final grade is based on the individual. Experience to date indicates that the class as a whole feels more invested in all of the materials and processes related not only to their work but to their classmates’ work as well. The individual feels safer and more likely to succeed with the group’s input.

Case studies presentations and evaluations (cooperative group):

Following a formal lecture of the broader topic/issue at hand (such as new urbanism or urban sustainability), small groups are required to independently research, present and write about case studies in order to demonstrate their understanding and application of content. Next, the class works as a whole to evaluate these examples, using popular metrics (provided by the instructor). This assignment structure allows both the group and the individual to be graded on contribution. To date, the ability of groups to select examples of greatest interest to them has resulted in high quality student work. It has fostered cooperation that has carried over to other projects. Being involved in the evaluation of others’ work helps individual students gain critical thinking skills and acquire additional perspectives on the application of the content.

Potential applications to local community settings (collaborative group):

Following group presentations of materials on sustainability case studies, small groups examine their own community and select applications they think would be beneficial. They then create a presentation explaining what, where, why, and how. The end goal is to create a variety of options that could be presented to our city commission, and displayed at our undergraduate research forum. This is an open-ended assignment. Group grading is typical. A major objective here is the expansion of their community sustainability awareness; this has, in some cases, led to civic engagement and action.

Simulation exercises (collaborative group):

As a lengthy final group assignment in an urban geography/development class, the students are required to draw on the content learned and apply it as they see fit to a redevelopment scenario. Building on a simulation created by the Urban Land Institute (ULI) entitled Urban Plan, the students are presented with a hypothetical inner city and a request for proposals from the mayor, where they will redevelop a few blocks into a new neighborhood. In this structured assignment, there are land use needs, budget restrictions, environmental and societal complications, etc. The emphasis is on content application as compared to learning new materials. This is an open-ended assignment. Group grading is typical. This exercise has proven to be highly successful in boosting content retention, small group communication, and conflict resolution.
Simulation and role playing exercises (collaborative group, cooperative group):

As a lengthy final group assignment in an urban planning class, the students are required to draw on the content learned and apply it as they see fit to a new suburban development scenario. Building on a simulation created by the ULI entitled Dilemmas of Development, the students are presented with a request for proposals from the mayor, where they will develop a new suburban community. In this exercise, each student in the group is given a specified role (developer, land planner, environmental planner, etc.) – the major priorities of the roles conflict. Further, each group will make formal presentations before a county commission and community members (made up of faculty with roles) in a multi-meeting scenario. This requires the groups to create a plan and then evaluate, recreate and present twice more. The emphasis is on critical analysis and conflict resolution. This is an open-ended assignment. Both group and individual grading is possible. This also has proven to be very effective in increasing content retention, small group communication, and conflict resolution.

Internship assignments/technology focus (problem-based, collaborative group):

One of the possibilities for our upper level classmen is to partake in an internship/service learning course. The traditional model of internships (Wentz and Trapido-Lurie, 2001; Jackson and Jackson, 2009) involves the organization or business mentoring, directing and assessing projects. In contrast, our faculty work with local and regional agencies to identify GIS-related projects that are desired/beneficial to them. Given that most agencies in our agency want GIS-related data/products but lack any expertise to pursue these, we provide the opportunity for students to work on the desired projects in-house (using university-provided hard/software). These projects are assigned to groups of students who take the lead in determining a course of action and producing a solution/product. Faculty leadership is kept to a minimum if possible; instruction and direction are given as needed, primarily to maintain an appropriate level of quality control. If possible, individual grades are assessed. This non-traditional structure has proven to substantially benefit the students and help develop long-term collaborations between our program and various regional community organizations (Kim, 2012).

Site visits/field trips/conferences (collaborative group, experiential):

Faculty are beginning to work on an alternative/extra credit assignment related to a regional site visit (day trip) or attendance at a professional conference (3-day event). Students create small groups; each group is assigned a topic area and must report on the related activities discovered during their trip. The main goal is for the students to see talk put into action and to get a sense of some of the obstacles that reality presents. This is a pass/fail graded experience.

Issues to be resolved

We have found that for these strategies to be effectively implemented, faculty need to change from the common way of organizing lecture content (i.e. select a text, follow the general progression, supplement with additional materials to add specific relevance to the course goals). Basically, a reversed course planning approach works best – starting from the end to get to the beginning (Fink, 2003). This involves first identifying student learning outcomes (SLOs), determining what you and the students need to do in order for the students to achieve the objectives (teaching and learning
activities?), and determining how you and the students will know if the SLOs have been attained (assessment and documentation?) (Allen, 1996).

Breaking from the passive learning approach of traditional lectures necessitates assessing what degree of instructor guidance versus instruction is necessary. The simple fear of losing control of content covered in a semester is a common and major obstacle. For most of us, it is not how we were taught in our undergraduate degrees. Recent research points to the finding that the person doing the teaching is less important than how students are taught and what they are expected to do (Doyle, 2011). According to Smith et al (2005:2): “engaging students in learning is principally the responsibility of the teacher, who becomes less an imparter of knowledge and more a designer and facilitator of learning experiences.”

When should active learning be used during instruction? Studies show that activities before lecture and readings result in deeper learning, understanding and transfer. The concept of student-directed learning without first understanding the key concepts to focus on is unsettling to many instructors. The fear of wasting too much time in simple discovery of the issue is seen as limiting (if not destructive) to being able to build a knowledge base in a semester.

How do we tie this to traditional assessment and concepts of measured value added? Many faculty (and universities) are pressed to validate their efforts with metrics that measure knowledge gained. The growing use of pre-test/post-test, exit tests, discipline-based field tests, etc. have created an environment that is best served by quantitative measurement. Gains through group work, collaborative and cooperative learning, and conflict resolution skills are not easily assessed. This discourages expanding their use.

In a related sense, department chairs also must provide assessment data to university administrators. The difficulties in evaluating student gains in different courses and majors tends to bring us back to the default need for a formal test grading structure measuring individual success. This is especially the case in a department that is diverse in terms of programs (our department, for example, is headed by an anthropologist who oversees undergraduate degrees in Geography, History, International Studies, Justice Studies, Philosophy, Political Science, Social Work, and Sociology.) Active learning and the expectation of individual assessment add hurdles to an already complex management problem.

Conclusions
Passive learning strategies are coming under fire for not fully engaging students in learning and not creating the generic skill sets desired by employers. The latter includes critical analytical thinking, oral and written communication, effective teamwork and problem-solving, applying knowledge and skills in real-world settings, etc. (Association of American Colleges and Universities, 2015). The use of active learning strategies begins to address these shortfalls. Despite the challenges associated with their implementation, active learning puts more of the educational experience directly in the hands of the student, leading to a more meaningful educational experience. Further, these are becoming more commonplace in higher education (President’s Council of Advisors on Science and Technology, 2012).
References
Urban Land Institute. Urban Plan: Developing Communities Series. Website: uli.org
Urban Land Institute. Dilemmas of Development: Developing Communities Series. Website: uli.org
The Death of Philando Castile:  
The Initial Media Reports

Professor Sue Burum  
Minnesota State University, Mankato
The Incident

Philando Castile, who was a 32-year-old Black man, was fatally shot on July 6, 2016, in Falcon Heights, Minnesota, after being pulled over by St. Anthony police officer Jeronimo Yanez. Castile died a few minutes after reaching Hennepin County Medical Center in Minneapolis. He was a cafeteria supervisor at J.J. Hill Montessori School in St. Paul. Castile’s girlfriend, Lavish “Diamond” Reynolds, streamed the aftermath of the shooting live on Facebook from her cellphone (Video 1, 2016). Reynolds was a passenger in the car with her 4-year-old daughter. In the video, with Castile in a blood-soaked white t-shirt slumped next to her, Reynolds said, “The police shot him for no apparent reason, no reason at all.” In the video she said they were pulled over for a broken taillight. She said, “[the officer] asked him for license and registration. He told him that it was in his wallet, but he had a pistol on him because he’s licensed to carry. The officer said, ‘don’t move.’ As he was putting his hands back up, the officer shot him in the arm four or five times.” The video starts after the shooting. It shows a uniformed police officer holding a pistol on the couple from outside the car. The officer is heard to say, “I told him not to reach for it. I told him to get his hand out.” She stressed in her video that Castile complied with Yanez’s requests before the shooting, but the video started after the shooting, it is grainy, and a viewer cannot see a gun. When talking to reporters the day after the death, she said, “As he’s reaching for his back pocket wallet, he lets the officer know, ‘Officer, I have a firearm on me.’” She said, “I began to yell, ‘But he is licensed to carry.’’ After that (the officer) began to take off shots” (Forliti & Potter, 2016). Later, Reynolds, with her attorney, gave an interview to ABC News, in which she seems to alter her story about the gun in the car. In this interview, she said, “[The gun] never came out. It could never be a threat. [Yanez] didn’t ask about it... He didn’t know it was on his person” (Video 2, 2016).

Reynolds’s video and the interview on ABC is all most people will have seen, heard, or read about this incident. People have formed strong opinions about this case from that information. The formal investigation will not conclude until sometime in November 2016. Unfortunately, in the meantime, the United States will have had more shootings and more deaths. When the final investigation comes out, the findings will be irrelevant because peoples’ attitudes about the incident will already be settled. This paper will look beyond the video and interview and focus on what reporters added to the incident from their own investigations during the first couple of months after the shooting. Most people will not read this extra information, especially since the investigations were mostly done by local reporters. But, the additional investigation presents a more complete picture of the incident beyond the video, which only presented one side of the shooting and did not start until after Castile had been shot. This paper will also consider potential consequences should the initial video prove to be inaccurate, as well as consider the potential breakdown of trust between law enforcement and citizens.

A potential bias warning is in order. This writer is trying to cover everything presented through the mass media. However, like the rest of society, a certain world view is always brought to these situations. This writer teaches at Minnesota State University, Mankato. This is the same school from which the two officers in the case graduated. This writer did not have these two officers as students but has spent over 30 years teaching potential police officers. This writer has studied police officer shooting decisions and how quickly such decisions must be made. The focus of this paper will
strictly be what was reported in the media in August and September 2016, but the analysis is influenced by years of law enforcement teaching and study.

**Aftermath Affecting the Family**

More than 1,000 mourners attended Castile’s funeral Thursday, July 14, at the Cathedral of St. Paul. After the service, mourners lined both sides of the steps holding signs saying “Unite for Philando” as pallbearers, dressed in white, raised clenched fists as they carried out the casket. Minnesota Governor Mark Dayton, who suggested that race played a role in Castile’s death, attended the funeral (Parry, 2016).

Valerie Castile, Philando Castile’s mother, said she was devastated by the death of her son. She described him as “a humanitarian and pillar of the community.” Asked whether her son was the victim of racial profiling, she indicated that he was. She wants to make sure this does not happen to another family (Bakst & Nelson, 2016).

The mother hired Glenda Hatchett, a former TV judge and founding partner of the Atlanta-based The Hatchett Firm, PC, to handle their case. At a press conference, she indicated that there would be a lawsuit, but did not go into specifics because the investigation is still ongoing (Mosedale, 2016). She asked for a special prosecutor, not the Ramsey County Attorney John Choi, to decide whether criminal charges should be brought against the officer. Choi said he was elected to uphold the law and that he intended to fulfill his duty in the case. He did say he would incorporate a special prosecutor into his team to enhance trust in the results (Capecchi & Smith, 2016). He named former U.S. Department of Justice attorney Don Lewis to the role. Lewis is a Black attorney who went to Harvard Law School. He worked on civil rights cases in the South. After this, he returned to Minneapolis and worked for around 7 years as a federal prosecutor. He is also a former Hamline Law School dean. He helped investigate allegations of excessive force in the arrest of a Black community activist in 2014 in Minneapolis. In that case, Lewis concluded the officers were justified in the amount of force they used (Capecchi & Smith, 2016). Hatchett indicated that she intended to assemble a team to conduct a special investigation. Ultimately, she wants to see legislation to address the problem of profiling, improve the systems for hiring and training officers, and better address citizen complaints.

Nekima Levy-Pounds, the President of the Minneapolis NAACP, objected to the arrangement of Choi and Lewis conducting the investigation. Levy-Pounds concluded Lewis would not be an independent prosecutor in the investigation as long as Choi still would have authority over the case. She wanted an independent body to be appointed to investigate the shooting. She was even skeptical of the Bureau of Criminal Apprehension, the Minnesota unit that would normally conduct these probes. She said, “We’re demanding justice: we’re demanding accountability. We’re demanding a change to our laws and politics that allow these types of things to happen. Too often officers are taught to shoot first and ask questions last, and that’s completely unacceptable” (Knight, 2016).

St. Paul’s former Superintendent Valeria Silva called Castile, who was a district graduate, “one of our own.” Silva said colleagues in St. Paul called him “cheerful” and a “team player” (Superville, 2016). Cole Welhaven, the nutrition services coordinator for the district, said he was known to students as Mr. Phil. Welhaven said, “He would laugh and joke with them, and he made sure they took their vegetables… He just related very well with them” (Superville, 2016). It is understandable how Castile’s family would feel
they were entitled to justice. Castile seems like the “Mr. Rogers” of the cafeteria, beloved by all. He does not sound like a potential cop killer. He sounds like a decent hard working young man.

**Aftermath Affecting the Officers**

Officer Yanez, a Latino, joined the force in 2011. Officer Joseph Kauser, his classmate and the other officer at the incident, also joined the force in 2011. The St. Anthony Police Department was their first policing job. They both graduated at the top of their class from Minnesota State University, Mankato, in 2010. When they graduated, they both received the Baton of Honor. This award was earned from a class of about 500 students for being the most promising future officers in their class for their intelligence and leadership qualities (Stahl & Chansen, 2016). They both majored in Law Enforcement and completed a skills component focusing on activities such as defense tactics, proper firearm handling, and proper professional conduct. After they completed skills training, they were tested by the state on their knowledge and skills. They then both become licensed police officers in Minnesota.

Yanez’s attorney, Thomas Kelly of Minneapolis, said the officer reacted after seeing a gun. He said that one of the reasons Yanez pulled Castile over was because he thought he looked like a positive match for an armed robbery suspect. Kelly said, “The officer was reacting to the actions of the driver. This had nothing to do with race. This had everything to do with the presence of a gun…and the display of that gun” (Gurman & Foreman, 2016).

Sgt. John Mangseth, the St. Anthony interim police chief, said an official investigation is being conducted by the Minnesota Bureau of Criminal Apprehension. He said there hasn’t been an officer–involved shooting in the St. Anthony Police Department’s coverage area for 30 years. While refusing to discuss the killing, Mangseth defended Yanez in an interview with the Associated Press. He said Yanez displayed “a real sound ability when it comes to communicating and relating to people” (Potter 2, 2016). It is understandable how Yanez can be considered an exceptional young officer.

**Possible Outcomes**

**Officer Yanez Might Be Charged**

There are several reasons why Officer Yanez could face a grand jury and even be charged. First, community pressure will be on prosecutors to bring charges. The public is outraged, and the public knows something in society is not right (Vock, 2016). It seems in the news there is constantly some shooting of an unarmed Black man by police officers. Politicians need to react to these fears or they could face defeat in the next election. If Reynolds’s video tells the whole story, Castile appears to be an innocent Black man who was gunned down in cold blood by a very rattled young officer trained to think the public is his enemy. Castile appears to be shot for reaching for his wallet, after being specifically told to get his identification by the officer who shot him. The members of the public, who mostly get their news from television reporters and videos, have seen this story before.

A first example developed on July 5, 2016, one day before the Castile shooting. In Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 37-year-old Black man Alton Sterling was shot by police. Officers responded to an anonymous call that a Black man, dressed in a red shirt and believed to be Sterling, threatened the caller with a gun outside a convenience store while he was selling CDs. Officers located and tased Sterling, and then forced him to
the ground. He was shot while on the ground when officers believed he was going for a gun from his pocket (Yan, Berlinger, & Robinson, 2016). The formal investigation of this officer-involved shooting is also still ongoing. The death of Sterling was caught on tape by multiple sources. At first glance, the death appears to be unjustified. To immediately follow this shooting with a similar video and media report of Castile’s shooting one day later probably set in motion an explosive chain of events. The public simply lumped the two videos together. Both videos seemed to show two innocent Black men shot in cold blood by what appeared to be murderous police officers.

A devastating development occurred on July 7, 2016, in downtown Dallas in response to the Sterling and Castile shootings. Five police officers were killed by Micah Xavier Johnson, a heavily armed Black sniper, during a peaceful Black Lives Matter rally. In the attack, Johnson also wounded seven other officers and two civilians. Johnson was killed by a bomb-carrying police robot after negotiations with him failed. In an exchange with police before his death, he said he was infuriated by the deaths of Black men killed by police, and he wanted to kill White police officers (Zavadski & Collins, 2016). While horrific, similar feelings of outrage were probably felt by others who grouped the two shootings and videos together. Coming from two different locations in the country, some could consider all police out to murder innocent Black men.

A second example had developed in Minnesota on November 15, 2015, less than a year before the Castile shooting. Minnesota residents saw media reports of what appeared to be a story of racial hatred unfold. Jamar Clark, a 24-year-old Black man, was shot in the head after an encounter with two Minneapolis police officers. Some witnesses claimed Clark was shot after he was handcuffed. Others said Clark was shot after trying to grab an officer’s gun (Lissarrague, 2016). County, state, and federal officials investigated the shooting. Neither the state nor the federal government brought charges. The state did not bring charges because they concluded that the weight of the evidence supported the officer’s account that Clark was not handcuffed and he tried to grab a gun. The federal government did not bring charges because the government did not find that the incident was racially motivated (Vock, 2016).

As in the Sterling case, there was a violent response to the Clark case. Five protesters were shot November 23 near a Black Lives Matter encampment at the Fourth Precinct in Minneapolis. Black Lives Matter and others were protesting the decision not to bring charges. The protestors were shot while trying to move a group of White supremacists away from the encampment. What went on in the minds of the White supremacists is hard to imagine (Gettys, 2015). The general unrest and distrust in Minnesota, though, undoubtedly played a role in their decision. Three of the White supremacists were convicted of various charges in the shootings. The shooting of Clark put the state on edge and put police community relations in the Twin Cities under an international spotlight. The shooting of Castile also took place against this backdrop.

After the Clark and Sterling shootings, Minnesota’s Governor Dayton did not hesitate to respond after the Castile shooting. On July 6, right after the shooting and before any investigation, Dayton commented to reporters that Castile would probably still be alive had he been White (Rupar, 2016). Dayton, a reasonable man, certainly watched the Sterling case with the rest of the country. He was governor when the Clark case unfolded in Minnesota and when protesters were shot by White supremacists. He
no doubt was trying to calm people down. He certainly wanted to reassure people that there would be an investigation and justice. However, his comments did not say there would be justice if the investigation warranted the bringing of charges. Charges were not brought in the Clark case because neither the state nor the federal investigation warranted them (Tigue, 2016). Early comments, like those made by Dayton, possibly led people to believe that Reynolds’s video was the whole story, the media had reported the entire story correctly the first time and, therefore, the officer should be charged with murder. Dayton also promised that the officers responsible would be brought to justice (Fox 9 News, 2016). As the Governor made a statement indicating the officer was at fault, pressure may be put on government officials, such as the prosecutors, to bring some charges against the officer whether they are warranted or not. If charges are not brought or there is no conviction, it is understandable how the public could conclude government institutions and politicians are failing them, and police officers are getting away with murder if they shoot Black citizens. Dayton’s early statement could actually inflame the situation should charges not be warranted.

Additionally, there are some facts that seem to corroborate Reynolds’s account of the events in the video. In the video, Reynolds states that they were pulled over for a broken taillight. Later, Yanez’s attorney stated that the car was pulled over because Castile reminded Yanez of a robbery suspect (Doherty, 2016). Is the attorney’s statement true, or was this something simply created to respond to Reynolds’s account? According to St. Anthony training manuals, if an officer believes it is a high risk stop – which would be the case if stopping an armed robbery suspect – the officer should have the driver and others exit the car before approaching the vehicle. The officers should take cover and draw their weapons (Forliti & Potter, 2016). It does not appear the two officers did this type of stop. This fact could be used to argue that the reason for the stop was more likely a burned-out taillight or simply racial profiling. Reynolds was also correct in the video when she said Castile had a permit to carry a gun. The Hennepin County Sheriff’s Department confirmed that Castile received a gun permit June 4, 2015 (Forliti & Potter, 2016) These facts support the statements Reynolds made in the video and give credibility to the video.

Finally, statistics seem to back up Castile’s family’s position that he was pulled over and shot simply because he was Black. St. Anthony police data shows that nearly half of all people arrested in 2016 were Black. There has been only a small increase in the area’s Black populations since 2010 when Falcon Heights’ population was 73.3% White and 8.0% Black. However, the percentage of the department’s Black arrests has increased steadily since 2011, when 38 percent of the people arrested were Black (Potter 1, 2016). If this approach is correct, the officer could be charged.

**Officer Yanez Might Be Exonerated**

There are also many facts that support Officer Yanez’s position. These facts were not reported immediately after the shooting. Reporters had to investigate and uncover these facts. Thus, these updated facts are not known to people who saw Reynolds’s video, but did not continue to follow the story in the state’s newspapers. These facts may or may not be true. The formal investigation is not complete.

First, the call Yanez made to the department before pulling the car over seems to support the position that he believed the driver could be a robbery suspect. In the recording of the call to the department, Yanez says, “I'm going to stop a car. I'm going
to check IDs. I have reason to pull it over." He continued by saying, "The two occupants just look like people that were involved in a robbery. The driver looks more like one of our suspects, just 'cause of the wide-set nose" (Mannix, 1. 2016). This statement could be argued that the reference to a wide nose is racial profiling. However, it also indicates that Yanez seemed to identify Castile’s face from his investigation of the robbery.

Before the traffic stop, there was a robbery. Reynolds said in the video that they were pulled over for a broken taillight. This is odd because the car was pulled over during the daytime. Also, when shown in a video, both taillights on the car appeared to be working (Boyle, 2016). This might not be consistent with the evidence after the formal investigation. This does not mean that that is not what the officers told her when they approached the car. There may be another reason the car was pulled over. Four days before the shooting, on July 2, and four blocks away, a Super USA Convenience Store was robbed at gunpoint at 7:30 pm. Local police requested help from the public on Tuesday, July 5, and released store security images of the two armed Black males who robbed the store. The description was: a Black man with shoulder-length dreadlocks and glasses. The robbery suspect had his hair pulled into a bun, and had a small mustache and facial hair on his chin. This description of one of the robbery suspects seems to fit Castile (Mannix 2, 2016). All of this is important as to what Yanez and Kauser were thinking when they stopped the car. The stop of Castile was just four days later on July 6, it was in the general vicinity of the robbed convenience store, and the stop was around the same time as the prior robbery. It could be argued the car Castile was driving was not pulled over for a broken taillight or based on racial profiling. Instead, the officers pulled over a vehicle containing a driver who fit the profile of an armed robbery suspect.

The difference between the radio report for the stop and Reynolds’s version of events can be reconciled. Reynolds is most likely telling the truth about the reason she was given for the stop. Police officers are not required to tell people the actual reason they were stopped, as long as they were stopped for a lawful reason. Yanez and Kauser’s purpose for the stop may simply have been to identify Castile so that he could be investigated as a suspect in the robbery if warranted. The officers likely told Castile that they stopped him for a taillight violation. If Castile then believed the stop was for a taillight, he would assume that it was a routine traffic stop and hopefully not react violently. This would explain why the officers did not do a normal high risk stop. The officers both had guns drawn and they both went to opposite sides of the stopped car. It would be unlikely this would happen if the only reason for the stop was a burned-out taillight. One officer in that case would be all that was needed to inform the driver of the burned-out light. They would also not need to draw guns. The officers were concerned, but they did not know for sure if the car contained robbery suspects. After pulling the car over, Yanez approached the driver’s side of the car and Kauser approached the passenger side where Reynolds was sitting. These positions would allow them both to monitor the inside of the car and not reveal the true reason for the stop.

Second, Castile’s face was known to Yanez. Castile was pulled over or ticketed at least 52 times in Minnesota since 2002. This resulted in 86 violations that were either misdemeanor or petty misdemeanor counts. More than half of these 86 violations were dismissed. Some resulted in small fines. He was stopped at least twice since he received his permit to carry a gun. The misdemeanor tickets cost him more than $7,000
in fines (Stahl, 2016). This does not mean that Castile was in the wrong. Even when Castile was promoted to a cafeteria supervisor, he would only have a salary of around $40,000 a year. Before the promotion, his salary would only be in the $30,000 range (Stahl, 2016). With a salary in these ranges, no person can afford to pay an endless string of traffic fines. Castile was simply in a cycle in which his license would be revoked when he failed to pay his fines, and reinstated after payment. This litany of minor offenses also made Castile a familiar face to Twin Cities police. Yanez was listed as one of the officers who booked Castile into jail on November 23, 2011, after he was pulled over for a broken brake light and was discovered to be driving on a revoked license. Castile also had an outstanding misdemeanor warrant in Hennepin County for driving after the revocation. Yanez was not listed as the arresting officer, but he was the one who drove Castile several miles to the county jail (Ortiz, 2016). This happened four years earlier and was just a few weeks after Yanez joined the police force. As Yanez was familiar with Castile’s appearance from prior encounters, it is easy to understand how he could connect him to a robbery suspect if the appearance was similar. Stopping a person only for a wide nose sounds very racist. However, this may just be one fast way Yanez memorized a face he saw in the grainy security video from the convenience store (McBride, 2016). There certainly were other things he memorized from the face on the robbery video, such as hairstyle and facial hair, that he compared to the face he saw in the car. Castile and the image from the robbery video could be similar enough to be the basis for a stop. It could be he simply gave one reason, very fast, to fellow officers when he made the wide nose comment.

Third, because the officers knew that they were dealing with a potentially armed felony suspect, they were likely to be on high-alert for any motion that may indicate that somebody was reaching for a gun. Reynolds’s video is taken in selfie-mode. This results in a video in mirrored image. In the video, it appears that Castile is in the passenger’s seat and Reynolds is driving. In fact, Castile is driving and the officer is at the driver’s window. The officer can see Castile’s entire left side, which is where the gun and wallet appeared to be located. Reynolds’s video only shows the right side of Castile. When the video taken by Reynolds is enhanced, one can see Castile’s left hand was by a wallet with part of the gun poking out of his cargo sweatpants pocket onto his lap (Sundance, 2016). When emergency workers pulled Castile’s body out of the car, the gun fell out of his pocket onto the ground. When Castile had said he was armed, any unanticipated movement toward a gun could make an officer very nervous. In the video, Yanez is heard saying “I told him not to reach for it. I told him to get his hand off it” (Video 1, 2016). Castile may not have understood or complied with the officer’s instructions. Reynolds said Castile was told to get his wallet. The officer in the video seems to be saying to not reach for the gun. The problem is the gun and the wallet were together. Castile may have forgotten about his gun and instead focused on the wallet and his permit. Yanez may not have had enough time to protect his own life if he had waited to see if Castile was pulling out the gun and not the wallet. If these are the facts, it is understandable the officer could believe his life was in danger if Castile continued to bring his hand toward the gun.

Fourth, there are some miscellaneous facts gathered from the robbery video that appeared in the stop of Castile’s car. The brand of cigarettes stolen from the USA convenience store, along with money, were three cartons of Newport (Johnson 2,
While the brand itself is a popular menthol cigarette smoked by many people, the presence of this particular cigarette brand in the car could also have reinforced the officer’s impression that he may have stopped the robbery suspect. Reynolds is on video smoking the very brand of cigarettes that were stolen in the robbery in question. More interestingly, though still not conclusive, is that the robbery suspect’s shoes appear similar to those worn by Castile in a Facebook posting that Yanez may or may not have viewed before pulling him over (McBride, 2016). Also, the handgun appeared to be the same style of handgun used at the convenience store robbery. Yanez also may have noticed some of these things in the car since he studied the robbery security video and saw these items in that video. Although none of this proves that Castile was the armed robbery suspect, these facts could have been in Yanez’s mind when he looked inside the car. Finally, reporters went through Castile’s Facebook page. There are photos that appear to show that Castile may have had Cript gang connections. While the photos are inconsistent with a Mr. Rogers comparison, they do not prove actual involvement with gangs. They do raise suspicions that the BCA would investigate in the official investigation (Johnson 1, 2016). These items are some things that were not covered in the media’s immediate coverage of the story. And, if this approach is correct, the officer could be exonerated.

**Other Potentially Important Elements in the Case**

The Hennepin County Sheriff’s Department confirmed that Castile got a gun permit June 4, 2015. To carry a gun in Minnesota, one must also carry one’s permit and photo identification. The person must display these items upon lawful demand by a peace officer (Flores & Shoicher, 2016). Having a gun permit to carry does not mean an officer’s orders can be ignored when stopped. Having a gun permit will also not make an officer calmer in a situation in which an unsecured firearm is present. To get the permit, Castile took a gun safety class with his sister, Allysza, through Total Defense in Ramsey, Minnesota. Dan Wellman, the owner of Total Defense, said they took the class in May 2015. He did not teach the class that day, but he said each class is told how to handle a traffic stop or any other encounter with law enforcement. Students are taught to comply with every demand, hand over their permits to carry with their photo identification, and answer any follow-up questions. Wellman said, “We make several jokes about it during class. ‘I have a gun’ is not the way to say you have a gun on you” (Forliti & Potter, 2016). This fact is presented not to condemn the victim, but merely to show how Yanez could have interpreted this situation differently from Reynolds, who kept pointing out that Castile had a permit to carry the gun as though that implies the permit holder cannot be shot even if the permit owner is interpreted to pose a serious threat to the officer. Not following orders exactly can lead an officer to assume a person with a gun is a serious threat.

Second, these officers’ records do not suggest that they had acted excessively in their amount of traffic stops, nor did they appear to engage in racial profiling. According to Jennifer Bjorhus, a staff writer for the *Star Tribune*, a primary statewide newspaper in Minnesota, Yanez and Kauser were not the department’s top ticket-giving officers (Bjorhus 1, 2016). From the start of 2014 through late July 2016, in the coverage area of St. Anthony, Lauderdale, and Falcon Heights, 7,385 traffic citations and warnings were given. Yanez issued 437 of these tickets and ranked fifth in the department for the number of tickets. Kauser ranked seventh having given out 355 tickets. As of this
writing, there are 23 sworn officers in the department. Because it is not required to indicate race on all levels of traffic tickets, about 20 percent of the tickets do not have race indicated (Bjorhus 2, 2016). However, Yanez’s track record is similar to his colleagues in the proportion of tickets, where race is indicated, going to Black and minority drivers. About 18 percent of the drivers Yanez ticketed were Black. About 23 percent of the drivers Kauser ticketed were Black. The department average is 23 percent. Blacks make up about 6 percent of the combined populations of St. Anthony, Lauderdale, and Falcon Heights (Bjorhus 2, 2016). But, there is a lack of data on who is on the roads. There are many people on the roads in these areas who are commuters and drive through the area to get to another location. Despite incomplete figures, there are no statistics that establish racial profiling for traffic stops. In an email response to Ms. Bjorhus, Chief Mangseth “denied that his officers engage in racial profiling.”

Finally, there appears to be a squad car video of the incident, but that has not been released. It will not be released, if it exists, until the investigation is completed. The officers were not wearing body cameras because the St. Anthony Police Department does not use them. The investigation is still ongoing, and it is expected to continue at least into November 2016, after this paper is submitted.

**The Law May Protect Yanez Criminally and Civilly**

There are some court cases and statutes that indicate how officer-involved shootings should be analyzed. First, in Minnesota, the use of deadly force by a police officer in the line of duty is justified only when necessary: (1) to protect the police officer or another from apparent death or great bodily harm; (2) to effect the arrest or capture, or prevent the escape, of a person whom the police officer knows or has reasonable grounds to believe has committed or attempted to commit a felony involving the use or threatened use of deadly force; or (3) to effect the arrest or capture, or prevent the escape, of a person whom the officer knows or has reasonable grounds to believe has committed or attempted to commit a felony if the officer reasonably believes that the person will cause death or great bodily harm if the person’s apprehension is delayed (MN Statutes, 2015). This statute follows the Model Penal Code approach of allowing deadly force if there is a reasonable belief that the suspect committed a felony that involved the use or threatened use of deadly force, or if there is a substantial risk that the subject would cause death or serious bodily injury if the arrest were delayed. In 1985, in *Tennessee v. Garner*, the U.S. Supreme Court held that law enforcement officers pursuing an unarmed suspect could use deadly force to prevent escape only if the officer had probable cause to believe that the suspect posed a significant threat of death or serious physical injury to the officer or others (Tennessee, 1985). The use of deadly force in violation of this rule can give rise to a civil cause of action for damages. This does not mean that the use of deadly force is automatically a crime. States may absolve the police officer of criminal liability for the use of deadly force if the officer had reason to believe that the suspect committed a felony. In 1989, in *Graham v. Connor*, the Court decided that the objective standard for reasonableness would apply to judge a person’s claim that law enforcement officers used excessive force in making a seizure of a person. As long as the officer reasonably believes the deadly force is necessary for the arrest and the suspect is guilty of a felony, the officer has a defense, even if the officer’s belief turns out to be wrong. Reasonable appearances, not the ultimate truth, controls. To judge reasonableness, the court would look to how other officers, not civilians, in the
defending officer’s position, would have assessed the situation and need for deadly force. Reasonableness is not assessed with the clearer vision hindsight provides. The reason for this rule, according to the court, is because law enforcement officers are often required to act quickly in tense, uncertain, and rapidly evolving situations without the benefit of detailed investigation into the situation (Graham, 1989). Whether the gun was near Castile’s wallet and whether his hand kept moving in that direction will be important in deciding whether the officer had a reasonable belief his life was in danger.

Second, an officer who is met with resistance may also have a right to use deadly force in self-defense if four rules are followed; (1) there must be a reasonable fear of death or great bodily harm for oneself or another; (2) the one claiming the defense must have entered the conflict reluctantly; (3) there must be no reasonable means of retreat; and (4) no lesser force will suffice to stop the threat (MN Statute 2, 2015). While the defense rules are the same for civilians and police officers, the courts have interpreted the provisions for law enforcement in a way that sets a high bar for obtaining a criminal conviction. In order to bring charges against a police officer, the state must be able to prove, beyond a reasonable doubt, that the officer’s use of deadly force was not justified (MN Statute 2, 2015).

Finally, police officers may also have some protection from civil suits. The U.S. Supreme Court, in Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents, 1971, concluded that police officers have qualified immunity, a protective doctrine, that would shield government officials from civil liability unless their actions would be found to violate an individual’s federal constitutional rights (Bivens, 1971). It allows public officials to be accountable when they exercise power in an illegal manner, but it protects public officials from frivolous lawsuits. People have a private right of action for monetary damages when their constitutional rights have been violated and no other remedy exists. The U.S. Supreme Court, in Saucier v. Katz (Saucier, 2001), used a two-step process to decide if qualified immunity applies in Bivens’ cases. This new two-step approach helped lower courts apply Bivens rules to particular cases facing the courts. The first step is to decide if the officer’s conduct violated the Constitution. If the officer’s conduct did not violate the Constitution, then the officer would not be liable and the case would be over. If the officer’s conduct did violate the Constitution, then the question would be whether the right was so clearly established that a reasonable officer would know that his or her conduct violated the right. If a reasonable officer would not know his or her conduct violated a right, then the officer would escape liability. Only if the answer is that a reasonable officer would know his or her conduct would violate a right, could the lawsuit continue. In addition, qualified immunity is not just immunity from having to pay damages. It is immunity from even having to go through a trial at all (Schott, 2012). Qualified immunity balances two important interests – the need to hold government officials accountable and the need to shield officials from liability when they do their duties reasonably. It only applies to civil suits in which the government official is personally being sued. It does not apply to cases in which the government is being sued for an official’s actions (Schott, 2012). In the case of Yanez, the use of deadly force would not violate constitutional rights if the officer was justified in using that degree of force. The presence of a gun, whether or not the gun was by the wallet, and whether or not Castile continued to move his hand toward the gun, would also be important here.
Aftermath and Proposed Changes

First, there have been calls for special prosecutors to investigate these cases at the state and federal levels. At a private meeting the week of July 10, Governor Dayton had a private meeting with national NAACP President Cornell Brooks. Dayton was concerned about how officers in Minnesota interact with minorities. Brooks asked Minnesota legislators to pass laws that would encourage independent investigations and stricter prosecution of misbehaving police officers (Heilman, 2016). In an email that same week to fellow Republicans, Rep. Tony Cornish, R-Vernon Center and former law enforcement officer and Army National Guard Captain, condemned Dayton’s comments to reporters that Castile would probably still be alive had he been White. Some police officers responded very negatively to the charge of racial profiling by the governor, especially because an investigation had not even begun yet (Stassen-Berger, 2016). Dayton also called for a federal investigation. The federal government could investigate if there was racial profiling as that would violate a person’s federal constitutional rights. A group of 12 St. Paul DFL legislators lead by Rep. John Lesch, DFL-St. Paul, said that data shows conclusively that minorities in Minnesota are stopped, arrested, and convicted more frequently than White citizens. Lesch said, “At some point we have to get past all the blaming and dig into the systemic problems of poverty and unemployment.” Lesch continued “With the backing of Cornish and other law-and-order legislators, leaders of the Minnesota Chiefs of Police are already digging in against possible changes to how state police do their jobs” (Heilman, 2016).

Also being considered at the federal level is the use of a special prosecutor to investigate if charges should be brought in all cases in which police officers use deadly force. After numerous police-initiated shootings, there has been a surge of support in Congress for a bill, the Police Training and Independent Review Act, to restore trust and reform policing (Police, 2015). Support for the bill grew from 62 co-sponsors before the shooting of Alton Sterling to 93 co-sponsors after the shooting of Castile (Cohen, 2016). Asking a local prosecutor to investigate the same local police, with whom he or she works closely, is considered by many to be a conflict of interest. At a minimum, there is an appearance of impropriety that will lessen community trust in the results of the investigation. The Act calls for the use of independent prosecutors.

Second, there have been calls for the federal Government to prosecute these cases. Asking for a federal investigation, as Dayton did, may sound tough, but officers are more likely to be charged with something by a state (Tevlin, 2016). A state has a full range of homicide crimes available. A state could charge anything from first degree murder to simple assault. On the other hand, federal prosecutors only investigate violations of federal law, such as whether Yanez violated Castile’s federal constitutional rights. They could not focus on whether there was poor police work, bad judgement, or whether officers acted negligently. These matters are left for the state. Federal investigators would have to prove, beyond a reasonable doubt, that the officer acted with the specific intent to violate Castile’s constitutional rights by intending to harm or kill Castile because of his race. This is almost impossible to prove. Federal law would not allow the officer to be charged with some lesser offense like manslaughter or negligent homicide. These are state crimes and can only be brought by the state. Federal prosecutors can only charge for violating federal crimes (Tevlin, 2016). It would be highly unlikely to have any federal crimes in this case. Castile had a gun, and it
appears, according to Yanez’s attorney, that the reason for the stop was because Castile fit the description of a robbery suspect. It would be very hard for a federal prosecutor to argue that Castile’s constitutional rights were violated because of his race. In this case, Dayton’s calling for a federal investigation was a way to disperse the anger people may experience if charges would not be brought against Yanez. If the federal investigation would come to the same conclusion that the officer should not be charged, having two investigations (state and federal) could bring more legitimacy to the dual decisions to not charge. Why place the sole focus on a state investigation that could very likely result in no charges being brought and also focus the media on potential problems in the state? It may be considered better if the federal government would also investigate because they could bear some of the criticism if the federal investigation, as well as the state, fails to recommend charges.

The attorney for Castile’s family also called for a federal investigation. This may be because the officer could have a strong case for both stopping and shooting Castile, which would make it less likely any state action against Yanez would be successful. An attorney for Castile’s family asked the U.S. Department of Justice to launch an independent investigation, saying the family believes criminal charges should be filed and that Castile was racially profiled. In the letter dated August 2, attorney Glenda Hatchett told U.S. Attorney General Loretta Lynch that “we do not believe that local law enforcement authorities will provide a fair and impartial review” (Associated Press, 2016). To borrow a football phrase, Hatchett’s request of Lynch looks like a Hail Mary pass when staring at potential failure. But, the investigation is not done. It is early in the game.

Third, there have been concerns that implicit racial bias is in play in the Castile, Clark, and Sterling cases. After the Castile shooting, the City Council in Falcon Heights replaced one of their regularly scheduled meetings with a listening session devoted to Castile’s death. About 150 people came. Falcon Heights is in the second year of a five-year contract for police services from St. Anthony. Black Lives Matter in St. Paul say that the police are biased, and some local residents echo this, demanding that the city cut ties with St. Anthony police because of the shooting and concerns of racial profiling. Some said racial profiling was excessive on the stretch of Larpenteur Avenue where Castile was shot. Several Black residents said they avoid the road because they feel it is a speed trap and people are pulled over for minor infractions. Some of the residents have called for more officers on foot engaging the citizens and greater accountability. Others have wanted the city to be sure whatever police department Falcon Heights contracts with for services tracks racial data on arrests and traffic stops (Sawyer, 2016).

According to the Star Tribune, analysis of recently released FBI Uniform Crime Reports data for serious crimes showed nearly every Twin Cities metro-area police department exhibits a racial disparity in its arrests (Browning 2, 2016). Arrests are not the same as convictions, though. Arrests do not indicate how many people were stopped but then sent on their way with just a warning and what race they were. Therefore, the statistics about convictions do not prove the police are actively engaging in racial profiling when they initially stop a car. Richard S. Frase, co-director of the University of Minnesota’s Robina Institute of Criminal Law and Criminal Justice, said, “There are not studies out there today that readily document overt racial bias. But there is study after study out there demonstrating implicit racial bias when it comes to
decision-making [at every stage of Minnesota’s criminal justice system]” (Browning 2, 2016). Implicit bias occurs when police target high-crime areas. These areas have higher concentrations of minorities and poor residents. When police find guns and drugs, it reinforces their beliefs that greater enforcement is needed in these areas. The Star Tribune did a special series called Presumed Guilty in 2000. This series analyzed five years of arrest data in Minneapolis. The series concluded that the police had different rules of enforcement for Blacks and Whites. Blacks were arrested more for minor crimes like loud car stereos and not carrying proof of insurance, but they were less likely to be convicted of those crimes than Whites (Browning 1, 2016).

In 2002, the Minnesota Legislature funded a study of 200,000 traffic stops. In police practices and procedures, the study found a “strong likelihood” of racial bias. The study also suggested the problem probably extends statewide (Browning 2, 2016). More studies need to be done when there is better data collection by departments. Most Minnesota police agencies do not collect racial data on traffic stops. Better statistics could suggest better ways for police to know and interact with their communities. Better studies could also suggest changes in police procedures and practices. Uneven enforcement may cause minorities to distrust law enforcement. Often, there is a stereotype that Black men are dangerous. But there are larger problems. The policing problem cannot be solved while Black citizens are still struggling disproportionately with joblessness, drugs, poverty, and a lack of quality education. Citizens cannot expect the police to solve a whole range of underlying problems in society. Black citizens feel unfairly targeted. Police feel unfairly maligned by cries of police misconduct, racial profiling, and racism. FBI Director James Comey noted in a speech in 2015 that an unconscious bias exists in police work. Because “a hugely disproportionate percentage of street crime is committed by young men of color, veteran officers often take ‘a mental shortcut’ that leads them to be more suspicious of Black men. It’s not fair. It’s dangerous. But it’s reality” (Opinion, 2016).

Fourth, the training on the use of force became a topic for discussion in the media. Yanez attended a seminar in 2014 called “Bulletproof Warrior.” According to promotional material, this was a two-day course offered by a for-profit Illinois company, Calibre Press, that taught their students how to “utilize their ‘Warrior Spirit’ in a practical way so they can win hostile confrontations on the street” (Bjorhus 3, 2016). The “Bulletproof Warrior” training Officer Yanez received, some critics say, is very militaristic and fosters a paranoid mind-set. The training urges law enforcement officers to make a decision to shoot if they ever feel their lives are threatened. Officers are cautioned that “hesitation can kill you.” Calibre Press’s CEO, Lisa Gitchell, said that the media distorts their message. They do not teach officers to kill. “Our mission is to save everyone’s lives. We train officers to treat people with dignity and respect.” Supporters have said the company was a pioneer, decades ago, in teaching basic police safety. The training teaches officers how to read the body language of someone who is preparing to attack. It serves as a “wake-up-call” in police safety tactics for the street (Bjorhus 3, 2016). The name of the seminar has now been changed to “Interaction and Influence” to avoid the term “warrior.” Jim Glennon, a co-owner of Calibre, has defended the content of the course. He says that if officers trained more with their weapons in stressful situations, they would be more confident and less likely to fire (Bjorhus 3, 2016). It should be noted, though, that Yanez also received two hours of de-escalation training in the spring
of 2016 (Bjorhus 3, 2016). The department appears to offer both classes to keep officers safe and classes to de-escalate the use of force.

Fifth, there have been calls for the Minnesota Legislature to introduce legislation, when it convenes in January, to deal with the perceived problem of police officer shootings. Beyond the ideas already listed, a few other thoughts were discussed. Some of these ideas concern the creation and use of oversight counsels. An idea expressed in the media seems to be that these counsels should be used to require cities and counties to set strict training guidelines to lead to less tense police encounters with the public. Citizen oversight counsels can be in on discussions about police tactics, operations, personnel, and lead investigations into officers’ misconduct. However, in 2012, the Minnesota state legislators passed a law barring citizen oversight counsels from imposing discipline on police or making determinations about complaints against officers. These groups can only offer recommendations about whether a complaint should be sustained and an officer disciplined. Sen. Scott Dibble, DFL-Minneapolis, is trying to undo those limitations (Van Berkel, 2016).

Some media have reported that guns may be the problem. According to the ACLU, Castile was the 123rd Black person to be killed by law enforcement this year. Police officers, including the five officers in Dallas, Texas, are also being shot (Nadler, 2016). People opposed to guns often question whether gun ownership by citizens should be restricted. Considering that the U.S. Supreme Court has already weighed in on the issue, and it appears citizens have a right to own guns, there would have to be a constitutional amendment to bar gun ownership by citizens. Simple legislation by Congress or the states may not be effective. Other reformers, as already discussed, take the approach of asking whether there needs to be increased police training and altered use-of-force protocols to lessen these problems.

Some activists approach the problem another way and question what their communities need to thrive. They do not see only ‘reform’ in terms of multimillion-dollar investments in police departments for body cameras and other police tools. They want investments made in the actual communities themselves. To these reformers, it is uncertain whether cameras will be effective in reducing brutality and deaths. Other proposed ideas were to earmark funds, like Minneapolis did, for state-wide bias training for officers to target preventing unconscious bias from influencing an officer’s decisions. It was thought that the state should step in, control, and require that individual departments take certain actions (Pheifer, 2016). Finally, one citizen commentator suggested that officers should be required to carry personal liability insurance (Melo, 2016). Considering the prior discussion on qualified immunity, this suggestion does not seem logical. It suggests to this writer that some people want additional avenues for law suits. Compensating someone or their family when encounters with officers are unreasonable is done by the government. It is not a lottery and should not have the potential for exceptional winnings. Tax payers end up paying these bills, and the loss of revenue does nothing to keep society safe. In fact, the reverse could be true. The ability to provide all government services suddenly suffers when the state loses a large sum of taxpayer revenue to a lawsuit. What the media have not reported on during their reports of the Castile shooting is calls for the police video from the dashcam. It is probably because this video, if it exists, is unlikely to completely support Reynolds’s video and the narrative from some of the media. This writer does not believe that it is wise to
distribute video until an investigation is complete. An investigator could not be certain if what was said in an interview came from the person’s memory, or from an altered memory after seeing the video.

**Conclusion**

Regardless of how the official investigation resolves the case, the community and the police department will have to work on restoring trust. Transparency over how and why decisions were reached will be important. Also, the media will need to cover the findings from the investigation as vigilantly as the initial incident was covered. This writer cautions viewers of officer shootings to remember that videos might not contain the whole story, particularly the sort of details discussed in this paper that may exonerate Yanez. Additionally, neither the public nor reporters are trained in the skills that save police officers’ lives. This does not mean that police officers do not make mistakes—which might not be the result of malice or overt racism. But, this wave of attention to police shootings does suggest a strong need for police to consider community feedback. Such feedback may result in addressing many issues related to racial, cultural, and socioeconomic norms that can help police recognize more avenues for de-escalation.

**References**


Doherty, B. (July 8, 2016). Philando Castile may have been pulled over because police thought he looked like a robbery suspect. [Blog post] Retrieved from: http://reason.com/blog/2016/07/08/philando-castile-may-have-been-pulled-ov


Vock, D. (July 11, 2016). Before Castile shooting, Minnesota’s racial justice movement was already underway. *Governing*. Retrieved from:  

Yan, H., Berlinger, J., & Robinson, F. (July 13, 2016). Baton Rouge officer: Alton Sterling reached for a gun before he was shot. *CNN*. Retrieved from:  

http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2016/07/08/this-hate-group-called-for-killing-white-cops-then-dallas-sniper-micah-xavier-johnson-started-shooting.html
A Review of Collaborative Action Educational Research: Opportunities and Challenges

Paul E. Carlson, Barba A. Patton & Diane E. Prince
University of Houston-Victoria
Over the last three decades, action educational research has sought to fill two different yet overlapping functions: service learning and professional development. Action educational research blossomed after the publication of a series of studies in the 1980’s and 1990’s that called for significant improvement in public education. Among the most notable were

--The 1985 U.S. National Commission for Excellence in Teacher Education urging that:

“…connections between colleges and schools [to be] significantly improved.”


--The Holmes Group (1986) pushing for: School/university partnerships in the form of Professional Development Schools to demonstrate “reciprocity, or mutual exchange and benefit between research and practice.”


These appeals sought to address some longstanding problems. Chief among these were the lack of applicable classroom-level findings by conventional researchers and the seemingly intractable problems posed by persistent educational gaps. Teachers found conventional research to be remote, even irrelevant to the challenges they faced with their students, especially students from low-income and/or ethnically diverse homes.

This review of action research is a spot check of 29 published accounts. The objective was to determine what lessons have been learned, what advances have been made, and what research approaches appear to have been employed from the 1990s to the present. The present authors sought to identify the strengths and limitations of the action educational research as a way of both assessing what has been learned that is useful to public school teachers and whether we can identify research approaches that might be emerging. The latter could help future researchers as they define and refine their approaches. The review is based on 29 published reports that appeared in a fairly wide range of journals.

The target research focused on two overlapping educational research themes: service learning and professional development. These studies were of particular interest since they touched on our own collaborative research with public school professionals. Other education-related action research including ethnographic investigations of students’ families and communities were not included.

Investigators:

Our study found that the lead action researchers held positions across the range of university tenure-track positions: from assistant professor to full professor. Most were employed in universities and most involved multiple university faculty. The studies were conducted in Singapore, the U.S., Great Britain, Australia, and The Netherlands.

Authors included:

- a teacher who was also a university faculty member + her doctoral students (Brown, 2010)
- university researchers (Agosta et al., 2004)
• experienced teachers embedded in a postgraduate program who studied development of effective school-university research partnerships (Cornelissen et al 2011)
• university researcher and a 6th grade science teacher (Abell, 2008)
• Three secondary teachers and two university researchers (Cooper & Cowie, 2010),
• university researcher and 6th grade teachers (Beaumont (1998.)
• university researcher and 20 participating teachers (Smagorinsky et al, 2006.)
• several interrelated researcher networks of them (Forey et al. 2012.)

Variety of Subjects:
Below is a sample of the public school students who were subjects of the sample studies:
--autistic children (Agosta et al, 2004)
--learning Disabled students (Forey et al, 2012; Cooper & Cowey, 2010)
--Twenty one Masters degree students (Cornelissen et al. 2014)
--Second and third grade rural students’ writing skills (Hunzicker, et al. 2014).
-- K-12 urban (Conducting research WITH the special education, low achieving Black and Latino-a 11th and 12th grade students with disabilities students (Brown)
--6th grade science class (Abell, 2008).
--Elementary school. Low performing students in reading. kindergarten, first grade, second grade, Title I and Reading Recovery teachers.
--9 African American and Latino students in 11th and 12th grades (special education) (Brown 2010).
--Grades 6-1 (urban) (Schaefer & Rivera 2013).

Variety of Research agendas:
The variety of research objectives was very large. These included:
-- helping a teacher to reduce inappropriate behavior in an autistic elementary school student (Agosta et al, 2004).
--providing expertise to teachers assessing their secondary school students in chemistry, history, geography (Beaumont, 1998).
--providing experienced teachers in a masters degree program to develop ways of creating school-university research networks (Cornelissen, et. al 2014).
--supporting efforts to improve social studies pedagogy in middle schools (Kornfeld and Marker, 1997).
-- studying the effects of scaffolding by university research team + assistants to support 15 teachers in five high schools, teaching English (in Beijing, China) (Yuan & Lee, 2014).
-- addressing the gaps between practitioners and policy makers, and gaps between researchers and practitioners. (McLaughlin and Black-Hawkins, 2007).
--developing a career institute to provide professional development for teachers and provide guidance to at risk children in secondary school to help them focus on college and career. (Institute designed to help struggling and non-traditional students (i.e., students of color, English language learners, students receiving special services. (Schaefer and Rivera, 2013).

--helping teachers reduce discipline problems of at-risk low income urban K-12 special education students in an alternative school (Brown, 2010).

--helping develop a teachers support a professional community to increase literacy of 1st grade, 2nd grade students of color (Ladson-Billings & Gomez, 2001).

Challenges:

University researchers faced a variety of challenges as they sought tenure, promotion and merit pay along with their colleagues and significant on-site complications. These included:

--failure by university colleagues and administrators to fully validate action research;

--problems reconciling or negotiating the differences between university and public school cultures;

--changes in the subject populations across time;

--changes in public school personnel during the investigations;

--changes in investigators;

--variations in access to resources; and

--threats to validity

The authors of these studies provided evidence of success in most cases. These should be noted. However, considered as a whole, these reports provide little information on research methodology that can be generalized. Readers can see the challenges to the researchers quite clearly. They include labor-intensive efforts to initiate and sustain the research, and the already specified challenges posed by working in separate institutions with different schedules, personnel and, at times, different priorities.

Most of the action research we examined used qualitative approaches. It might seem inappropriate to apply orthodox analysis to these but since we sought information that could be applied elsewhere, we have noted some obvious limitations in the categories of selection, history, maturation, and methodological variation. Also limitations included the incentives for the studies as well as the inherent conservatism of attempts to improve curriculum rather than bring new insights.

Lessons we can draw

1. Each study provides interesting pictures of relationships between university faculty and schools that are filled with insights that should inform educational programs.

2. Each study demonstrates the importance of focusing on local school challenges and the constraints and opportunities for improvement.

However, if the lessons are to be applied several things must happen.

1. The relationship between university researches and schools is messy, a “Prickly Embrace” (Shaefer and Rivera, 2013) and should be defined as early in the research effort as possible.

2. University faculty usually must redefine role in public school.
3. The research is time intensive, complex. Planning sessions are a must with school officials, working through school administrators, visiting with teachers, selecting volunteers, obtaining approvals, co-designing research agendas.

4. Inter-institutional relations can be difficult e.g., calendars vary, interruptions occur, there may be strains between institutions. At-risk children may be absent, move.

5. Interinstitutional challenges. (e.g., differences in calendars, deadlines, incentives).

The observations of the editors of the Ladson-Billings & Gomez (2001) study seem to be confirmed. They observed, “The Evidence persuaded...that improving teachers’ knowledge and supporting changes in pedagogical practice will be a slow and painstaking process that must be grounded in a specific school/community context.” (p.675) One reason why the process is slow and painstaking is that each university-school connection is unique and the lessons that others can take with them from any study—even any group of studies cannot be applied to different university-school action research efforts.

In addition to the challenges of generalizability of methods and findings, some experienced action researchers raise questions as to whether their own collaboratives have been worth the effort. Cornelissen et al (2015), noted that their investigation (using and sharing research-based knowledge in a school-university network of a master’s program for in-service teachers) shows few of their subjects continued to work with their partners since “the school context and the strategies of research supervisors provided students with too little support for sustaining the knowledge process.”(p.366).

References
Leveraging the relationship: Knowledge processes in school-university research networks of master’s programmes. Research Papers in Education, 30(3).
about research. Teacher Educator. 42(2), 87-105.
“MENO AFIME--I WAS THERE”:
MULTI-DISCIPLINARY METHODS FOR INTERCULTURAL
UNDERGRADUATE RESEARCH

Elder, D.R.
N.C. Crook
J. Crook
C. McClain
G. Smith
E. Hardesty
Ohio State ATI, Wooster OH
KEY WORDS  Undergraduate research, anthropological methods, rural development, cultural continuity, cultural expression, Ghana storytelling

ABSTRACT
Interest in undergraduate research as a strategy for reinventing American higher education has grown since 1998. This paper discusses using multi-disciplinary research methods to introduce undergraduate students to international, intercultural research. The 2016 research project examines the role of storytelling among Ghana’s Ewe People. A team of student and faculty researchers from Ohio State ATI interviewed 47 storytellers in Ho, Volta Region and nine nearby towns to learn about storytelling in contemporary Ewe culture. As participant observers, the researchers collected stories, discussed their changing role, wrote articles for publication, and considered what they learned about Ewe culture.

INTRODUCTION
Ohio State ATI is an associate degree-granting Institute of The Ohio State University's College of Food, Agriculture and Environmental Sciences that educates students in the areas of horticulture, agriculture, renewable energy, agribusiness, agricultural communication, extension, and agriscience education. Ohio State ATI’s Ghana Education Abroad is a one-month, intensive immersion experience in the arts and community engagement in the Volta Region. The annual program evolves to suit changing needs and expertise. In the past nine years, research and engagement projects have included girls’ education, solar dehydration, and micro-lending. The 2016 team chose a research project on the changing role of Ewe storytelling.

The Ewe (pron. Āwā) people trace their origins to Ethiopia. More recently, they talk of their migration from Notsie in present-day Togo. Living in a stretch of land from Benin to southeast Ghana, the Ewe comprise 13% of Ghana’s population. While the Asante are organized in a matrilineal society, Ewes are patrilineal with a political organization of a ceremonial Togbe and a council of elders. Traditionally, most Ewes are farmers with a few goats and chickens. For years, the Ewe have valued educational attainment and fewer youth are pursuing agricultural careers.

While this paper is informed by the team’s storytelling research, it mainly elucidates the learning process of students engaging in their first anthropological fieldwork experience. In preparation, studying theory primed the team for a rich experience in Eweland alert to understanding cross-cultural communication and ascertaining common human qualities. The team examined storytelling’s role in traditional societies, multi-disciplinary methods of assessing cultural change, and undergraduate research for building learning outcomes.

The Role of Storytelling in Traditional Societies
Among the Ewe People of Ghana, storytelling is a cultural expression bringing performance and education together in a communal setting. Formerly, storytelling sessions were a nightly occurrence around a fire in family compounds. Now, with the proliferation of media, storytelling sessions seem archaic, a community practice tied to the past, and are a far less common occurrence.

Story narratives focus on group dynamics not personal narratives. The sets of stories, songs, riddles and dances are not static but flexible and dynamic, changing to suit the needs of the community. Storytelling events are not pre-programmed. The session unfolds spontaneously led by the interests and desires of the participants. A
storyteller starts the session with a formulaic opening. At any moment, an audience member can break in exclaiming, “Men-Shirt!” [I was there!]. The interrupter leads the audience in song and dance supporting the narrative. Into the night storytellers tell their stories with group participation.

The Ewe ethos of community involvement and inclusion requires that novice storytellers learn from their elders and participate according to their interest and skill level. The team heard from 8- to 90-year-old storytellers. Storytelling serves as moral education for the young. The cautionary tales communicate known pitfalls, moral choices and the community’s norms and values. These oral histories preserve group memory and refresh and maintain group identity. For example, origin narratives are recounted to remind the listeners about the places, struggles and successes of their group.

According to West-African researchers, sub-Saharan African children have “learned about relevant skills related to leadership development, personal development, character training, and other life lessons by the fireside in the evening” (Anyidoho, 1989, p. 72). Stories teach children to “use their initiative to think critically and develop the capacity to be logical in their reasoning” and stimulate their imaginations (Ishengoma, 2005, p. 142). Stories are an “effective way of involving community members in an open debate” about community matters (DeGroot & Zwaal, 2007, p. 58). For the academician, “storytelling is considered in a wide variety of academic disciplines” from computer sciences to theology as a vehicle for cultural analysis (E. Miller, 1998, p. 1).

For Ohio State ATI agriculture-oriented students, findings like Crowder’s (1998) that stories play “an important role in preparing farmers, researchers, educators, extension staff, members of agri-business and others to make productive contributions” (p. 39, 71) give a special meaning to their research.

**Learning and Applying Theoretical Approaches**

To begin, students completed the Internal Review Board instructional course on the ethics and methods required to protect their interview subjects. A pre-travel class prepared them further for studying storytelling.

In Ghana, faculty members introduced students to the role of participant versus non-participant observation and theoretical perspectives from three disciplines: cultural studies, Rutkoff’s theory of art and culture; psychological, Maslow’s hierarchy of needs; and anthropological, Glaser’s and Strauss’s grounded theory plus Feintuch’s *Eight Words*. When approaching an unfamiliar art form, finding multiple approaches develops additional depth of interpretation. Students discovered the value of theory as a lens for interpreting the world around them when they involved themselves in the research process and committed to discovering new ideas for themselves.

**Rutkoff’s Theory of Art and Culture**

American studies professor, Peter Rutkoff (2002) proposes that art forms, like storytelling, serve as an instruction book, window, and mirror (n.p.). As an instruction book, storytelling guides moral growth, supports groups “during times of uncertainty, change and upheaval or in response to crises,” and serves as a political and religious force (Forster, et al., 1999, pp. 11-17). Storytelling provides a common narrative by which to review, assess, and confirm a shared viewpoint.

As a window, storytelling allows outsiders to peer into the culture to learn its values and mores. As a cultural marker, the window frame, like a curtained stage,
separates the real and imagined. It allows members to suspend normal conversation to examine deeper meanings in a dramatic or humorous way. As a mirror, storytelling helps observers catch a glimpse of themselves in the event. If the mirror is true, not a fun-house distortion, and the self-assessment fearless, observers review, judge, and choose to amend their own behaviors.

In one Ewe story, the woman borrows a pot to plant a tree. When the tree grows, the neighbor asks for the pot back and won’t accept money instead. The tree must be destroyed to retrieve the pot. Later, the pot owner borrows a necklace for her daughter but can’t remove it. The tree owner demands the necklace back in one piece. The Togbe orders the daughter’s head to be chopped off. The tree owner says, “No.” The pot owner is relieved but humiliated and leaves town. The storyteller interprets the moral as “All should forsake retaliation and live together in friendship.” From distrust, horror, and humiliation to kindness and harmony, listeners observe the result of living with and without compassion. Hearers learn about chieftancy and arbitration, too.

Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs
Abraham Maslow’s (1943) theory of human motivation shows how physiological and psychological needs “arrange themselves in hierarchies of pre-potency.” Physiological needs make up the most basic, and other needs rely on the satisfaction of those. But these motivations are “almost always biologically, culturally and situationally determined as well” (p. 370). None of the students was familiar with Maslow’s hierarchy. The expanded view recognizing other psychological determinants of behavior allowed them to see storytellers’ choices in a more refined way. The team could have employed Maslow’s hierarchy in assessing the culture. But they questioned the value of applying a Western framework and decided that would be ill-advised, even problematic.

Glaser’s and Strauss’ Grounded Theory
Developed by sociologists, Barney Glaser and Anselm Strauss (1967), grounded theory emphasizes the generation of a theory from data collected in the process of conducting research. Rather than beginning with a hypothesis, researchers collect and mark data and group key points into workable concepts. The categories form the basis for an engineered hypothesis through comparative analysis (p. 23). This flexible approach allowed the team the freedom to explain the myriad storytelling roles in Ewe culture while acknowledging and respecting the voices of the cultural producers.

The team developed a working knowledge of grounded theory through discussing Feintuch’s Eight Words for the Study of Expressive Culture (2003). Students led evening discussion sessions applying terminology and concepts to their activities. For example, in Dorothy Noyes’ “Group” chapter, they discussed shibboleths, like a joke or language differences, they had observed. In Titon’s “Text” chapter, students noted “knowing texts,” often used in storytelling to affirm, “I was there. I saw it too. I know firsthand what you are talking about.” Students begin to see themselves as “knowers.”

What is more, the storytelling setting with a sewing machine whirring nearby, a cool breeze and shifting sunlight, cellphones erupting with hiplife music, and children playing underfoot created a special atmosphere. The team experienced small town comradery in these formal, informal, and incidental interactions. A Queen Mother admonishes a storyteller for telling a story “lifelessly” but admits that it is “wonderful” to hear the stories. She bemoans that as “stories are dying, the values are dying” and predicts broken social contract will result.
For the Ghana Education Abroad, interdisciplinary arts and community engagement means integrating anthropology, sociology, political science, history, and global studies to approach and order the research experience.

**Undergraduate Research for Attaining or Building Learning Outcomes**

Over the past 20 years, universities have recognized that incorporating undergraduate research increases the active learning of both content and process across the curriculum. In 1998, the Boyer Commission at Stony Brook determined ten key changes needed to improve the academy. The first two required universities to “make research-based learning the standard and construct an inquiry-based freshman year” (p. 1). Healey (2005) advocates for students as participants with faculty members as co-learners in research-based, inquiry-based learning that concentrates on processes and problems (p. 78).

**Community Engagement**

The underlying ethos of community engagement requires that all travelers contribute and not merely observe. The team members are active consumers of the culture as participant observers. The Center for Community-Engaged Learning shows that participating in community engagement projects leads to awareness of job opportunities, self-worth, understanding of the root causes of social issues, and an ability to be flexible and handle ambiguity (2016, p. 1).

**OBJECTIVES**

The 2016 team chose the storytelling research project on the advice of previous teams. The team developed a list of questions and met with traditional storytellers in family compounds, school or churchyards.

The student-faculty team set these objectives to:

1. Investigate the **places and events where storytelling** now occurs, who tells and listens, and what value tellers and listeners place on storytelling.
2. Enumerate the **frequency** of storytelling events.
3. Verify **changing meanings** of the stories with other community members to determine the factors that have led to changes in place and frequency.
4. Discover how stories themselves have **altered** and which stories, according to the storytellers, are the most important to retain and why.

**PROCEDURES**

The student-faculty team followed these procedures:

1. **Pre-Travel** from January to April, the team:
   A. Read about storytelling and **listened to traditional Ghana-Ewe stories**, learned the Ewe language, traditional protocol, and the storytelling format.
   B. **Outlined key anthropological methods** and cultural theories.
   C. **Created a form** for collecting information on storytelling, subsequently modified, to maintain uniformity in cataloguing interviews.
   D. Enlisted a **Ghanaian community organizer** to recruit the storytellers.
   E. Participated in a **college-wide study abroad survey with pre- and post-tests** to assess their growth and development.

2. **In Ghana** the team:
   B. Visited **9 towns and interacted with 47 storytellers**.
C. Collected, sorted, and categorized information, stories and videos.
D. Wrote blogposts and several final papers in which they discussed their academic attainment and new self-awareness.
E. Summarized their overall learning by answering two research questions:
   i. Articulate two “AHA” moments produced by the overlap of the academic discussions and cultural research experiences. (150 words each)
   ii. Articulate how you plan to share your new knowledge, considering the cultural knowledge you gained, how the storytelling experience propels your thinking into action, and how the research helped you to develop a greater level of cultural fluency. (75 words)

3. Back in the Ohio team members:
   A. Worked independently and together on research questions.
   B. Wrote articles for international and national conferences and journals.
   C. Gave presentations at conferences, schools, churches, and elsewhere.

RESULTS
At the conclusion of the research, the team came to several conclusions about the changing role of storytelling, but those are for another article. This interdisciplinary study improved students’ educational experience, increased their self-awareness, developed confidence in their leadership skills, and engendered a deep appreciation of and commitment to the people with whom they had worked. The team collaborated to answer two Engagement Questions. For the first, “Aha!” moments fell into five categories: cultural understanding, connections to other academic disciplines, connections between the human condition and values to art, appreciation of persistence, and desire to raise children to be contributors. For the second, students’ participation in sharing their knowledge took the form of: teaching for global citizenship and appreciation of others’ values, curiosity leading to intercultural understanding, and involvement in performance allowing them better to comprehend Ghanaian culture. (See Appendix 1: Comments from Travelers)

In summary, all students were capable of conducting research with the team. Often, senior undergraduates and graduate student team members were more likely to contribute to writing papers by completing analysis and writing assignments. However, for the past year, first- and second-year students worked on writing soon after returning from Ghana before the glow of the travel experience wore off and they became re-immersed in their summer lives. This plan was very successful. Student learners cemented the academic experience and further bonded to the group.

This research project combined planning and preparation, readings, common experiences, and multiple opportunities and methods both in groups, individual, in person and online, of debriefing and discussing. This method is the best of education. While highly intensive and limited to only a few students each May, the research that the teams have undertaken each year has benefited all involved as attested by locals and travelers. Ruth Aja, a farmer in Wegbe, volunteers: "We can see that getting together to tell stories is good." This statement reinforces to the team the idea that participant observation CHANGES the OBSERVED not just the observer. An outsider valuing a cultural behavior may alter its value for the group and participating in research changes group dynamics.
Upon their return, team members spread their knowledge and enthusiasm urging others to grow and learn. They testify, "I was there and it was awesome."

**LITERATURE CITED**
*Boyer Commission on Educating Undergraduates in the Research University.1998. Reinventing undergraduate education: a blueprint for America's research universities, Stony Brook: State University of New York at Stony Brook  
*Miller, Eric. 1998. Introduction to Storytelling Studies. World Storytelling Institute. [Internet].  
TABLES AND APPENDIX
Table 1. Curriculum design and the research-teaching nexus (Healey 2005, p.78)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STUDENT-FOCUSED</th>
<th>STUDENTS AS PARTICIPANTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research-tutored</strong></td>
<td>Curriculum emphasizes learning focused on students writing and discussing papers or essays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research-based</strong></td>
<td>Curriculum emphasizes students undertaking inquiry-based learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research-led</strong></td>
<td>Curriculum is structured around teaching subject content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research-oriented</strong></td>
<td>Curriculum emphasizes teaching processes of knowledge construction in the subject</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEACHER-FOCUSED</th>
<th>STUDENTS AS AUDIENCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Appendix 1. Comments from Ghana Travelers 2016

The Ghana travelers wrote about the experience and what they gained.

**Cody McClain** related one story: Anansi the Spider was a farmer who named himself "All of you." By choosing this name, he was able to receive all of the food while his friends had none. His friends expressed disappointment and Anansi hid in a tree to escape their anger. "And that's why spiders hide in trees." In this story, I envisioned a strong moral [code]. People of all ages can change their way of interacting in society. Friendships are important, and people should always work to make and maintain friendships.

**Jessica Crook** wrote about “Performance” from Feintuch’s *Eight Words*: Both young and old tell stories. Adult storytellers reminisced on the memories of hearing a story for the first time. The craft of storytelling requires much skill and practice and is equivalent to the art of a musical performance in a concert hall. Practice makes perfect, and the performance brings a community together.

**Gage Smith** explained: Storytellers tell stories to teach values to children in the *duvis* (small towns). They adapt the stories to fit the younger audience. Animals with human-like characteristics have a prominent role in entertaining and teaching the children. Ghanaians focus on the betterment of their community.

**Emily Hardesty** recognized that she was able to: Develop my skills as an informed listener, and as an active participant in the performing arts. I was able to develop a better understanding of the foundations of Ghanaian beliefs, the nature of their reality, and the norms, which guide their behavior.
What is Aleppo?
Ten things you should know about the war in Syria and Iraq

Patricia M. Kirtley
Independent Scholar

William M. Kirtley
Central Texas College
Introduction

*I write because I don't know what I think until I read what I say.*

Flannery O'Connor

Four hundred thousand people have died and half the population of Syria has left the country since the outbreak of Civil war in 2012. This horrific conflict has morphed into three wars: one between the government and rebels, another against ISIS, and one for Kurdish independence. One way to better understand this devastating and complex war is to closely examine a map of Syria, Iraq, and surrounding countries. Hence our examination of the original construction of these countries after World War I, some basic misconceptions about the departure of US forces from Iraq, and then an examination of the outside parties that exacerbate this struggle. An analysis of these ten areas helps the reader better understand the causes of the human tragedy in these war torn countries and focuses the author on what he really wants to convey about the conflicts in Syria and Iraq.

1. **Build a ramshackle house** on the flood plain of a river and the water will sweep it away. Imperialists in France and England divided up the territory of the Ottoman Empire before World War I ended (Dissolving, 2014). British diplomats drew the boundaries of a protectorate based on information from their operative, Gertrude Bell, to ensure they controlled the oil in the region. They included Sunni, Shiite, and Kurdish provinces in the new state of Iraq (Syria, 2016). Bell believed that only the Sunni were capable of running the country because the Shiites were too “emotional” (Howell, 2006, p. 321). This division destabilizes Iraq today.

   France collected taxes and tariffs in Syria to defray the cost of World War I. They considered the Sunni, two thirds of the population, too nationalistic, so they cobbled together a coalition of minorities, especially Alawites, to staff the administration and army of their protectorate. Even though the treaty of Sevres (1920) recognized a homeland for the Kurds, subsequent treaties considered them citizens of Turkey, Syria, or Iraq (Treaty, 2015). This unequal distribution of power continued after Syria gained independence in 1945 (History of Syria, 2015).

2. **Two false narratives** clouded developments in 2011. Some observers credit the Arab Spring of 2010 for causing the Syrian civil war. They forget that Bashar al-Assad created revolution of rising expectations after he took over the presidency. His government soon found itself facing Free Syrian Army units and increasingly radical jihadist groups (Syrian Crisis Explained, 2015). The war expanded as Syria's neighbors joined in. Eventually, three interrelated conflicts developed: a civil war, the fight against ISIS, and a struggle for Kurdish autonomy (Rise of ISIS, 2015).

   President Obama's did not “pull our troops out” of Iraq in 2011 (Karon, 2011). The Iraqi government chose not to renew the status of forces agreement signed by George W. Bush (Jeffrey, 2014). An offshoot of Al Qaeda, ISIS, developed a more compelling brand than its parent group (Engel, p. 199). They committed atrocities, sponsored terrorist attacks around the world, and established a caliphate (A short history, 2015). Despite the training and equipment provided by the US, the Iraqi army could not stand up to them (What ISIS Wants, 2016). In 2014, after their defeat in
Mosul, Iraqi soldiers ripped off their uniforms and ran through the streets in their underwear fearing capture and execution (Beck, 2014). ISIS soon controlled territory in Syria and Iraq equal in size to the United Kingdom (Understanding ISIS, 2015).

3. Thirty-two million Kurds constitute the largest minority group without a state. They live in Turkey, Syria, Iraq, and Iran (Filkins, 2014). Descendants of the ancient Medes, Kurds identify as Iranians not Arabs (Who are the Kurds? 2014). They speak an Indo-European language similar to Farsi. The Kurds would be proud to carry passports from Kurdistan instead of the ones they carry from the countries in which they live (Who are the Kurds? 2015). They long for the national status they experienced briefly after World War I and II (Saarinen).

Kurds practice a form of Sunni Islam that tolerates Christians and Yazadis. Men and women worship and fight together. Women adapt their dress to the customs of the country in which they live. Watch the YouTube featuring the music of Helly Luv (2015) or Alin Hozan, (2014), two popular patriotic Kurdish singers, and note the diversity of dress. Women in the Kurdish Autonomous Region of Iraq are comfortable in western business attire (Saarinen, 2016). Members of the Women’s Protection Unit (YPJ) in Syria wear fatigues. ISIS fighters hate them. They believe that if a woman kills a jihadist, he will go straight to hell (Cox, 2015).

Kurdish forces are the most reliable soldiers in the war against ISIS. They are integral to implementing the desire of the US strategy not to commit American ground troops (Aran & Stone 2015). Kurds organize their military in Iraq, Syria, and Turkey into three parts: armed forces, home defense units, and police (Kurdish Armed Forces, 2014). The Kurdish army in Iraq, the Peshmerga, (those who face death) captured Saddam Hussein and apprehended the messenger who revealed the location of Osama Bin Laden. The US backed organization, the Syrian Democratic Forces, includes units representing Kurds, Arabs, and other minority groups.

Support of the Kurds in the war against ISIS comes at a price. They want independence, something that means dismembering the existing states of Turkey and Iraq (Clashes, 2016). The Turkish Foreign minister lodged a formal complaint when US Special Forces soldiers displayed Kurdish patches on their uniforms (Sky News, 2016). Turkey finally closed that section of the Turkey-Syria border used by ISIS when it appeared Kurdish forces would extend their influence west of the Euphrates River. Perhaps the only answer to a situation hardened by death and suffering is the plan of Imprisoned Kurdish leader Abdullah Ocalan to create a non-state, a democratic confederation of cultural areas, for the Kurds and other minorities (2011).

4. Jordan is a stabilizing force in the Middle East. It has brokered peace talks and acted as a mediator between the US and Russia. It has a record of cooperation with Israel. The US Congress promised the Hashemite Kingdom $1.275 billion in foreign aid in 2016. The expansion of ISIS threatened the security of Jordan. ISIS attacked Jordanian border stations and set off car bombs in Amman. The Jordanian air force conducted raids against ISIS positions. Jordan serves as a staging ground for US, French, and British forces. The presence of these troops has created some opposition in a country trying to cope with 1.2 million refugees from Syria (Sharp, 2016, p. 1).
The conflict between the strategic objectives of bringing down the Assad regime and defeating ISIS is particularly acute for operations emanating from Jordan. First, the US supported rebels (Free Syrian Army) in Southern Jordan. However, government advances with the aid of Russian air power, eliminated them as a fighting force. Second, soldiers and weapons given to moderate rebel groups found their way to jihadists affiliated with Al Qaeda and ISIS. In the latest scandal, Jordanian intelligence agents stole weapons destined for Syrian rebels and sold them on the black market. Jihadists used some of these weapons to kill two US soldiers at a police training facility (Younes, 2016). Third, US efforts to sponsor a group of moderate jihadists and the New Syrian Army met with failure (See Cruickshank, Duff, and Tightman).

5. Israel – One thing is certain in the Middle East: If Israel is provoked they will retaliate by taking the battle to their enemy. Their two biggest security worries are Hezbollah and air superiority. Iran has trained, equipped, and funded the Hezbollah militia in Lebanon. They are a much-improved fighting force, having developed tactics that combine the fierceness of a terrorist attack with the subtleties of conventional war. They have the potential to seriously challenge Israeli Defense Forces (IDF) the next time they clash.

The Syrians employed a sophisticated Russian made weapon, the S-200 surface-to-air missile on September 15 (Halpern, 2016). They claimed that they downed an Israeli jet and drone. The Israeli Defense forces replied they were not even close (IDF Denies, 2016). The IDF claimed the jet was attacking cannons firing from Syria into the Golan Heights. The Israeli air force has enjoyed total air superiority over Syria. Syrian air controllers pass on information to the Russians, who in turn co-ordinate with the US, who passes information along to their ally Israel. Any attempt to utilize new weapons from Russia or Iran will upset this delicate balance and result in dangerous consequences.

6. Lebanon’s Shiite movement, Hezbollah, acts as a parallel government in parts of the country, providing a range of social services. Iran provides Hezbollah with funds, equipment, and training. Hezbollah’s leaders boast of a new doctrine, a combination of guerrilla and conventional warfare (Keys, 2013). Hezbollah has 100,000 missiles and rockets directed at Israel. In addition, Hezbollah has taken an active role in Syria in defense of the Assad regime. According to Israeli Military intelligence, Hezbollah sent 8,000 Hezbollah members to fight in Syria. Of that number, 1,300 have died (Berman, 2015). Israel worries that Hezbollah with a new doctrine, equipment, and combat experience will present a formidable foe in a future war.

7. Turkey is a parliamentary representative democracy with a strong tradition of secularism and a member of NATO. Some observers believe that President Erdoğan and his Justice and Development Party (AKP) wish to steer the country toward a more Islamic state. However, he resisted calls to amend the constitution and adopt Sharia law. Erdoğan seems more concerned with power than doctrine (Akyol, 2016).

Power and the limits of power are the hallmark of Turkish foreign policy. Relationships warmed in 1999 when Syria handed Kurdish leader Abdullah Ocalan over to Turkish authorities. Things soured when Erdoğan sided with opponents of the Assad
regime at the beginning of the Syrian Civil war. Turkey turned a blind eye as 27,000 foreign jihadist fighters used a small corridor on the border with Syria to join ISIS. Erdoğan protested when Kurdish soldiers, with the help of US Special Forces, captured the town of Manjib in this area (Clashes, 2016. Erdoğan agreed that if Kurdish forces would withdraw, Turkey would close the border. The US coalition against ISIS achieved a major diplomatic victory when Turkish tanks finally rolled into the area on 24 August 2016 (Kozac, 2016).

8. Iran and Russia offered Syria six billion dollars in aid this year. Hezbollah, funded and trained by Iran, has taken a significant ground combat role in Syria. Iran sent their own troops including members of the 65th Airborne Special Forces Brigade, Revolutionary Guards, and the Quds Force, a Special Forces unit under the command of General, Soleimani. The “Shadow Commander,” as Soleimani is known in the West because of his reticent demeanor, is the overall commander of government forces in Aleppo. The total number of Iranians soldiers in Syria is 3000, with losses of 750, including several Brigadier Generals (Iranian General, 2015).

9. Russia has supported their long time ally, Syria, since the revolution in 2011. Vladimir Putin insists that any path to peace must include Assad. He condemns US support of what he calls illegally armed formations. He agrees with Assad that the war is a contest between the government and terrorists. Putin began direct intervention in Syria on 30 September 2015. The Russian air force operating from Latakia and Iran has bombed and strafed targets in Syria. Spetznaz forces call in air strikes. The Russian Navy launched cruise missiles and deployed its lone aircraft carrier. GRU operatives coordinate signal intelligence (Russian Buildup, 2016).

Russian advisers encouraged The Syrian Arab Army to use combined arms tactics. The use of tanks with armored personnel carriers proved successful in the capture of Palmyra from ISIS. The Syrians increasingly used this tactic in the battle for Aleppo. The Russians established machine shops and sent in mechanics to keep this mechanized equipment running. Formerly, if a piece of equipment broke down, the Syrian Arab Army abandoned it by the road. The Russians cleverly introduced mobile bakeries to bring fresh bread to the people of newly liberated towns and villages.

On September 9, 2016 the United States and Russia announced a new ceasefire agreement. It called for an end to fighting between the government and the moderate opposition, so that Russia and the United States can concentrate on defeating ISIS and Al Qaeda terrorists. The ceasefire broke down after a week. Humanitarian supplies reached some areas, but not the encircled residents of Aleppo. (Foreign policy diary, 2016).

10. United States – War correspondent Richard Engel characterized President Obama’s foreign policy in the Middle East as “inconsistent and confused” (2016, p. 209). This seems unduly harsh in regard to Syria. The US backed the rebels when the Syrian Civil War broke out in March 2011. Obama threatened to go to war in August 2013 to halt Assad’s use of chemical weapons. Conditions changed in 2014. ISIS radicalized the opposition to Assad, defeated government forces in Iraq, and declared a
Caliphate (The Rise of ISIS, 2015). These events forced the US to prioritize the war against ISIS over the removal of Assad.

US strategy focused on three cities, Raqqa, Mosul, and Aleppo. Kurdish forces supported by US Special Forces are about 16 miles away from Raqqa. A British sniper prevented an execution in a town outside Raqqa with a shot over a mile long. In Iraq, Kurdish forces in the North and the Iraqi army in the South have trapped ISIS forces. Decisive battles for these two cities are months away (Peshmerga, 2016).

Gary Johnson, the US Libertarian candidate for President asked, “What is Aleppo?” (Byrnes, 2016). Before the war, Aleppo was the largest city in Syria with over 2 million people. No one knows how many live there now. Government forces have almost surrounded Aleppo’s city center. Castello road is the only supply route open to the rebels and it has increasingly come under interdiction fire by government forces. Russian air strikes, artillery, and the use of “hell” bombs (propane tanks shot from mortars) reduced the city to rubble (Madi, 2016). Government forces did not allow humanitarian supplies into Aleppo during the 12 September truce, putting the lives of the 200,000 civilians trapped in Aleppo at risk (Syria: Safe passage, 2016).

The Syrian government and Russia consider all rebels terrorists. The US supplied rebel groups, like Ahrar Al-Sham (the group that rescued Engel from kidnappers) and Jayish Al-Islam who are not on their terrorist list, with TOW anti-tank missiles (What to expect, 2016). These fighters can shift these weapons where needed to blunt Syrian Arab Army combined arms attacks (Front Line Report, 2016). Yet the battle for Aleppo seems nearing its last violent throes. Russia and the Assad government may destroy the city (Miroue & Keaten, 2016). Time is short and the stakes are high for all parties involved in Aleppo.

Resources


The keys to eternity (Hezbollah Propaganda Video Subtitled in English).(2013, June 3). Kamal Farhi. Retrieved at <YouTube.com>


Kurdish Armed Forces. (2014). Lexoman Parastin/Dizha Tior. Retrieved at <www.youtube.com/channel/UCAZC-9wJ9fJjSTw5UveBqzQ/vide...>


Who are the Kurds? (2015). CC TV. Retrieved at <YouTube.com>


2016 Course-based Trip to St. Louis, MO: Understanding Susan Blow’s Legacy

Yong Joon Park, Ph.D.
Dept. of Teaching and Learning
Bayh College of Education
Indiana State University
ypark4@indstate.edu

Presenter’s Objectives

1. Explain about where the ideas of the course-based trip came from
2. Introduce who Susan Blow was
3. Describe the procedures of the trip to St. Louis, MO in Spring of 2016
4. Conclusions, limitations and Implications
5. Add good ideas for the future research plan from audience
6. Q & A
The Influence of Froebel’s Kindergarten System in Germany

Friedrich Wilhelm August Froebel (Fröbel) (1782 - 1852).

Friedrich Froebel, the German educationalist, is best known as the originator of the ‘kindergarten system’ and coined the word, Kindergarten (i.e., a garden for children). He came into teaching via a school run along Pestalozzian lines (and spent time at Yverdon, Switzerland). When he came back to Germany, he opened his own school. Friedrich Froebel’s enduring significance was through his formulation of the ‘kindergarten system’ with its emphasis on play and its use of ‘gifts’ (play materials) and ‘occupations’ (activities). You can see samples pictures of the teaching materials from the following slides.

Susan Blow traveled to Europe and she went to Germany and learned about Froebel’s legacy including the teaching materials.
How to use Gifts itself and with other objects
How to Use Gifts teaching three concepts such as Form of Life, Form of Beauty, and Form of Knowledge.

Especially, using small blocks from a big box, he taught the concept of “Parts to Wholeness” and Wholeness to Parts.”

Occupations; transformable materials such as papers, clays, etc.
Who is Susan Blow? Why is her legacy important to students and me?

Susan Blow’s original kindergarten classroom setting

Of Susan B. Blow who introduced the Froebelian system of education for children under seven years of age, now known as the kindergarten, it may truly be said that “her works do follow her.” There are now more than 400 cities in the United States with kindergartens in connection with the public schools. These infant schools begin the mental development of some 300,000 little ones, under the care of about 6000 teachers.

Froebel’s idea, worked out in this system, was the development of the mind through voluntary activity, directed through sympathetic training of the child mind. It was one of the modern movements away from the old coercive, driving method of schooling, in which the will of the child was not to be led but conquered.

Miss Blow’s merit lay, not in being the first to try the system in America, but in the fact that she first experimental kindergarten on this side the Atlantic was opened in Columbus, O., by Caroline Louise Frankenburg, in 1853. But Susan Blow, by interested Dr. William T. Harris, then St. Louis Superintendant of Schools, made the city of St. Louis a pioneer in the inauguration of the Froebelian method as a permanent element of the public school course. And afterwards, working for the love of it, Miss Blow spread her views in many other intellectual centers. Her name will live as a leader in the mental development of the young.
Trip to St. Louis, MO

- Description of the Trip
  - On April 16 (Saturday), 27 ISU students and two faculty members (Dr. Karen Liu and Dr. Yong Joon Park) went to St. Louis, MO for the purpose of understanding Susan Blow’s legacy.
  - Susan Blow was the founder of the first public kindergarten system in the U.S. for the first time.
  - Most of students study Elementary, Special, and Early Childhood Education at ISU. We left Terre Haute, IN at 8 am and return to ISU around 11 pm.
  - We visited two different history museums, one botanical garden, and Gateway Arch plus downtown area of St. Louis, MO.

Time Table and Sites for the Visits

- 8 am - Departure: Terre Haute to St. Louis, MO
- 10 am - Brunch at Effingham, IL/or Restroom
- 11:30 am - Des Peres School
- 1 pm - Lunch near the school
- 2 pm - Missouri History Museum
- 4 pm - Missouri Botanical Garten ($6 entrance fee)
- 6 pm - Gateway Arch
- 7 pm - Dinner at Effingham, IL/or Restroom
- 11 pm - Arrival at University Hall, ISU
Summary of this Trip with Pictures

- I summarize this trip with selected pictures. Whenever we arrived at the sites, we took a group picture together.
- 1. Leaving Terre Haute

Initially, 28 students signed up for this trip. Eventually, 27 students came and got on the Turner Bus at 8 pm on April 16 (Saturday), 2016.

Des Peres School

- Now, it became Susan Blow’s legacy museum and town history museum called “Carondelet Historical Society.” The museum website is http://www.carondelethistory.org. Thanks to museum volunteers, we could learn more about Susan Blow and her teaching methods.
Missouri History Museum

Because of the special events of Missouri History Museum, I could not find out Susan Blow’s section. By the way, one of the special events is about “High Schools” in St. Louis, MO. We could understand the historical components of school system development in St. Louis, MO. See the pictures on the next page.
St. Louis Botanical Garden

- St. Louis Botanical Garden was selected as the 3rd rank of the most beautiful botanical gardens in the U.S. in 2016. Froebel, who coined the word, “Kindegarten” (meaning “Garden for children”) at his garden, invented the first kindergarten system in the world. Susan Blow studied Froebel’s teaching methods and materials such as “Gifts and Occupations.” She applied his methods into her kindergarten classroom and kindergarten teacher training in St. Louis, MO. Thus, it is important to visit the garden in this trip.
Gateway Arch and Downtown in St. Louis, MO

We went to the Court House and Gateway Arch. In the Court House, we could watch video clips of how to construct the Gateway Arch. At that time, we enjoyed walking around the downtown area of St. Louis, MO.

Strategies for the course-based trip

Before the trip:
- Seek internal and/or external funds for the course-based trip
- Introduce the historical importance of the trip
- Motivate students to join the trip
- Let both students and other colleagues feel informed about the trip
- Find out the best deal from the tour company

During the trip:
- Educate students about what is coming in and out of the tour bus
- Remind students of time! Time! TIME!
- Provide each task for each location (e.g., take your selfi!)

After the trip:
- Review and reflect on the trip about their experience and learning (e.g., online discussion and final report)
Conclusion and Appreciation

Dr. Liu and I appreciate 27 students' wonderful participation! The students and faculty members truly enjoyed this trip and learned more about Susan Blow’s legacy and the history of St. Louis, MO. The students and two faculty members appreciate the financial support from Center for Community Engagement and Experiential Learning and Dept. of Teaching and Learning at ISU.

Limitation and Current Works

- Advertisement and planning ahead in the beginning of the semester
- Negotiation with the Turner Bus Company
- Working with other faculty members
- Adding a St. Louis Waldorf School as one example of early German education
- 40 students and I will travel to St. Louis, MO on Oct. 13 (Thursday), 2016
- Safety Issues and group leaders
- Assignments for students who go to the trip and who don’t
- On-line pre and post survey of students’ perspectives of course-based trip and their learning
Resources

- A recent book that draws together some useful material from the archives of the National Froebel Foundation is:
  - Biographies: There have been various ‘lives’ and educational assessments. The standard German treatment is:
- See also:
  - The English language treatments that I know are:
- Websites: Visit the very useful (and growing) site maintained by Bruce M. Watson - Froebel Page.
Teaching Feminist Economics to Non-believers
Mary Tripp Reed
Murray State University
In 2009 I began creating a course about women in the global economy based on a feminist critique of global capitalism. The ‘non-believers’ in the title refers to the cultural influence of conservative Christianity in our region and to the fact that initially many of my students are uncomfortable with feminism.

This course needed to span both developing and developed countries and to introduce basic knowledge of both feminism and global capitalism. The course objectives include learning to think critically about the global economy using the lens of feminism, developing a sense of one’s own place in the diverse world, and being able to organize and articulate complex ideas verbally and in written form. A description of the process of teaching the course will answer the following questions: to whom is the course taught, how is the course taught, how has the course changed, and what challenges remain.

I. To Whom is the course taught?

**ECO 320 Women in the Global Economy** is taught every other year in the Baurenfeind College of Business at Murray State University in Murray, KY. While a variety of majors have been represented, business administration, international studies, economics, and gender and diversity studies account for the majority of ECO 320 students. International students are often drawn to the class due to the international content. There are no prerequisites in an effort to draw students from different majors and to increase the pool of potential students. MSU is a regional state university with a student population as described below:

Murray State University undergraduate student population: (fall 2015)
- 9,268 students: 59% female, 41% male
- 52% first-generation college students
- 33% eligible to receive Pell grants
- 68% in-state, 26% out-of-state, 5% international
- 81% white, 7% black, 1.8% Hispanic, 0.9 Asian; 5% intl
- Politically conservative state

Having taught the course three times since 2011, I have had thirty students total. In 2013 all seven students were women: five Americans from the region, one from South Korea and one from China. In 2015 there were four men and five women. Three of the men were from the region and one was from China. Two of the women were from the region and China, Taiwan and Zambia were represented. There were fairly significant class differences among the students. The presence of international students and their willingness to discuss their experiences led to much higher quality discussions. There was a higher level of interpersonal familiarity/intimacy than in my large (40+) lecture classes.

II. How is the course taught?

The course readings include the designated chapters of the following sources and a report by the World Bank, **Voice and Agency: Empowering Women and Girls for Shared Prosperity** (2014).
**Feminism is for Everybody** by bell hooks
- Introduction
- Feminist Politics (Ch.1)
- Visionary Feminism (Ch.19)

- Preface and Introduction by Sharon Harley
- Caring and Inequality by Evelyn Nakano Glenn
- Surviving Globalization: Immigrant Women Workers in Late Capitalist America by Evelyn Hu-Dehurt
- Creatively Coping with Crisis and Globalization: Zimbabwean Businesswomen in Crocheting and Knitting by Mary Johnson Osirim
- “My Cocoa Is Between My Legs”: Sex As Work Among Ghanaian Women by Akosua Adomako Ampofo
- Work As a Duty and As a Joy: Understanding the Role of Work in the Lives of Ghanaian Female Traders of Global Consumer Items by Akosua K. Darkwah

- Introduction
- Economic Rationality and Globalization: A Feminist Perspective by Lourdes Beneria (Ch.5)
- Economics, Policy Analysis and Feminism by Rebecca M. Blank and Cordelia Reimers (Ch.7)

- Gender and Development: Investing in Women and Girls (World Bank) (Ch.1)
- Women As Social Entrepreneurs: A Case Study by Nuket Kardam and Fredric Kropp (Ch.2)
- Women and the Informal Economy: Economic Actors and Global Leaders by Dr. Martha Chen (Ch.3)
- The Intersection of Market-Based Approaches and Gender by Penny Aveywardena (Clinton Global Initiative) (Ch.6)

**Gender, Development and Globalization: Economics As If People Mattered** by Lourdes Beneria
- The Study of Women and Gender in Economics: An Overview (Ch.2)
The topics supporting the readings are in the following order:

**Fundamentals of Feminism, Capitalism and Global institutions** (non-exhaustive)
- Basic concepts in capitalism and global economics: markets, efficiency, globalization, IMF, WTO, World Bank, structural adjustment programs, trade liberalization, privatization
- Feminism: definition, radical perspective (hooks), awareness of gender, class, race; gender as a social construct
- Critique of neoclassical model with the separate self at the center, competition over cooperation, efficiency over equity, lack of emotional connection, empathy or altruism, no place for community

**Women’s Work in the Global Economy** (non-exhaustive)
- Manufacturing in sweatshops
- Sex work (cocoa in Ghana, p. 189 roamer, seaters, threat of abuse)
- Home work & industrial home work
- Caring as labor (emotional and moral dimensions)
- Cleaning, housekeeping
- Data work
- Informal sector: wastepicker unions

**Women’s Agency**
- Freedom from Violence,
- Control over Sexual and Reproductive Health and Rights,
- Control over Land and Housing,
- Amplifying Voices (voice and participation)

The Course grade is determined by the following weights:
Homework 15%
Class discussion 10%
Reading Journal 15%
Midterm exam 20%
Final exam 20%
Country Paper (including presentation to class) 20%

Homework consists of comprehension questions over the readings. These questions are then used to generate class discussion and personal introspection. Students are asked to attempt to reconcile what they understand of capitalism and the role of the U.S. in the world economy with content from this class and other business classes.

Class discussion of a topic starts with clarification of meaning and moves into making connections between articles, topics and the feminist critique of capitalism. Since class discussion requires mutual respect and a level of openness to experiences unlike one’s own, I spend the first two weeks building community in the classroom. One of my favorite introductory questions is “At what point did you become aware of your race/class/gender as part of your identity? What role did race/gender/class play in your
identity and how did it change?” Given as a homework question so students can consider it privately, they discuss it in class to the extent that they are comfortable. Most business students are not used to self-reflection in a business class. I try to maintain a balance of reflection and intellectual content when guiding discussion. Class discussion is graded according to their level of knowledge of the readings and ability to open to new ways of thinking (comparing their levels of openness at the beginning and end of the semester). Done properly, class discussion can have a transformative power and I reward them for being open to such a transformation.

The reading journal is written by the student and only read by me. Brainstorming and more provocative questions are encouraged and students often introduce their ideas in class. The reading journal is also used during exams. They are developing a tool that organizes their thinking processes and understanding of the course material.

Each of the exams consists of eight essay questions. These questions are drawn from homework assignments and essay questions that have been distributed and discussed in class. They bring their text, notes, and reading journal to help them complete the exams in class.

For the country paper students research women’s agency in an assigned country. Two sections are required from the World Bank report Voice and Agency: Empowering Women and Girls for Shared Prosperity (2014) regarding freedom from violence, control over sexual and reproductive health and rights, control over land and housing, and voice and political participation. Students analyze descriptive statistics from the World Development Indicators and Genderstats (www.worldbank.org).

III. How has the course changed?
Over the three semesters I have taught the course, I have created and distributed handouts of feminism and global capitalism terminology. Initially, there was a biographical narrative requirement in the paper assignment. Students had to find a story (fiction or non-fiction) describing a women’s economic life and analyze her agency. Finding comparable narratives took time away from properly completing their paper so I dropped that requirement, regrettably. My ability to guide class discussion in a way that strikes a balance between student reflecting, over-sharing and maintaining privacy has improved.

IV. What challenges remain?
Low enrollment (lack of student interest) and depressing course material are two problems that I continue to face. Engaging class discussion on every topic when students haven’t prepared or are reluctant to voice their opinions can also be difficult. I also face the constant challenge of truly listening to each student and teaching them to listen to each other. Listening, offering constructive criticism and holding them to a high standard for class discussion are crucial parts of a successful class.
In my presentation at the National Social Science Association meeting in St. Louis, MO on October 3rd, attendees offered constructive suggestions and helpful observations. I encourage readers to do the same. I can be contacted via email at mreed1@murraystate.edu.
The Role of Political Culture In The Implementation of International Statute in an Unstable State: The Case of Somalia

Emmanuel Uwalaka
Chad Williams
St. Louis University
Background Information:
For more than 2 decades Somalia represented what some scholars portrayed as “failed”, “predatory”, or “collapsed” state (see Rotberg 2004). After 20 years from the collapse of Siard Barre’s authoritarian rule in 1991, a democratic Federal government of Somalia under President Mohamud was established in September in 2012. This was after nearly more than a dozen peace and reconciliation efforts backed by the UN, EU, and African Union. In spite of winning recognition from the international community, Bryden (2013, 4) states “the SFG remains frail and embattled, dependent upon African Union troops to protect its leaders and defend its sovereignty.”

Even with the establishment of the Federal Republic of Somalia, the territory of Somalia is de facto divided into three distinct administrative areas: the self-declared Republic of Somaliland in the Northwest, the semi-autonomous region called Puntland in the Northeast, Southern and Central Somalia controlled by the newly formed Federal Republic of Somalia with help of AMISON – African Union Forces in Somalia about 17,000 strong.

While the Somalia National Armed Forces with the help of AMISON have since late 2011 been able to drive Al-Shabaab and its supporters from the capital Mogadishu and key cities in the South-Central, many rural towns are in firm control of Al-Shabaab, which is allied with al-Qaida. Al-Shabaab, however, has demonstrated that no part of Somalia and surrounding regions are beyond its violent attacks.

Humanitarian Disaster:
The Somalia Federal Armed Forces without the African Union Mission in Somalia (AMISOM) is no match to the Islamist forces. The army is feeble, corrupt, and faces identity crisis. Fighting among government forces, AMISON, and Islamist groups continues to make Somalia the world’s humanitarian disaster.

According to Amnesty International in its Annual Report 2013, there are human rights violations by all the parties to the armed conflict that target both soldiers and civilians, recruitment of child soldiers, harsh treatment and curtailment of freedom of expression, and growth in the number of internally displaced people (IDPs), refugees and asylum-seekers.

2014 UNHCR Country Operations profile report on Somalia states that as of December 2013 Somalia had about 1,040,000 internally displaced people. There are hundreds of thousands Somali refugees in neighboring countries of Kenya, Ethiopia, Djibouti, Yemen.

UNHCR DECISION 2010
In May 2010, UNHCR confirmed Somalia’s lack of a functioning central government and found that “effective state protection is unavailable in Southern and Central Somalia.” UNHCR further reported that “Puntland and Somaliland will not accept Somalis unable to establish that they originate from those territories.” It therefore continued that individuals unable to establish that they originate from these territories should not be returned there.

The above statements raise the question as to what extent the current administration in Somalia has the capacity to enforce the rule of law, maintain the safety of life and property in the areas it administers and win the legitimacy of its people? We shall
examine this question in the literature, theoretical argument and methodology sections of this paper. Having established background information on this paper, it is organized in the following sections: What are the regulations implementing the Convention Against Torture (hereinafter “CAT”)? Assumption behind the regulations implementing CAT; Questions of interest; Literature review and theoretical argument; Analysis and Discussion: What are the regulations implementing CAT? Article III of UN Convention against Torture (CAT), as implemented in the US, prohibits this country from removing an alien to a nation where it is “more likely than not” that person will suffer torture. “Torture” is defined as “any act by which severe pain or suffering … is intentionally inflicted on a person for such purpose as … punishing him or her for an act he or she or a third person has committed” (Garcia 2008:1-2). The “pain or suffering” must be “inflicted or at the instigation of or with the consent or acquiescence of a public official or other person acting in an official capacity.” The regulations define “acquiescence of a public official” as “requiring that the public official, prior to the activity constituting torture, have awareness of such activity and thereafter breach his or her legal responsibility to intervene to prevent such activity.”

Assumptions behind the Regulations Implementing CAT

The regulations assume an ideal-typical, national-legal state apparatus as described by Weber (1947 [1992]). It recognizes a constituted legal authority and institutions that can maintain law and order, deliver public services and represent all segments of society. These regulations and assumptions will be examined in relation to Somalia. Questions of Interests: Given the developmental challenges facing African countries in general and the political chaos in Somalia in particular, this paper investigates the following questions: In the absence of a strong central government in Somalia, who are “public officials”? What are the socio-political structures in Somalia, and what functions do they perform? What are the implications of such functions in the implementation of the UN CAT? To enable us answer these questions, we examine the literature on arguments for “failing” or “failed states.”

Literature Review and Theoretical Argument

The Failing or “Failed State”

On a systemic level, the urgency and renewed interest in state failure has been sparked by the disrupting effect of failed states on the international system. US failed interventions into Somalia, Haiti, and Afghanistan have brought forth significant amounts of inquiry and response that seek to address the “spillover” effect of failed states and their disruption in the international and regional systems in which they reside. Crises associated with failed states are not simply limited to their area of
origin. The rise of terrorist organizations, civil wars, and failing regimes employing violence en mass against their own citizens in places like Syria, have all captured attention of policymakers and academics seeking to prevent the spread of the failed state “contagion.” International relations and political science scholars concern themselves with identifying why states fail to perform core Weberian functions. The livelihood and indeed stability of the state is questioned when states cannot perform these functions, and are often described as “weak” or “fragile.”

But what is a failed state? Are there different levels of failure, such as outright collapse, and what are the socio-political dynamics in relation to state functions? Helman & Ratner first coined the term “failed state,” describing it as an entity which is “utterly incapable of sustaining itself as a member of the international community.” For Michael Ignatieff, state failure is best seen through a Weberian understanding of the state in which the state essentially ceases to hold the “monopoly of violence.” Civil strife, government breakdown, and economic privation are typical and often imperil the failed nation-state’s own citizens, causing systemic instability. Other authors contend that failed states are often characterized by massive economic inequities, warlordism, and violent competition for resources. Rotberg argues failed states may fail (or are failing) because they can no longer deliver positive political goods, which he cites as security, education, health services, economic opportunity, environmental surveillance, legal framework of order, and a judicial system to resolve disputes and conflict. Menkhaus defines state failure as “...a situation in which the central government has either lost presence in significant portion of real estate (territorial collapse), or has lost the capacity to rule territory in which it has a physical presence.” They all, however, perpetually teeter on the edge of complete collapse, spiraling ever more into enormous civil war or “simply anarchy.”

Some authors believe that there are different levels (2) of state failure. Zartman argues that past the point of state failure to more extreme versions, there is also “state collapse” in which there is “a situation where the structure, authority (legitimate power), law and political order have fallen apart and must be reconstituted in some form, old or new.” As a state collapses, order and power are open to contestation between different power groups and the state as a legitimate institution disappears. In regards to Africa, he identifies two waves of collapse: the initial process of African decolonization, and the second wave which continued roughly ten years later and continued well near the end of the 20th century. A state enters into collapse when it can no longer perform the functions required for them to pass as states. Total collapse itself is marked by the loss of control over both political and economic space, the inability to contain conflict within borders (the “spillover” effect), and the domination of the economy by informal actors beyond the control of the state.
For Rotberg, a number of key indicators are necessary to categorize a state as failed. First, political violence must be persistent (not to be confused with criminal violence). He says, “...failed states are tense, deeply conflicted, dangerous, and bitterly contested by warring factions.”\textsuperscript{21} In many instances this can often lead to government troops fighting insurrections and outright civil war. The intensity of the violence, however, is not the defining feature of the failed state, rather, it is the duration and momentum (increasing or decreasing) that justifies a “failed state” identity. The state ultimately becomes unable to provide adequate security from non-state actors, people often utilize non-state actors or rival actors for protection, and the ability for the state to exercise its own power within its borders becomes severely limited if not impossible.\textsuperscript{22}

As Zartman identifies two hierarchical levels of state failure (collapsed states vs. failed/failing states), so too does Rotberg provide a ranking system to gauge the severity of state failure. The first indicator of severity (and the most important) is the ability of the state to provide for its own internal security, including the defense of its own people, but also the defense of the government’s own property and officials. Second, the state must have institutions that are able to adjudicate disputes (both legal and none), conflicts, property rights, contract enforcement, diffuse tensions between antagonized parties, and enforcement of law. Third, there must also be the ability for political participation. Fourth, there must be ready access to social services, maintenance of infrastructure, and regulation of the economy. No single indicator of state failure can be held responsible. Consider Iraq under Saddam Hussein, or Cuba under Fidel Castro; semi-authoritarian regimes that have limited political participation, but would not be considered failed states. Rather, comprehensive approaches to understanding state failure must be taken together in order to account for the dependent variable, as indicated from the various definitions of state failure mentioned above.

Causes

If defining state failure requires a comprehensive approach, or rather a comprehensive view of indicating variables, it is worthwhile to explore the broader causes of state failure. Bayart suggests a ‘politics of the belly’ in which state leaders or major actors within the state are incentivized to consume the resources of the state.\textsuperscript{23} In this predatory model, leaders ‘eat’ from the state resources and contribute to the criminalization of the state through its resulting corruption. Such predatory behavior is historically significant of African politics, as seen in the case of Somalia. For African Decolonization, in particular, some other authors suggest that the rapid speed of independence after colonialism created “patronage” politics. “The need to construct political alliances at short notice with minimal resources and the absence of party organization outside urban areas meant that nationalist leaders – typically urban, union-based teachers, union leaders and administrators – had to rely on existing political structures.”\textsuperscript{24} Di Jon mentions that the need for finding individuals, often chiefs or other prominent notables (e.g. elders), resulted in patronage in an attempt to quickly
bind these individuals to the party and local voters to candidates. The “Shadow State” proposed by Reno accentuates elitist politics. Elites in the “Shadow State” use the legitimacy of internationally recognized sovereignty to undermine formal government institutions in pursuit of personal gain. Seeking to enrich themselves while controlling others, these elites often use violence as a means to siphon resources from the state. Using warlord politics, they effectively manipulate domestic markets and institutions as a means of entrenching their rule, however, such manipulation often leads to the undermining of the bureaucratic institutions themselves, causing domestic instability. Chabal and Daloz argue that disorder can be employed as a political instrument in effecting maximum returns, a recurrent theme in African politics. Ethnic or religious forms of identity in Africa work to maintain or destroy social bonds that ‘work’ in Africa.

Viewing Somalia as a prime example of a “collapsed state,” Virginia Luling sees state collapse in Somalia as a point in which disintegration has met a “critical mass.” Once enough domestic instability has occurred on a large enough scale, and the functions of the state are compromised, there are limited options to avoid state failure. In Ted Robert Gurr’s “theory of rising expectations,” he offers insight into the balance between people’s capacity to act and the government’s ability to repress or channel their anger. In Gurr’s theory, the propensity to conduct violence is in direct proportion to the frustration one experiences with his or her own condition or situation (The Frustration-Aggression Principle). In this regard, as social, political, and economic demands increase or the frustration with one’s condition rises in dissatisfaction, one’s likelihood of joining the rebellious factions of the state consequently rises as well, and, the depths to which violent measures will be adopted also consequently increases. Gurr presents an effective model for understanding this phenomenon in longitudinal terms through the “J-Curve” (See Figure 5). As time goes by, expectations consequently rise in association. The ability for demands to be met (i.e., legislative reforms, economic relief) runs in tandem with the expectations. Violence, characteristic of failed states, occurs when the gap between expectations and reality is not met. This gap, as described by Gurr, refers to “Relative Deprivation.” This phenomenon, which occurs “as men aspire beyond their social means” yet is quick to anger when those means prove inadequate, reflects the origin of not only initial violence but continual violence. For the purposes of this study, such a theory and principles are effective in explaining why, even amidst multilateral intervention and international cooperation some failed states prove exceedingly difficult to “revive.”

**Somalia**
In the case of Somalia, Ken Menkhaus offers five core explanations as to why Somalia continues to be a failed state. First, Somali leaders are irresponsible and myopic in their quest for power and refusal to compromise. Second, there is a collective fear amongst
Somalis of the return of a “predatory state” with the return of a central government. Third, clanism in Somalia undermines classic Western-style state building. Patrimonial and clanist politics make foreign Western intervention difficult to find success. Fourth, Neighboring states such as Ethiopia perpetuate violence within Somalia. This is, of course, adopting a very realist view of the situation in which relative gains are used in explanation: Somalia’s loss is Ethiopia’s gain. Fifth, external diplomacy is incompetent and misinformed. Menkhaus argues that foreign diplomats attempt to apply Western-centric models to situations where applications of them simply do not work. 32 Menkhaus views the political conditions in Somalia through a “political economy of war theory,” arguing that warlord elites in Somalia actually practice a form of ‘risk aversion’ in avoiding the reestablishment of a central government. Another way of understanding what he means is that warlord elites, already controlling vast amounts of resources, perceive that they would not benefit giving up control of those resources in favor of a central government. If each warlord carves out a piece of territory and enjoys relatively free autonomy, what incentive would there be to reestablish a central state? Considering the long history of patrimonialism in Somali society, it is not surprising that this ‘risk aversion’ continues today.33 “Because of the working ‘de facto’ economy, the inability of Somalia’s leaders to cobble together a state is best seen as a product risk aversion.”34 There is a level stability, however, that has been afforded to Somalis through ‘de facto’ governance. Commercial businesses and enterprises that flourish in ‘de facto’ governance, with the protection of their warlord elites, have actually assumed the role of governance in some parts.35 Warlord elites can provide Somalis certain protection against domestic and foreign assailants, if not doing the antagonizing themselves, and can sustain a lasting power position in their territory. Where the rule of law has exited, Sharia or Xeer law has taken its place to adjudicate disputes. The question, however, is that if there is a quasi-performance of state functions, what are the implications for international agreements between sovereign states such as UN CAT?

Analysis and Discussion

Our analysis is based on the scholarly literature reviewed above and media sources. Somalia as stated earlier, is de facto administered in three separate regions, Somaliland, Puntland, Central and Southern regions. While the current government in Mogadishu was gobbled into existence by combined efforts of the EU, the UN and the U.S in January 2012, it is still an administration that is feeble and struggling to legitimize its existence. We ask the question, what ideas do Somalis have about political legitimacy, who makes decisions for the people and how do those ideas relate to the wider community? Larry Diamond in his work, Political Culture and Democracy in Developing Countries, defines political culture as, “a people’s predominant beliefs,
attitudes, values, ideals, sentiments, and evaluations about the political system of its country, and the role of the self in that system. While embracing Diamond’s definition, Fox (2015, p. 26) and (Pye and Verba. 1965, p. 7) state the evolutionary process of political culture. Unfortunately, in the case of Somalia this evolutionary process has on many occasions been disrupted resulting in the formation of a non-coherent or formidable political culture.

Understanding Somalia political culture is also related to understanding Somalia socio-political dynamics. Schraeder (2004, p. 26) identifies Somalia as an excellent example of a classical segmented system where political authority lies in the hands of different clan groups. In Somalia, the major clan groups are: Daarood, Dir, Hawiye, Isaag, Digil, and Rahanweyn. Under each of these major clan- families are several sub-clans. Within each clan-family, economic, political, and social issues are discussed and determined. The consequence of such a multi-ethnic society as Somalia is recognized by Liebenow (1986, p. 11) when he states, “the diversity of attitudes within a multi-ethnic African state with respect to political authority becomes a problem of considerable magnitude ….to give legitimacy to those who claim to govern in their behalf.”

While Somali people are said to be culturally homogeneous in terms of religion (Islam) and language (Arabic), there are variants of Islam. In terms of its practice, David K. Leonard states that although the Sharia is a central unifying ideology throughout the Somalis, there is conflict over its interpretation and instrumentalities through which it will be enforced.

Equally important in Somalia socio-political life is the role of customary law – the xeer or heer in resolving conflicts. Clan elders, chiefs, or title-holders mediate between and within clan families through a compensatory system known as the dia (literally, “blood payments”). The amount of dia would be based on the severity of injury to the victim. Decisions are arrived at by consensus at the gathering of adult males within the clan family presided by a clan leader.

Since the government in Mogadishu lacks the capacity to maintain stability, rule of law, and provide basic socio-economic needs of its people, relies on AMISOM for its security and protection from Al-Shabaab, it lacks legitimacy and its sovereignty as a legal entity is in question. The consequence is that most Somalis like many other African societies where governments have failed go back to what they knew best before colonial experience – beliefs in traditional political systems led by clan elders, religious leaders or someone that is respected in society and adherence to customary laws (the Sharia or the xeer). These are institutions every member of society grew up with. They are respected and legitimate in the eyes of the people.
The relevance of the discussion thus far is that governmental institutions in Somalia lack the capacity to implement the provisions of the UN CAT. Al-Shabaab has proven to be a disruptive and formidable enemy. It has proven it can strike beyond territories outside its control. Its interpretation and implementation of strict Sharia law present a grave danger to any Somali repatriated to any region within its control.

Similarly, in a dysfunctional political system like Somalia, “public officials” in relation to CAT is interpreted differently. Given the inability of the central government to extend its authority to every region of Southern and Central Somalia, a “public official” means different things to whichever clan-family is dominant in the region. A “public official” here could be a clan-elder, a chief, religious leader or businessman.

In conclusion, we state that the U.S. and other countries signatories to the UN CAT should be careful in repatriating Somalis to Southern and Central Somalia until durable stability can be assured for such individuals. There is no guarantee with the government in Mogadishu that returnees will be protected from falling into the hands of insurgent groups that might kidnap them for ransom or rival clan groups that might subject returnees to degrading and inhuman treatment.

7 Ibid.
8 Ibid.
10 Ibid.
13 Weber, Max. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization* . 1964., pp. 154 – Weber, in his essential argument, defines the state as the entity which “upholds the claim to the monopoly of the legitimate use of physical force in the enforcement of its order,” or simply, “the monopoly of violence.”
22 Ibid.
26 Ibid.
30 Ibid. pp. 9
31 Ibid. pp. 27
33 Ibid.
34 Ibid. pp. 405
41 Ibid.
43 Schraeder, p. 26
Shakespearian Philosophy and Shakespeare’s Women

By Ric Williams
Glendale CC (Retired)
To understand whether the dominant thought of the present age would have to be described as a pseudo-philosophy, we shall express this suggestion on terms of the classic description of the natural obstacles to philosophy. People may become so frightened of the ascent to the light of the sun, and so desirous of making that ascent impossible for their descendants, that they dig a deep pit beneath the cave in which they were born, and withdraw into that pit. If one of the descendants desired to ascend to the light of the sun, he would first have to try to reach the level of the natural cave.

(Leo Strauss, Persecution and the Art of Writing, 1952, p. 153)

William Shakespeare’s 39 major or titled works provide the reader with a portrait of man’s natural cave that is unrivaled in its breadth, depth and clarity. Yet today his majestic efforts are dismissed as either outdated and archaic, or as the sexist and chauvinistic reflections of his misogynistic era. Those who make these claims do not trouble themselves with a close, careful reading of his texts. They don’t, as Strauss also showed, because of their unreflective acceptance “of the dogma of the superiority of modern thought to all earlier thought.” (p. 158) Freed by this dogma, they don’t bother with an explanation of his works, that is, with trying “to ascertain what he said and how he actually understood what he said.” Instead they go directly to the work of interpretation, that is, to asserting that what he had written “is based on a mistake, or is the unconscious expression of a wish, an interest, a bias, or a historical situation.” Continuing, Strauss wrote that “It is obvious that the interpretation has to proceed the explanation. If the explanation is not based on an adequate interpretation, it will be the explanation, not of the statement to be explained, but of a figment of the imagination of the historian.” (p. 143, emphasis added) But, how is one to go about interpreting Shakespeare?

The Globe Theater performances of his plays were widely attended and widely acclaimed by the “nobility” and the commoners alike. This reminds us that he wrote for two audiences, and it goes without saying that the works of a writer who can address multiple audiences must be read like two porcupines making love: very carefully. A careful reading must begin at the surface: with what we see when we first pick up the texts, specifically, with the titles and the form of his 39 major works. Fourteen of those works are set in the ancient and pagan world (two in England, five in Rome and seven in the Greek world,) while 25 are set in the Christian era of roughly the eleventh through the seventeenth centuries. Of these, 12 are set in England, 11 in Italy, and one each in Denmark and Vienna. The epoch-making difference to which Shakespeare draws our attention is between antiquity and modernity, that is, between pagan Theogony and Christian Theology, and is impossible to believe that for him that difference was of anything less than crucial and even decisive importance. Else, why would he have so “loudly” called our attention to it? No less striking is the fact that their form is strikingly similar to Plato’s dialogues, with this important difference. In Plato’s 35 dialogues the characters’ speeches take “center stage” while their actions are “far off in the wings.” In Shakespeare’s works, however, both speeches and deeds get “equal billing.” In a sense then, he “completes” Plato by showing us the reciprocal influence that speeches and deeds have on each other, by showing us how the former inform the latter and how the latter give visual expression to the former. It is also the case that as Socrates, in books
8 and 9 of the Republic, described five regimes: monarchy, or the regime ruled by the philosopher king, aristocracy or timocracy, oligarchy, democracy and tyranny, so too do we find all of them in the speeches and deeds of Shakespeare’s plays. Not only did he thus complete Plato, but it must also be said that he completed Aristotle.

Aristotle’s Nicomachean Ethics provides us an unsurpassed analysis of the five intellectual virtues and the eleven moral virtues and their corresponding vices. In treating those virtues and vices, he stresses that his “theoretical” discussion of them is necessarily incomplete, and that such a discussion can only be completed by studying how the various actors on the world’s stage have displayed both the ones and the others. For example, we better understand noble but flawed political leadership when Henry V displays it, and we better understand the most vicious public men as we watch Richard III’s tyrannical enterprises. There is another sense in which Shakespeare completes Socratic/Platonic/Aristotelian philosophy. In those ancient works, women rarely and only briefly appear, while in Shakespeare women play important and even title roles. There is an important reason for this. Shakespeare knew with Aristotle both that justice is the preserver of all partnerships (marital, economic and political), and that while men in general are better at acquisition, women are far more often better at preservation. Thus Shakespeare’s most memorable women act as the fountainheads and defenders of justice.

This, of course, is not to say that female villainy is absent in his plays. He describes Cleopatra as “the wrangling queen.” In King Lear, Lear’s daughters—Regan and Goneril—are the petty, self-serving schemers whose plots and intrigues become ruinous for all of the play’s leading figures. Lady Macbeth memorably fortifies her husband’s resolve to commit his “murders most foul,” and the cunning prophecies of the three witches foretell Macbeth’s richly deserved doom. We mourn the weaknesses of Juliette, Gertrude and Ophelia, and their tragic fates evoke our pity. Nevertheless, Shakespeare also portrays women whose moderation, prudence or practical wisdom, and justice serve as monuments for human excellence.

In Troilus and Cressida, Cressida’s sense of justice and her sobriety stand in stark contrast to the vainglorious and destructive love of honor that moved the play’s male “heroes”: Agamemnon, Achilles, Priam and Troilus. In Coriolanus it is his mother Volumnia’s love of the early Roman republic that saves it from destruction at the hands of her vengeful son. But we must now turn to Shakespeare’s greatest women: to Lucrece (Lucretia Collatinus) in The Rape of Lucrece; to Portia in The Merchant of Venice; and to Katherina in The Taming of the Shrew.

In the induction to the Shrew, Shakespeare’s players describe their performance as “a kind of history,” (I, 144) and this is true of all of his plays. The histories which he wrote have no resemblance to those produced by academic historians. Nor are they what we would call historical fiction; rather, they are philosophic histories. One of the characteristics of such histories is the liberties which they take with known facts. For example, the historical King Richard III was not “the foul bunched-back (hunchback) toad” presented by Shakespeare. Furthermore, many of his creations, Portia and
Katherina for example, have no historical counterparts. Instead, as a writer of philosophic histories, he presents specific men and women acting in particular circumstances, at a particular time, and in a particular place in order to let us better see those aspects of human life which do not vary from time to time, place to place, and circumstance to circumstance.

Among those universals of human life is that acquisition is an inescapable necessity of our nature. Because we are mortal creatures we must somehow or another provide ourselves with those things which sustain, improve and adorn our lives, and this necessity is the premise of his “paired” plays. Shakespeare’s Rome and England were both non-democratic, nay—anti-democratic regimes. That is, they were ruled by honor-loving hereditary monarchs and minorities who established and maintained the ways of life of the peoples over whom they ruled for the sake of acquisition by military means or by war and conquest. Likewise, he pairs Athens and Italy to show us concrete examples of popular or oligarchic acquisition, or of acquisition through economic means, which is to say, through trade and commerce. For Shakespeare, the fact that Rome/England and Athens/Italy adopted different modes of acquisition was not economically determined. Instead, their different choices were political choices or choices which grew out of their even more fundamental or regime-determining political beliefs: the non-democratic equation of happiness with fame, glory and honor, and the popular equation of happiness with wealth and pleasure.

According to both Shakespeare and Titus Livius, (Livy), a famous first century BC Roman author, it was Lucrece who was the foundress of Republican Rome. According to both authors, the Tarquin tyrant, Tarquinius Superbus, was so inflamed by Lucrece’s beauty and virtue that he chose to seize and rape her. After he had violated her, he told her that if she revealed what he had done to her, he would produce a servant who would swear that she had come to him voluntarily, thus compounding his offenses against her body by violating her sense of honor. Valuing her honor above her life, she informed her husband, Collatinus and his two fellow warriors, Lucius Junius and Publius Valerius, of her violation; and, going further, she asked for and received from all three of them their pledges to exact just retribution for the tyrant’s crime, both by killing him, and by establishing republican or representative political institutions for their city. To trace the birth of “the greatest republic that ever was” to a woman is entirely fitting for it is only women who can give birth, in Lucrece’s case, to a timocratic or honor-loving regime. Like all other actual regimes, as opposed to such imaginary and best regimes in speech as those ruled by Plato’s philosopher king in the Republic or by Shakespeare’s Prospero in the Tempest, the regime of the honor-loving Romans was destroyed by the excess of its highest good—its love of honor. He chronicles this in his subsequent Roman plays: Coriolanus, Julius Caesar, Antony and Cleopatra, and Titus Andronicus.

In Coriolanus we see the love of honor transformed into destructive vanity or empty pride. In Julius Caesar, the love of honor gives way to his burning desire for immortal fame and glory. While speaking to Rome’s plebes, Mark Antony declares that Caesar thrice refused the crown, and he offers this as evidence that Caesar aspired to nothing beyond the Roman or republican honors that the people could confer on him. However, Caesar says of himself that he is as constant at the North Star, that he is the cosmos’
fixed, immovable and eternal center around which move all of the rest of the heavenly bodies. This craving for his private good, for the immortality that he and he alone could enjoy, led him to destroy the republic. Antony and Cleopatra turned the appetite for the private good even farther inward as they sought to be immortalized for their lusty passions, and in Titus Andronicus Shakespeare shows us the fall of the Roman Empire as a consequence of the depths of depravity to which unrestricted appetites and passions can descend. These five plays make up his history of Rome, but we must go beyond the texts to note two of his “deafening silences” about his subject.

Between the time of Antony and Cleopatra (c. 40 BC) and Titus Andronicus (c. 450 AD) pagan Rome became Christian Rome, and Shakespeare was certainly aware of this epoch-making transformation; yet he said nothing about it—why? Does his silence suggest that to understand Caesarism is to understand the motives which led the emperors to make Christianity the established church of their empires? Did he regard looking beyond mortality to immortality as something less than an unqualified good? The action of two of his paired plays: Pericles Prince of Tyre and Hamlet Prince of Denmark ask us to think about the successes of the pagan prince Pericles and the failures of the Christian prince Hamlet. Could Shakespeare have traced the successes of the former and the failures of the latter to their respective religions? Answering these questions would require years of study and thousands of pages, so for now we must leave them open. Let’s then turn to a second “deafening silence” in his Roman histories: the fact that he says nothing about the three (264 - 146 BC) Punic Wars fought by Rome and Carthage. The Roman leader, Cato the Elder, is famous for his ringing “Carthago delenda est,” (Carthage must be destroyed), and at the end of the third Punic War Rome obliterated Carthage and everything Carthaginian.

Shakespeare was also silent about other wars, e.g. the Peloponnesian War, the Venetian defeat of the Turkish fleet in the 1571 Battle of Lepanto and the English Navy’s 1588 defeat of the Spanish Armada. One possible explanation for these silences is that he would not permit foreign affairs to take his readers’ attention away from what for him was fundamental—his analysis of the different regimes. However, as monumental as were these wars, Rome’s triumph and Carthage’s defeat was even more monumental. Rome’s victory led to the fact that for the next 1,500 or so years the great powers of the West would, as Rome did, acquire things through military means, again, through war and conquest. Conversely, when Carthage died, acquisition through economic means, again, through trade and commerce, died with it and would not be revived again until its renaissance in such Italian city-states as Florence, Genoa, Naples and Venice. Why, then was he silent about that monumental and truly epoch-making war? Shakespeare, we must remember, was not an antiquarian who returned to the past just for the sake of returning to the past. He was, instead, concerned with what Tom Paine would later call “the eternal now,” and in his view the timeless struggle between martial and economic acquisition was being waged once again in post-Renaissance Europe.

It is said that Marco Polo’s account of his 15-year trek to China in search of trade goods was the prelude to the emergence of the Italian city-states as centers of international trade and commerce. In any event, the fact that the center of the universal or Catholic church was in Rome was most significant. Rome’s doctrine of the equality of
man in the eyes of God served to weaken the hereditary rulers’ claims to legitimacy, and to the recognition of the claims of the popular classes specifically, to the thought that economic acquisition just might be legitimate. Thus it is highly appropriate that Shakespeare’s quintessential economic play is *The Merchant of Venice*.

At its center is the contract between Shylock, the Jewish money lender, and Antonio, the Christian merchant. Shylock loans Antonio 3,000 ducats, and in return Antonio pledges a pound of his flesh in the event that he cannot repay his debt. When he agreed to those terms, Antonio was certain that the money from the sale of the cargoes in five of ships would easily repay what he owed Shylock. However, all five ships and their cargoes were lost at sea, leaving him with no funds to repay Shylock, and claiming that Antonio was in default, Shylock took him before the Venetian Court demanding that he be awarded his pound of flesh. At this point in the play, Portia appears before the court disguised as a young man representing Venice’s most renowned jurist, and her appeal to the court goes to the core of all commercial transactions. Before we turn to how she “got the court and Antonio off the hook,” as it were; we must understand why Antonio went to a Jewish money-lender, and particularly to one who hated Christians and all things Christian.

Pope Sixtus V (1585-1591) issued a decree banning the lending of money at any interest rate, a fact that could not have escaped Shakespeare’s attention. Why, though, was that decree issued? The Catholic Church was the official or state-recognized and sanctioned church everywhere in continental Europe at the time. As James Madison would later describe it, it was an ecclesiastical establishment. As such it was funded in very large part by the taxes collected by the hereditary monarchs and princes with which it was closely allied. The public funds collected through those rulers’ compulsory powers financed both the wars waged by those rulers, and the building of the Church’s monasteries, nunneries and palatial cathedrals. However, private funds raised by voluntary agreements were increasingly being used to finance trade and commerce, and like any other monopoly the established church did all that it could to crush its competition. This was, perhaps, the opening “salvo” in what has become known as the war between the “moral economy” and the market economy. It has been and is said that what makes the “moral” economy moral is that all decisions regarding the distribution of a nation’s scarce economic or household goods and services are taken away from *hoi polloi*, and placed in the hands of “their betters,” that is, the Church, the nobility or (more recently) the denizens of the administrative state.

The tacit premise of this belief is that nature’s fundamental law is the law of inequality; that as it applies to man, it is natural and therefore right for the inferior orders to be ruled by their superiors. (Deplorables anyone?) Built into this view of nature and right is the idea that man’s natural and only method of acquisition is by war and conquest through which the strong by force take from the weak. More recently, communism, “progressive” doctrines and socialism have clung to this “singularity.” In this, all of these “progressives” harken back to the rhetorician and sophist Thrasyvachus in *The Republic*. Thrasyvachus argued that justice is nothing more than the interest of the stronger, that is, the rulers. He further argued that justice is an art (an art, by the way, that he would be happy to teach for pay). Socrates gets him to agree that justice is like all other
arts (say, those of the baker, carpenter or doctor) which are practiced not for the benefit of their practitioners but for others who benefit through purchasing those artisans’ products or services. But Socrates does not accept the stark alternative of utter egoism versus utter altruism. Instead, he “discovers” the wage earner’s art, the art through which the artisans benefit themselves while benefiting others. As long as there is neither a seller’s nor a buyer’s monopoly, that is, as long as the exchanges are voluntary, the principle that governs them is the principle that the just is the equal, or of equal value returned for equal value received. This, of course, is the principle of the market economy, and it is not at all surprising that our “neo-Thrasymachans” are utterly blind to this fact.

Returning to *the Merchant* and to Portia’s defense of Antonio, we note that she successfully makes two crucial points. First, that in a commercial republic the *sine qua non* of all voluntary contracts is the contracting parties’ mutual obligation to fulfill the terms to which they have agreed. That this obligation is more often honored in the breach than in its observance is best attested to by the many volumes of contract law which fill law libraries around the world. Nevertheless, when the contracting parties are from different countries, and in the absence of treaty obligations created by their respective governments, voluntary fulfillment of contractual obligations is absolutely required. Fulfillment of contractual obligations was essential to Venice’s international trade and commerce, and in upholding that requirement Portia acted to solidify the floor of its commercialism. The fundamental principle that she honored here was that the just is the equal; specifically the rule of reciprocity in exchange or of equal value returned for equal value received. At the same time she upheld a second application of the principle of equality, the principle of proportionality or the rule that the penalty cannot be disproportionate to the offense, which in the case of Shylock’s demand it clearly was. On this basis the Court was able to both uphold just contractual obligations and reject Shylock’s unjust demand. We turn now to *The Taming of the Shrew*, a play which today is more vilified than any of his others.

**II. Some Reflections on *The Taming of the Shrew***

The play’s major action—the taming of the shrew—is initiated by Petruchio who Katharina first characterizes as “one half-lunatic [and] a madcap ruffian and a swearing Jack.” (II, 1, 280-281) The shrew is Katharina Minola, the older daughter of Baptista Minola, of whom the Paduans are certain that she is, as Petruchio summarizes it, “as curst and shrewd as Socrates’ [wife] Xanthippe, or a worse.” (I, 2, 65-66) As to his putative motive for “taming” her, he declares that “I come to wive it wealthily in Padua; if wealthily, then happily in Padua.” (I, 2, 69-70) He is given the opportunity to court and marry her by Padua’s wealthiest man, Baptista, who lives by the “golden rule,” namely, by the “law” that he who has the gold makes the rule, and who has decreed that he will allow no man to court his younger daughter, the beautiful and most desirable Bianca, until a husband be found for his older daughter Katharina. (See (I, 1, 171-176 and I, 2, 251-254). This ban has posed a hitherto insoluble problem for the men of Padua who, as Hortensio declares “would not marry her for a mine of gold,” (I, 2, 86) but Petruchio’s arrival in Padua offers Bianca’s suitors—Hortensio and Gremio—a solution to their vexing problem. However, their problem becomes even more vexing when Lucentio and his servant and life-long companion Tranio come to Padua.
Upon arriving, young Lucentio tells Tranio that “for the time I study virtue, and that part of philosophy will I apply that treats of happiness by virtue specially to be achieved.” (I, 1, 17-20) Tranio, who reads Lucentio like an open book, replies “Good master, while we do admire this virtue and this moral discipline; let’s be no stoics nor stocks, I pray, or so devote to Aristotle’s checks as Ovid be an outcast quite abjured.” (I, 1, 29-33) In keeping with this and as soon as Lucentio sees Bianca, he welcomes Ovid with “open arms,” and is so infatuated with her that he tells Tranio, “I burn, I pine, I perish if I achieve not this modest girl.” (I, 1, 147-148) [A former colleague of mine delightfully described Lucentio’s condition when he told me, “When I was that age, I was very glandular too.”] To achieve Bianca, Lucentio quickly enters into competition for her hand with Hortensio and Gremio, and to that end all three of them become devious and disingenuous plotters and schemers. Leaving their comic intrigues for later, we will turn now to Petruchio’s efforts to court and marry Katharina.

We could cite at least a baker’s dozen of his lies or prevarications but his rehearsal of what he will say to Katharina when he starts to court her is a priceless example.

I will attend her here, and woo her with some spirit when she comes.
Say that she rail, why then I’ll tell her plain she sings as sweetly as a nightingale.
Say that she frown, I’ll say she looks as clear as morning roses newly washed with dew.
Say she be mute and will not speak a word, then I’ll commend her volubility,
And say she uttereth piercing eloquence.
If she do bid me pack, I’ll give her thanks, as though she bid me stay by her a week.
If she deny to wed, I’ll crave the day when I shall ask the banns, and when be married.

(II, 1, 164-176. See also II, 1, 235-248)

In their courtship conversation, Katharina had asked him “Where did you study all this goodly speech,” and he answered, saying “It is extempore, from my mother wit,” to which she responded: “A witty mother! Witless else her son.” (II, 1, 255-257) Shakespeare is, of course, the mother wit from which comes everything that all of his characters in all of his plays say and do, and we cannot escape asking why his Petruchio is a lying buffoon. *The Rape of Lucrece* suggests an answer to our question.

We recall that Lucrece’s husband, along with Publius Valerius and Lucius Junius, had honored her demands that they kill the tyrant and establish republican or representative institutions for the Romans. In his account of that founding, Livy wrote that Lucius Junius and earned the surname Brutus (the dullard) by acting like one so that the ever-suspicious tyrant would not suspect him of plotting against his life and rule. Livy went on to say that when the revolutionaries rose up against the tyrant, Lucius Junius dropped that pretense stood forth (in c. 500BC) as “the great spirit that gave Rome her liberty.” In other words, his pretense and artifice was the *sine qua non* of the founding of “the greatest republic that ever was.” Can the same be said of Petruchio’s buffoonery
and dissembling? Did Shakespeare see the necessity of a new founding? How and why did Petruchio persuade Katharina to become the agent of that change? Why would she want to be the foundress of a new regime? What does she tell us, if anything, about the first principles of her new regime?

In any great work the end is present in the beginning, and in *The Shrew* the end is Katharina’s long speech in Act V, scene 2, and because it ties together everything that had come before it, it must be quoted in full. Speaking to Bianca and the Widow and in front of an amazed audience of her fellow Paduans she castigates the two women.

Fie, Fie! Unknit that threatening, unkind brow, and dart not scornful glances from those eyes
To wound thy lord, thy king, thy governor. It blots thy beauty as frosts do bite the meads,
Confounds thy fame as whirlwinds shake fair buds, and in no sense is meet or amiable.
A woman moved is like a fountain troubled, muddy, ill-seeming, thick, bereft of beauty;
And while it is so, none so dry or thirsty will deign to sip or touch one drop of it.
Thy husband is thy lord, thy life, thy keeper, thy head, thy sovereign, one that cares for thee.
And for thy maintenance commits his body to painful labor, both by sea and land,
To watch the night in storms, the day in cold, whilst thou liest warm at home, secure and safe;
And craves no other tribute at thy hands but love, fair looks, and true obedience—Too little payment for so great a debt. Such duty as the subject owes the prince,
Even such a woman oweth to her husband; and when she is froward, peevish, sullen, sour,
And not obedient to his honest will, what is she but a foul contending rebel
And graceless traitor to her loving lord? I am ashamed that women are so simple
To offer war where they should kneel for peace, or seek for rule, supremacy and sway,
When they are bound to serve, love, and obey. Why are our bodies soft, and weak, and smooth?
Unapt to toil and trouble in the world, but that our soft conditions and our hearts
Should well agree with our external parts. Come, come you froward and unable worms!
My mind hath been as big as one of yours, my heart as great, my reason haply more,
To bandy word for word and frown for frown; but now I see our lances are but straw,
Our strength as weak, our weakness past compare, that seeming to be most what we indeed least are. Then vail your stomachs, for it is no boot, and place your hands below your husband’s foot,
In token of which duty, if he please, my hand is ready, may it do him ease. (V, 2, 140-183)
In the eyes of her fellow Paduans, she must appear to be something like a reformed alcoholic. Up to this point, the Katharina that they knew was an enraged, violent, irascible and tempestuous shrew. But, miraculously she appears to have been transformed, but now she appears to them as a meek supplicant proclaiming her dutiful obedience to her husband. As reformed alcoholics are best suited for persuading the “victims” of “demon rum” to become and to stay “dry,” so too is Katharina, the newly tamed shrew, best suited for persuading her wayward addressees to “see the light” and abandon their shrewish ways. But is the Katharina they see in front of them a truly tamed shrew? Or is her speech a delightfully disingenuous compendium of pretense and artifice? Everything that has come before it points to its being just that.

Early in the play, and after a heated argument with her sister whom she had bound and beaten, she tells her father “Talk not to me. I will go sit and weep till I can find occasion for revenge.” (II, 1, 34-35) Her no-less tempestuous relations with her fellow Paduans show that she is seeking her revenge not merely against her family but against everyone in and everything about Padua; as she suggests by denouncing Bianca for being a “minion.” (II, 1, 13) A minion is a “camp follower” or one who “goes along to get along” so as to reap the benefits of “going with the flow.” For Bianca that meant marrying for money, (See II, 1, 16-17) and when she marries Lucentio, she marries into the vast family fortune that his father Vincentio had accumulated. In this regard, Bianca is her father’s daughter for Baptista sees marriage as nothing more than an economic transaction, and it is only in this light that we must understand his decree that he would permit no man to “buy” Bianca, who he sees as nothing more than a highly valued economic asset, until he has had to pay a large fee for disposing of Katharina—his huge economic liability. That fee was the 20,000 crowns he had paid Petruchio, and he turns a good “profit” when he “sells” Bianca to Tranio (masquerading as Lucentio) and the pedant (masquerading as Vincentio) for a much higher price.

Trading in dowries was the lifeblood of the closed, agrarian oligarchy that ruled Padua. An oligarchy is a regime in which the wealthy few rule for the sake of their wealth and at the expense of the have-nots or of those in Padua who did not own land. In this regard, Shakespeare’s Padua lets us see the landed, hereditary, titled “aristocracies” that had ruled the peoples of Europe and England for centuries for what they actually were: closed, agrarian oligarchies. Such regimes are unjust for a number of reasons. To begin with, because they were agrarian economies they were economies of scarcity. This is so because the land from which came all of the country’s productivity is a scarce or very limited factor of production. Working the land required large numbers of peasants and serfs who could do nothing other than work their “lords” lands and who were bound for life to their “lords” lands. In such a situation the poor had to come begging at the doors of the rich, as Hortensio learned at the bridal banquet. (See V, 2, 65-96) Furthermore, because agrarian economies are economies of scarcity, their characteristic class division is between the very few who are very rich and the very many who are very poor. To maintain this across the generations, the oligarchs set the “opening bids” in the dowry auction so high that only they were able to participate in it; thus forever excluding all but “the rich and the well-born.” The foundation of such regimes was the principle that the just is the unequal, and it followed from this that barring the poor
from governing was just as proper as barring them from becoming land owners. But all of this was only part of the problem.

Bianca took it for granted that because she was a daughter of privilege, she was entitled to do as she liked or to pursue any end she chanced to desire. That this was the rule that governed her life is clearly shown at the same bridal banquet where Hortensio had received his “rude wakening.” There, Lucentio tells Biondello “bid your mistress (Bianca) come to me,” only to be informed that “my mistress sends you word that she is busy and she cannot come.” (V, 2, 79-85) Of this, and some 2,000 years earlier in *The Politics*, Aristotle had pointed out that the democrat starts by assuming that justice consists in equality and concludes that liberty and equality consist in allowing each man (or woman) to do as he likes or to pursue any end he chances to desire. That this can lead to dire consequences is the lesson of *The Shrew’s* induction. There we are introduced to Christopher Sly, a drunken, deadbeat, derelict bum who, in a drunken stupor, passes out in a snowbank where he would have frozen to death had it not been for the chance arrival of a nameless lord. Sly’s deplorable situation is the result of his hedonistic quest for pleasure at the bottom of the bottle, and while Bianca and Lucentio, et.al, have not descended to that depth, there is nothing in their equation of happiness with pleasure that, in principle, would prevent them from joining Sly.

In any event, after saving him and by way of “practicing on Sly,” (See Ind, 1, 32) the lord orders his servants to perform a play for him. When Sly asks what kind of play it is, he is told that it is a comedy, a kind of history and that it is about household stuff. (See Ind, 2, 28-32) That it is a comedy is clear, and that it is about household stuff—courtship and marriage—is also clear. That it is a kind of history is indicated by the fact that Padua’s fictional oligarchy had a large number of historical and unjust counterparts. Why, though, did Shakespeare write this kind of history? We recall that he set both *The Merchant* and *The Shrew* in Italy, and that by his lifetime certain Italian city-states had become centers of international trade and commerce, which is to say that commercial as opposed to agrarian republics were pushing their way onto the historical stage. While Shakespeare regarded commercial regimes as better than agrarian ones, he did not regard their emergence as an unqualified good for they too could become closed oligarchies, and Katharina’s speech provides a principled means for avoiding that fate. By the time she delivered her speech, Petruchio had taught her the art of seeming to be most what she indeed least was. (See V, 2, 181-182) That is, through his many dissembling speeches, he had schooled her in the art of ironic speech or of saying the thing which is not. In other words, by the time of her speech, she too had become a skillful liar.

Because she was much wiser than her fellow Paduans, Katharina alone was able to discover a deeper and revolutionary aim behind the public face of his antics. She became his fellow revolutionary because from the beginning she had been looking for an opportunity to take her revenge against the Paduans and their unjust or oligarchic ways. The wager he had initiated at the bridal banquet had given her the opportunity, and the ironic face of both his speeches and deeds pointed her to the means. However, her graduation from what Hortensio called Petruchio’s school for taming shrews did not come easily or quickly. First, Petruchio had to curb her irascibility or her violent temper.
and equally violent rages. The comic burlesques which he made of everything that the Paduans looked up to as most weighty and solemn served to diminish them in her eyes. Seeing all of those great things diminished, she ceased to feel their crushing weight, and once freed of that she no longer saw herself as so born down and crushed that she as a lone woman could nothing than rant and rave against it. Through liberating her from the regime’s crushing weight, he “tamed” her, which is to say that he persuaded her to moderate or temper or her irascibility in favor of a controlled and focused moral outrage at the regime. Her lessons in moderation did not come easily.

Having received Baptista’s invitation to the bridal banquet, Petruchio summoned a tailor and haberdasher to make her a cap and gown for the celebration. However, when they show her their finery, and even though she liked what she saw, Petruchio destroyed both the cap and the gown. Since the 13th century caps and gowns had been worn by graduates and by destroying them he denied her a diploma. (See IV, 3, 53-160) Nevertheless, the proof that she is a worthy graduate comes shortly after that. While riding to Padua for the bridal banquet, they stop at a fountain where they are joined by the real Vincentio. Prior to his arrival, they had argued about the sun and the moon, and Petruchio had started by claiming that the mid-morning sun was the moon. Against this, Katharina insisted that it was the sun, and the dispute ends with this exchange:

Petruchio: I say it is the moon. Katharina: I know it is the moon. Petruchio: Nay, then you lie. It is the blessed sun. Katharina: Then, God be blessed, it is the blessed sun. But sun it is not, when you say it is not, and the moon changes even as your mind. What you will have it named, even that it is, and so it shall be so for Katherine. (IV, 5, 15-20) To test her “new-built virtue and obedience,” (V, 2, 122) he greets the aged Vincentio as a “gentle mistress,” and says “Kate, embrace her for her beauty’s sake.” Embracing Vincentio, she says “Young, budding virgin, fair and fresh, and sweet. Whither away, or where is thy abode? Happy the parents of so fair a child; happier the man whom favorable stars allots thee for his lovely bedfellow.” (IV, 5, 34-40)

By this she shows him that she has “graduated” or mastered the art of lying, and at the banquet she is not only dressed in the promised but earlier destroyed fine array, but she is also fully prepared to speak to her sister and the Widow. A notable feature of her speech is its delightful irony. To illustrate, she tells the two brides that “Thy husband is thy lord, thy life, thy keeper, thy head, thy sovereign; one that cares for thee, and for thy maintenance commits his body to painful labor both by sea and land, to watch the night in storms, the day in cold.” (V, 2, 150-154) She is speaking, of course, about Lucentio and Hortensio and to say that they have committed their bodies to labor painfully for anyone else is simply a lie; and even though Bianca and the Widow are not particularly intelligent, their own experiences have taught them that. In making them active participants in her irony, she seeks to kindle their senses of moral outrage and to thereby enlist them in her revolutionary effort. By making a woman give the speech to two other women, Shakespeare reminds us of the great power in women’s hands. [Apropos of this, my grandsons are both in their early 20s and grandpa delights in telling them that when they get married they will become members of the “honey-do” club, the honey do
this, honey do that partnership over which their wives will preside.] All kidding aside, the marital partnership provides important lessons in certain principles of justice that are, or should be, operative in economic and political partnerships as well. In starting with household stuff Shakespeare silently cautions us against the dangers inherent in having visionary expectations from politics, and in *The Tempest* his Gonzalo expresses those visionary and all-to-familiar expectations. When asked what he would do if he were the ruler of Prospero’s island, he says

Had I plantation of this isle, my lord, and were the king on it, what would I do?
In the commonwealth, I would by contraries execute all things;
For no kind of traffic would I admit; no name of magistrate; letters should not be known;
Riches, poverty, and use of service, none; contract, succession, bourn, bound of land,
Tilth, vineyard, none; no use of metal, corn, or wine, or oil; no occupation, all men idle, all;
And women too—but innocent and pure;
No sovereignty,--all things in common nature should produce without sweat or endeavor;
Treason, felony, sword, pike, knife, gun, or need of any engine would I not have,
But nature should bring forth of its own kind all foison, all abundance, to feed my innocent people.
I would with such perfection govern, sir, to excel the golden age. (II, 1, 1-15 and 28-29)

It goes without saying that Shakespeare was not a devotee of comprehensive or top-down social engineering. But as giant oaks from little acorns grow, so too do monumental changes grow from their “little” beginnings in our households, and Katharina’s speech points us to those “little” principles that will come to bear enormous fruits. The general rule which she applies is the principle that the just equals the equal, a specific application of which is the principle of *reciprocity in exchange*. Shakespeare best conveys the idea behind this through his *Measure for Measure*, the title of which points us to our duty to reply in kind when others have provided something of value for us. Or to put it another way, the rule is *equal* value returned for *equal* value provided. This is the cement that holds together all partnerships—marital, economic and political, which is to say that it applies to these and, for that matter, to all voluntary associations. To say that marital partnerships are voluntary is to say that the lovers seek to enter into them freely or of their own accord. Now, it is of course true that it is both of the lovers’ primary desire to benefit themselves that leads them into marriage, but, as the old saying goes, “herein lies the rub.” If that primary desire is not restrained, alienation of affections and broken marriages will follow; which is another way of saying that unless we develop “republican virtue” or the habitual and voluntary restraint of our appetites, our most powerful natural association cannot last. That this is true is the lesson taught when Lucentio and Hortensio fail to persuade Bianca and the Widow to return to the banquet hall.
Bianca, again, has been so thoroughly schooled in the democratic principle that liberty and equality consist in allowing each man to do as he likes or to pursue any end he chances to desire that when Lucentio bids her to return she tells him only that “she is busy and she cannot come.” (V, 2, 85) In short and in her world, what she fancies at any given moment overrides her obligations to anyone else, her husband included. Hortensio, though, fares even worse than Lucentio. After marrying the Widow solely for her money, and after entreating her to return, she rebukes him saying, “you have some goodly jest in hand,” and bids him “come to her.” (V, 2, 95-96) We learn from the two grooms' fates that when unrestrained, both the democratic and oligarchic principles can destroy our marital and most natural partnership. To preserve that partnership nature builds into husbands and wives and parents and children strong bonds of love and affection, and it is through those bonds that we are habituated to “republican virtue” or to the restraint of our appetites and the proper regard that we must have for those who are closest to us.

As Aristotle noted, habit is but long practice, and habit is what becomes man’s nature in the end; and as parents and children we put in those long years of practice in order to become self-governing or self-disciplining adults who “instinctively” pay their due regard to others. The free market economy or what Adam Smith called “the system of natural liberty,” also helps to habituate us to “republican virtue.” In that system of “natural liberty,” that is, in an economy where there is neither a buyer’s nor a seller’s monopoly, both parties are free to accept or reject the terms of a proposed transaction; and both parties’ own regard for their own interest inclines them to complete the transaction when each of them is satisfied that its terms represent an exchange of equal value returned for equal value provided.

In the landed, hereditary oligarchies of past centuries there was a seller’s monopoly or oligopoly and the few rich provided products and services at prices which were far above their fair market value. As witness “Obamacare” the same is true of the administrative state and its “expertocracy”: higher than fair market prices for inferior services; and truth be told, that is the reality of the sellers’ monopoly that is the bureaucratic or administrative state. Regarding this and in Volume II, chapter 6 of his Democracy in America Alexis DeTocqueville described that state as “an Immense and tutelary power” that “covers the surface of society with a network of small, complicated rules, minute and uniform, through which the most energetic characters cannot penetrate.” He added that “such a power does not destroy, but it prevents existence; it does not tyrannize, but it compresses, enervates, extinguishes and stupefies a people, till each nation is reduced to nothing better than a flock of timid and industrious sheep, of which the government is the shepherd.” Between sheep and shepherds there is a fundamental inequality, and a spokeswoman for our “expertocracy” recently expressed our shepherds’ viewpoint when she denounced “a bunch of Deplorables.” As this teaches us, those experts’ self-conferred sense of superiority to hoi polloi threatens democratic, self-government, and it was against this that the American experiment in popular government was launched.
In 1796 Tom Paine wrote that “rights appertain to man by right of his existence only,” and that “a declaration of rights is neither a donation nor a creation of them; for every civil right has a natural right for its foundation.” Thomas Jefferson expressed the sense of this when in the Declaration of Independence he wrote “that all men are created equal; that they are endowed by their Creator with certain inalienable rights; that among these are life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness; that to secure these rights governments are instituted among men, deriving their just powers from the consent of the governed; that whenever any form of government becomes destructive of these ends, it is the right of the people to alter or abolish it, and to institute a new one laying its foundation on such principles and organizing its powers in such form as to them shall seem most likely to affect their safety and happiness.”

As it is true in our households and in our economic lives, so too is it true in the political world that we are all equally and alike human. Because we are the rational and the political animal, or the animal whose speech and reason brings us close to each other, our nature compels us to take into account the presence and well-being of those with whom we live, and to give them what is owed to, or due to, or fitting and proper for them. Our natural equality is the ground of those obligations to our own kind, and the principle of equality is the central idea from which comes our sense of our mutual duty to honor and discharge those natural duties. That Shakespeare was able to set our minds to thinking about such enduring matters reminds us that the kind of history which he wrote was philosophic or an account of what is always true for man. In giving us his enduring account of our enduring affairs, he was always mindful of the fact that while philosophy issues no commands, it always stands ready to give reasons why commands should be issued. This is the lesson of his enigmatic Sonnet 941, which I take to be a self-portrait and with which I will close.

They that have power to hurt and will do none,
That do not do the thing they most do show,
Who, moving others, are themselves as stone,
Unmoved, cold, and to temptation slow;
They rightly do inherit Heaven’s graces,
And husband nature’s riches from expense;
They are the lords and owners of their faces
Others but stewards of their excellence.
The summer’s flower is to the summer sweet
Though to itself it only live and die;
But if that flower with base infection meet,
The basest weed outbraves his dignity.
For sweetest things turn sourest by their deeds:
Lilies that fester smell far worse than weeds.

Thank you.
Consumerism in the People’s Republic of China

Baomei Zhao, University of Akron
Yanmin He, Zhejiang University of Technology
Timothy McCarragher, University of Akron
Michelle Kreidler, University of Akron
Introduction

Consumer protection is formed by changes in behavior, the passage of laws, and the development of consumer organizations. Understanding the rise and change of historical consumer movements is vital to understanding the country’s current consumer interests and rights protection movement. This paper will explain the evolution of the consumer interests and rights protection movement in the People’s Republic of China (PRC). It will analyze China’s consumerism in five distinct periods: the period before the People’s Republic of China (before 1949), centrally-planned command economy (1950-1978), open policy and economic reform (1978-1993), better organized consumer rights and interests protection movement (1993 through 2000), and the current consumer movement—continuing progress with challenges (after 2000). This paper will specifically address the ways in which the people, government, and laws have worked jointly to promote the rapid development of the consumer movement. Finally, an examination of the challenges to the current consumer movement will take place.

Key words: People’s Republic of China, consumerism, economic development, supply, demand, boycott, consumer interests and rights.

Period Before the Establishment of the People’s Republic of China (before 1949)

Prior to 1900, China experienced three types of societies: primitive society (2600 BCE to 2100 BCE), slave society (2100 BCE to 476 BCE), and feudal society (475 BCE to 1840 CE). The feudal period led to a long span of low economic productivity. Within feudal society, there were policies of promoting agriculture and restraining commerce in an effort to enrich the state. This economy provided limited consumer protections (Rong, 2008).

Ancient Chinese emperors believed the country to be completely self-sufficient. Therefore, foreign trade was not considered to be an economically important activity. Western nations, however, wanted sustained trade with China. Europe was looking for ways to increase its access to Chinese products that were in high demand. The following four incidents happened before the foundation the PRC (1949), but had significant influence on China’s economy and consumerism then and today (Lu, 2010).

The Silk Road

The Silk Road or Silk Route were trade routes connecting Europe and the Mediterranean with the Asian world. Chinese goods were in high demand in Europe and Asia. The trade routes allowed the European market access to high-demand Chinese products such as silk, tea, porcelain, and other luxury goods. The Silk Road was the collective name for several ancient international trade routes linking China with Asian and European countries. It started in 206 BCE and lasted for more than 1,600 years, spanning several Chinese dynasties (Zhao, 2014).

Two Opium Wars

In an attempt to alter a trade imbalance with China, the British began smuggling large amounts of opium into China. Many Chinese people quickly became addicted to Opium. Britain began to reap huge profits and broke China’s long-term advantages in foreign trade. Two hundred years of China’s trade surplus ended and a deficit economy followed (Shi, 2012).

The Chinese government and civilian population attempted to take a stand against the opium invasion through boycotts of opium. However, these actions were not
successful in curbing the supply of opium into the country. Thus, there was an increased call for military action against foreign oppression (Zhang & Liu, 2007).

Between 1839 and 1860 there were two Opium Wars. These wars were marked by conflicts between the forces of Western countries and the Qing dynasty. In both wars, the foreign invaders were victorious. They gained both land and concessions. The people of China felt demoralized. However, these actions did lead to a rising of the people's resolve. Resisting opium as an economic means of struggle against foreign aggression became a central theme in the consciousness of the people. This rise in consciousness resulted in a further boycott of British goods (Zhang & Liu, 2007).

May Fourth Movement

On May 4, 1919, workers and students took part in national protests against the government’s agreement to the Treaty of Versailles that allowed Japan to receive control over Chinese territories. Thus, there was a further surge in the national movement and further calls to boycott Japanese goods and promote domestic products. This May Fourth Movement is commemorated every year as Youth’s Day (Wu, 2013).

Boycotts & Domestic Production Movement

Throughout the early 20th century, anti-Japanese sentiment grew. The boycott movement gained an even stronger foothold against Japanese goods and products. Japanese goods were referred to as “hated goods” (Wu, 2012). From 1946 to 1947 the United States (U.S.) began an active policy of product dumping. The U.S. was selling its product in China at a price that was lower than the cost of production. The Chinese people responded with an anti-dumping movement to defend their domestic industries (Zhang, 1987). In response China launched campaigns to increase development and use of domestic products (Wu, 2012).

The consumer movement before the establishment of the PRC was characterized by the boycotting of foreign goods and the use of domestic products. The boycott movement was a way to fight against foreign economic aggression and eliminate unequal trade relationships. The boycott movement was an important part of the move against imperialist expansion. It was also a major expression of national patriotism. (Dong, 2011).

Centrally Planned Command Economy (1950-1978)

The PRC was established on October 1, 1949. In an attempt to recover from the trauma of war and difficulties with national finances, the new government developed a centrally-planned economic model, which identified social and economic development initiatives in the country every five years and is referred to as the five-year plan. The first five-year plan (1953–57) was based on the Soviet Union’s model where the government’s central plan replaced the market economy, which resulted in low productivity and limited varieties of products (Hu, Yan & Lv, 2010).

The second five-year plan (1958-1978), was designed with a focus on creating a centrally-controlled economy. This plan also identified means of production and control. These controls offered little consumption choice to the Chinese people. During this time, there were limited resources available to the consumer and goods were rationed. For instance, a grain-rationing system was imposed by the government. Families were given coupons that allowed them to buy a limited quantity of grain at a fixed price (Hu, Yan & Lv, 2010).
The government also implemented a series of measures to increase food production and stabilize food prices. One such measure was a quota system used to help regulate the food supply and limit the demand. This five-year plan model continued with strict central planning by the government with little feedback from the people, and the problems of the central planning system became obvious (Hu, Yan & Lv, 2010).


In 1978, China started a series of economic reforms. These included opening the country to foreign investment and encouraging small business development. Reform measures were put into effect to increase industrial productivity. These reforms were successful. The country could produce a rich supply of goods that were previously restricted. However, there were no systems in place to evaluate product quality and safety. Thus, inferior products were made by cutting corners to increase profits. Due to the lack of consumer protection laws, consumers had no formal recourse to protect themselves. This lack of consumer protection led to dissatisfaction among Chinese consumers. With increasing complaints from consumers and no national consumer protections, some local authorities began to respond to the need for safeguards. Local consumer associations emerged in Xinle, Guangzhou, and Haerbin in 1983 (Yao, 2008).

In 1984, the China Consumers Association (CCA) was established. This was the first national consumer protection organization aimed at protecting the rights and interests of consumers, which was a landmark for modern consumer protection (Sun, 2010). However, the CCA had limitations. It was not widely known in the country for the first few years, and its effect was very limited. When consumers encountered unsatisfactory situations, the CCA might fail to provide effective protections to consumers. Therefore, the people began expressing their frustration through extreme behaviors. In 1987, for example, more than 5,000 pairs of poor quality shoes from Wenzhou were burned by consumers in the downtown of Hangzhou. There was a call for all Wenzhou shoes in the whole country to be burned. In response, many shops posted signs letting consumers know that Wenzhou shoes were not sold in their stores. The shoe burning brought attention to the need for consumer protection and reinvigorated the consumer movement nationwide (Lu, 2008).

On September 13, 1987, the CCA expanded its strength as a consumer protection group by joining the International Organization of Consumers Unions (IOCU). The IOCU is an independent, non-profit organization without any political affiliations. The IOCU provides protection to consumers around the world (Sun, 2010).

By the end of 1990, 25 provincial consumer associations and 1,900 regional and municipal consumer associations were established under the CCA. The CCA and local consumer associations jointly handled consumer lawsuits to fight against violations of consumer interests and rights. They also offered consumer education to the public. Thus, the CCA and local agents were well accepted and supported by the people (Liang, 1991).

March 15, 1991 marked the first National Consumer Rights Day. Annually, this day is celebrated and is known as 3.15 in China. Since 1991, China Central Television (CCTV) used this event to expose the worst company practices in China and bring attention to issues of consumer protection and awareness to the public (Henanfood Network, 2013).

During the early 1990s, low-quality products flooded the market. Fraudulent business practices were common. Knowing and buying fake products had become a topic of debate in many academic circles (Jinghua Times, 2014).

Despite protection efforts by the CCA, there was no statutory foundation for consumer protections until 1993 when the Consumer Rights and Interests Protection Law became the legal basis for the protection of rights and interests of the consumer (Feng & Lin, 2014). For the first time, issues of fraud were directly addressed. The Consumers Rights and Interests Protection Law is a landmark in the history of Chinese consumer rights protection. Consumer rights and protection had legal support for the first time. In the next few years, supplementary rules and regulations to the consumer rights and protection law were continually introduced and improved (Yao, 2008).

The CCA and CCTV carried out yearly activities with special topics since 1997. Every topic was based on consumer rights and interests of specific concern that year. These topics covered a wide range of issues including product safety, privacy rights protection, unfair business practices, fraud, and consumer and business interactions. The CCA and CCTV used these consumer themes to address issues and significantly strengthen protections. Thus, systematic changes occurred. The three most outstanding progresses were: increased media involvement in the consumer movement, the emerging of new consumer rights leaders, and the development of further consumer self-protections (Peng, 1999; Yang, 2009).

First, the CCTV, along with all provincial and municipal television and radio stations, dedicated time to explore market fraud, product defects, and consumer protection warnings. The increased use of television and radio allowed for larger segments of Chinese society to be educated and informed about consumer issues and rights protections (Yang, 2009).

Second, some of the new consumer interests and rights protection advocates became media celebrities or leaders. These celebrities led the movement through vocal endorsements and opinions. Other community leaders developed celebrity status due to their passion for consumer interests and rights protection. These celebrities had legal, media, political, and economic knowledge. They could clearly express the needs of the movement and advocate for further reform (Peng, 1999).

Finally, there was a surge in consumer self-protection behaviors. There existed a correlation between media coverages and increases in consumer self-protection. The more the media showed the consumer ways to protect their own interests, the more the consumer was willing to act. When there was more media education, for instance, there were more consumer lawsuits filed. This increase in consumer self-protection was a bridge to further success in the consumer movement (Peng, 1999).

Current Consumer Movement---Continuing Progress with Challenges (after 2000)

After 2000, there was the development of significant safeguards for consumer interests and rights protection. The “12315” administrative law enforcement system was established which created a formal complaint reporting network. The "12315" was a telephone network for the whole country. It became a famous consumer interests and rights protection symbol (Yao, 2008).
The protection of consumer interests and rights protection continued to evolve and develop. Further safeguards were established and extended to real estate business, medical advertising, management, finance, and online consumption. A series of laws and regulations were introduced. These laws regulated drugs, cosmetics, health, imports, exports, product quality, sanitation, trademarks, and advertisement (Feng & Lin, 2014).

China’s first Consumer Rights Law was revised in 2014. The new Consumer Rights Law attempted to bring the law up to date. The revisions were designed so that legal standards were in line with modern business practices. Thus, the administrative, social, and judicial protection framework for consumer interests and rights protection was fully formed (Zhang, 2015).

Currently, there are more than 3,000 consumer associations across the country. More than 26,000 branches were established in rural areas. These organizations handle consumer complaints, negotiate with companies on behalf of consumers, and help consumers to recoup their losses. These groups also engage in legal advocacy. They also attempt to provide input in the formulation of laws and policies. They advocate for the improved status of consumers, help consumers achieve healthy consumptions of goods, raise consumer consciousness, and carry out oversight of qualities of commodities and services. These groups pay attention to commodity inspection and government standards to strengthen international cooperation in consumer interests and rights protection (Wang, 2010).

Despite these active consumer interests and rights protection groups, there remain challenges of consumer protection. The five primary challenges to the current consumer movement are the following.

First, consumers lack a sufficient understanding of the protections available to them. Phoenix Network (2015) completed a survey of consumer attitudes of the Chinese people. The results showed that 18% of respondents did not use consumer protection laws. Twelve percent of people did not report problems to the “12315” consumer complaints hotlines when they encountered infringement. Twenty-five percent of respondents did not know the “12315” complaints telephone number. That means that there are still many consumers who are not aware of their rights or how to seek protection when their rights have been violated. However, most consumers did not think they were responsible for rights protection. Most consumers felt consumer protection should be provided by the government. These people believed more should be done by the government through legislation and law enforcement (Lin, 2012).

Second, consumer protection is not being utilized by all consumers equally. According to data from the court in Yuexiu District, Guangzhou, 712 lawsuits were filed during the first two weeks after the new consumer protection law was implemented in 2014. About 95% of those lawsuits were from professionals, only five percent of the lawsuits were from non-professionals. According to Xinhua Network (2015), data in Nanjing demonstrated similar demographic trends. It showed the lack of consumer interests and rights protection awareness by most Chinese consumers. Historically, the consumer movement was galvanized by the people. Active participation and a desire for self-protection sustained the movement. The government responded to the will of the people. The government did not meet the people’s needs until the masses were vocal.
and organized. Weak awareness of interests and rights protection by all consumers remains a current challenge of the modern consumer movement (Lin, 2012).

Third, technological advances also challenge consumer interests and rights protection. With the rapid development of internet technology, the scale of China's online transactions continues to grow. Along with this rapid growth, the number of internet service problems has also increased. Problems, such as fraud, lack of online consumer protection, lack of consumer privacy, lack of transaction security, and problems with product refunds or consumer services need to be addressed both technically and morally (Liu & Qin, 2016).

Fourth, challenges in consumer financial rights protection also exist. Internet banking has created an increase in consumer financial disputes. Financial consumer interests and rights protection and risk prevention are facing more and more challenges. Consumers are engaging in internet banking without sufficient financial knowledge or the ability to identify risk. Also, there is a lack of financial policies, laws, and regulations about internet financial products and services. Challenges remain regarding how regulatory agencies can develop policies to promote regulatory efficiency and consumer protection (Jiao, 2014).

Finally, consumer policies do not reflect the move towards China’s engagement in a global economic system. The move towards an increased international exchange of goods and services has generated many international consumer issues, such as rights protection on imported products. With the high flow of goods and services internationally, regulation and development of international quality standards must also be addressed. Also, price differentials between domestic and international commodity must be explored. Environmental pollution, food and drug safety, energy depletion, and education are all factors that need to be examined. These factors are challenges to the evolution of the consumer interests and rights protection initiatives in the imminent future (Xu, 2014).

Conclusion

China has a long consumer movement history. In the years before the foundation of the PRC, the consumer movement was characterized by boycotting foreign goods and advocating domestic goods. This populist movement was a way for the Chinese people to exert power over foreign aggression.

The reform and economic development of the 1970s was the catalyst for the consumer protection movement. The development of production that relies on market supply and demand created an increase in household income. This increase in income significantly influenced the country's increase in consumerism. However, the low quality, bad service, and other defects from the supply side constantly harmed the interests of the consumer. Also, there was an increased awareness that opening the country’s market without quality standards would discourage foreign investment. All these factors prompted the development of consumer protection organizations and legislations. The movement was supported by an awareness of the people, support of the government, and the development of statutory law. The people, government, and law worked jointly to promote the rapid development of China’s consumer movement.

The consumer movement was later characterized by developing safeguards. By seeking social help and legal protection, consumers in China were provided with their
first consumer protections. These protections advanced the Chinese consumer movement. This was the first step towards the development of a statutory foundation for the movement.

Rapid technological development and economic globalization are new challenges to China's consumer movement. Current consumer protection legislation lags behind technologic and economic developments. Current policy and legal reforms are insufficient to address these growing trends. Education regarding consumer interests and rights protection is insufficient. Education of the populace is critically important. The Chinese consumers are called upon to exert their rights. They can no longer defer to the government for rights protection. Solutions must come from ordinary citizens who will take responsibility for the further advancement of the consumer protection movement.

References


