Name of Publication: NATIONAL SOCIAL SCIENCE JOURNAL
Issue: Volume 48 # 1 ISSN 2154-1736
Frequency: Quarterly
Offices of Publication: National Social Science Association
Mailing Address
2020 Hills Lake Drive
El Cajon, CA 92020

Office Address:
9131 Fletcher Parkway, Suite 119
La Mesa, CA 91942

On Line journals: http://nssa.us
E-mail address: natsoesci@aol.com; nssal@cox.net

The National Social Science Journal is being abstracted in: Cabell's Directory; Eric Clearinghouse; EBSCO, Economic Abstracts; Historical Abstracts; Index to Periodical Articles; Social Science Source; Social Science Index; Sociological Abstracts; the University Reference System.

We wish to thank all authors for the licensing of the articles. And we wish to thank all those who have reviewed these articles for publication

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Unported License.

Editor, Barba Patton

EDITORIAL BOARD

Editorial Board:
Nancy Adams., Lamar University
Stanley Alexander, Suffolk County Community College
Mark Bellnap, Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University
Richard Bieker, Delaware State University
Benita Bruster, Austin Peay University
Sue Burum, Minnesota State University, Mankato
Jose da Cruz, Armstrong Atlantic State University
Robert Dewhirst, Northwest Missouri State University
Amy Shriver Dreussi, University of Akron
Talitha Hudgins, Utah Valley University
James Mbuva, National University
Barbara Peterson, Austin Peay University
Pegly Vaz, Fort Hays State University
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>K-12 LGBTQ Student Support: What Pre-service Teachers Currently Know or Want to Know</td>
<td>Kelly M. Benson, Donald K. Wattam, Rory A. Weishaar, Central Washington University</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Personhood: The Implications for Business, People, and Society</td>
<td>Georgia Holmes, Sue Burum Minnesota State University, Mankato</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Development of a Pre-Test and Post-Test Assessment Survey for an Introduction to Cultural Anthropology Course</td>
<td>Sean M. Daley, William McFarlane, Johnson County Community College Qing Yu, Christine M. Daley, Byron Gajewski, University of Kansas Medical Center</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: Preparing for College Success</td>
<td>Rebecca S. Davis, Kathie Good, Eastern New Mexico University</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 10-Year Linear Gender Equity and Salary-Trend Study: A Glance at Superintendents’ Pathway to the Superintendency</td>
<td>Beth Gregory, Missouri Western State University</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mapping Knowledge: Teaching and Learning Tools</td>
<td>Taralynn Hartsell, The University of Southern Mississippi</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Inquiry into the International Distribution of Anti-Environmentalism Sentiment</td>
<td>Allen F. Ketcham, Texas A&amp;M University—Kingsville Jeffrey T. Schulz, Central Community College—Grand Island</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Admiral, The Mayor, and the General: The Battle of New Orleans, 1862</td>
<td>William M. Kirtley, Central Texas College Patricia M. Kirtley, Independent Scholar</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I’ll Drink To That (And Post It On Twitter)!: A Case-Study of Small Business Product Placement in Social Networking Marketing Plans</td>
<td>Shannon M. Leinen, Concordia University, Nebraska</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As our nation is seeing the number of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and questioning (LGBTQ) students growing, K-12 public schools are facing the need for increased awareness, inclusive curricula, and welcoming environments which address violence, discrimination, and equity. Currently, U.S. teacher education programs fail to adequately address this need. In response to these ever-changing demographics and to achieve equity, more socially just classroom training is needed in teacher preparation programs across our country.

Do schools care? According to Watson (2012), schools contribute greatly to the mindset of isolation and stigmatization many LGBTQ students experience, noting even with an increased awareness, LGBTQ students continue to face severe social, legal and institutional discrimination across our nation. The prevalence of homophobic language along with discomfort amongst teachers regarding LGBTQ issues, intervention, and the use of LGBTQ-infused curriculum prevail (Watson, 2012) as do the complex issues teachers are expected to face and remedy in their schools (Milburn & Palladino, 2012).

When looking at the knowledge, skills and dispositions of pre-service teachers, Milburn and Palladino (2012) found pre-service teachers are lacking an understanding of LGBTQ issues, were reluctant to confront problems, and had an inability to act effectively. Dispositions make a difference in teaching success and academic achievement (Singh, et al., 2008), so much so that NCATE accreditation requires teacher education programs to measure them (Brock, et al., 2008). In higher education, dispositions are featured in studies of student and faculty engagement and faculty success. However, there is little consensus regarding how to identify, define, influence or assess dispositions (Notar, Riley, Taylor, Thornburg, & Cargill, 2009). There is open criticism of their plausibility, especially when used to address interaction problems without establishing advanced criteria, which can create litigation vulnerability. Further, there are theoretically-based working definitions of dispositions developed by professional groups (Katz, et al., 2008) such as the Interstate New Teacher Assessment Support Consortium (InTASC), a consortium of state education agencies and national organizations devoted to the reform of teacher preparation, licensing, and sustained professional development of teachers (InTASC, 2013). With only three percent of America’s teachers Board certified and more than a decade of research, the National Board for Professional Teacher Standards (NBPTS) is diligent in its aim to ensure teacher preparation and practice supports all students equitably. The target is to transform pre-service teachers into accomplished practitioners (NBPTS, 2015). Given that teacher preparation programs are inconsistent in their identification of, and influence on, dispositions (Diez, 2007), there is a pressing need to address this disconnect for teacher training programs which target LGBTQ awareness, inclusive curriculum and educational dispositions leading to healthy development for LGBTQ students.

With a growing need for teacher preparation programs to both measure and assess effective teaching, Mark Wasicsko, Director of the National Network for the Study of Educator Dispositions (NNSED), states “There’s research going back more than 50 years that shows there are dispositions that have a
positive effect on student success” (Hallam, 2009, p. 27). Because not all dispositions are favorable, teacher prep programs must strive to strengthen effective LGBTQ teaching dispositions which lead to LGBTQ student success and minimize those dispositions which are less desirable.

The literature is replete with negative experiences of LGBTQ students and unsafe school environments detrimental to their social, emotional, and academic success. We often see the needs of LGBTQ youth being marginalized, ignored or unnoticed throughout our nation’s schools (Milburn & Palladino, 2012). The emotional stress from this victimization negatively impacts the lives of LGBTQ students resulting in truancy, lower academic success, anxiety, depression, substance abuse, self-harm, and suicidal ideation/suicide attempts often aligned with concurrent at-risk behaviors such as drug and alcohol abuse and unsafe sexual activities (Milburn, et. al., 2012).

LGBT students and athletes also continuing to feel unsafe attending physical education classes and athletic events where they are least protected or supported. Homophobia is a frequently used term to describe this irrational fear of lesbians and gay men (Barber & Krane, 2007). Barber, et. al. posited if homophobia is learned, it can be unlearned or not learned. Although change can occur, perceived barriers persist in physical education and athletics where sexual orientation and gender identity silence continues to be pervasive and a climate of paralysis and lack of concern exist.

Looking to gain an understanding of the perceptions of Gay-Straight Alliance (GSA) youth advisors regarding lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, and questioning (LGBTQQ) youth in California schools, Spitz (2012) found a lack of training appeared to be the greatest contributing factor hampering the perceptions of a positive school climate for LGBTQQ students with a less than ideal advocacy of LGBTQQ students. An earlier study by McCready (2004) illuminated the additional detrimental impact of racial segregation and the unique challenges schools face in inner-city schools where the majority of students come from low-socioeconomic, non-white and non-English language speaking backgrounds.

In an attempt to analyze school climate changes over time and glean a better understanding of what LGBT students experience in K-12 schools across the nation, the Gay, Lesbian & Straight Education Network (GLSEN) surveyed our nation’s students using the 2011 National School Climate Survey (NSCS) (GLSEN, 2012). Their report told a startling story about the experiences of LGBT youth in our nation’s schools. In particular GLSEN’s research documents the fundamental struggles LGBT students’ experience in K-12 education. For more than a decade GLSEN’s research examined experiences of LGBT students with regard to indicators for negative climate. Of the 8,584 participants between the ages of 13 and 20 in grades 6 - 12, two thirds of the respondents were white (67.9%), almost half (49.6%) female, and over half (61.3%) identified as gay or lesbian. Key findings for biased remarks revealed nearly 85% of students heard “gay” used in a negative way, almost 62% heard negative remarks about gender expression, and approximately 57% heard homophobic remarks from their teachers and other school staff.

When looking at school safety and experiences of harassment and assault (GLSEN, 2012), students reported: 63.5% felt unsafe because of their sexual orientation, and 43.9% because of their gender expression, 81.9% were verbally harassed, 55.2% experienced electronic harassment, and 38.3% were physically harassed or physically assaulted (18.3%). The indicator findings for absenteeism were also problematic, revealing almost 30% of students experienced absenteeism due to an unsafe or hostile environment. This high incidence of harassment and assault was noted to further be exacerbated by school staff who, according to the GLSEN report, rarely, if ever, interceded on behalf of LGBT students; thus, denying them their right to an education.

The microcosms in school cultures mirror that of societal biases towards LGBTQ individuals. As LGBTQ students are affected, we see the same effect on heterosexual teachers and administrators who advocate for LGBT students (Schneider & Dimito, 2008). Often LGBT teachers, and sometimes heterosexual teachers, feel as though they will be at risk if they address LGBT discrimination and issues, fearing association repercussions.

GLSEN, perhaps the leading national education organization focused on ensuring safe and affirming schools for all students, recently released their 2015 report From Statehouse to Schoolhouse: Anti-Bullying Policy Efforts in U.S. States and School Districts (Kull, Kosciw, & Greytak, 2015).
This research examined anti-bullying policies in 13,181 Kindergarten through 12th grade school districts across our nation. They looked at how state laws affect policies at the district level. More specifically, whether district policies protect students on the basis of personal characteristics such as sexual orientation, gender identity/expression, race and religion and whether anti-bullying professional development for educators is required. Of importance is their conclusion that less than one third of school districts nationwide (30.3%) required any accountability; only 3% of all school districts included policies addressing enumeration regarding LGBT students, professional development, or accountability; and only two in ten required professional training for staff or accountability for bullying incidents. Only a shocking 2% of all school districts across the nation provided all three elements – enumeration, professional development, and accountability. Even with this knowledge, little research is available on the protection school districts provide for LGBT students as some school districts identify themselves as having anti-bullying policies and supportive of LGBT students, but may or may not address the improvement of LGBT students’ educational experiences, supporting a critical need for teacher education programs to provide training for pre-service teachers.

New teachers enter the workforce ill prepared to be effective advocates for their LGTBQ students, lacking in the necessary skills, dispositions and knowledge to support students as well as general resources to address gender identity bullying in schools. This research study of preservice teachers, while looking to identify perceived inclusion needs of LGTBQ students in K-12 classrooms, further addressed training desires of preservice teachers from three colleges of a large regional comprehensive university in Washington. This teacher education program leading to Washington state teacher certification, currently serves 35 endorsement areas and is the largest program in the State of Washington. The specific research questions examined in this study were twofold:

1. to assess the preparation pre-service teachers received regarding the inclusion of LGBTQ students in classrooms; and
2. to ask what LGTBQ topics preservice teachers would like to learn about to best support the needs of LGTBQ students.

Are preservice teachers garnering knowledge about inclusion, and if not, what would they like to learn? As teacher educators, we need to provide appropriate education and training for future teachers to handle inclusion issues that will most certainly come up during their careers.

**Methodology**

**Context of the Study**

Recent societal developments and the emergence and acceptance of LGBT individuals inspired this study. In a few short years there has been great progress with the inclusion of LGBT youth in sport. Our desire was to explore places of opportunity for pre-service K-12 practitioners to further expand educational programs and areas of professional development.

**Participants of This Study**

The participants for the current study were enrolled as undergraduate or graduate students at a comprehensive public university located in the Northwest portion of the United States. Participants included fifty-nine (59) pre-service teacher candidates.

Demographics of those who responded to the survey showed fourteen (14) males and fifty-four (54) females whose median age was 22 (the youngest being 19 and the oldest being 45). Fifty-six (56) of the students’ sexual identities were listed as Straight while three (3) reported themselves as Bisexual, all female. As for students’ degree objectives, fifty-two (52) were seeking bachelor’s degrees, seven (7) were post-baccalaureate/certification.

**Materials and Procedures**

The researchers, through reviewing the literature, developed an 11 question open-ended survey. For purposes of this paper, we focused on two of the survey questions which dealt with the participants’ foundational beliefs and their knowledge of school resources. The survey questions were sent out to two individuals with expertise in this area to review and offer suggested revisions. One reviewer was a female school administrator and mother of a gay son, and the second reviewer was a gay male teacher and coach.
Once revisions were incorporated into the survey, using Qualtrics the survey was distributed electronically to all students enrolled in the selected courses.

Student responses to the survey questions remained anonymous as the authors only looked at aggregated data. Students were provided the opportunity to opt-out of the survey at any time, or to skip questions for which they did not wish to respond.

After the surveys were completed, the authors used qualitative research protocol to arrive at coded themes for each question or prompt and then disaggregated the data per degree objectives. Only anecdotal attention was given to the seven respondents who reported their sexual identities as bisexual because the authors were looking for data that would give them the “big picture” about LGBTQ perceptions among pre-service teachers, pre-service school administrators, pre-service athletic administrators, and coaching course students.

### Results

In order to ascertain how pre-service teachers can support LGBTQ students in the future, we must first find out what training and education they have so far in their programs or at schools where they may have completed practicums. Our focus for this paper included two research questions. The first question was “Describe any training you have received with regard to the inclusion of LGBTQ students in your university classes.” The second question was more exploratory so the researchers could begin accumulating information for program or coursework additions or changes. The question was “As a novice teacher, what topics regarding LGBTQ would you like to learn more about?”

We will begin with the first question noted above. After coding, there are four responses that were most prevalent. These are noted below from most respondents to fewest respondents. There were no certain outliers evident in the responses. The results, including demographics for students, are as follow:

Twenty-four (24) of the surveyed pre-service teacher responses landed in the category of “Little to no training.” This included nineteen (19) females and five (5) males who all consider themselves “straight.” Twenty-two (22) of the students were baccalaureates and two (2) were post-baccalaureates. Noted comments within this category are noted below:

- 22 year-old male baccalaureate student: “I do not think I have training. Is their special training needed? They don’t necessarily have a language or a learning disability. They can perform all the same academic skills and requirements as everyone else in their classes”
- 21 year-old female baccalaureate student: “I have hardly any training in this area, which might be due to the fact that I am Early Elementary Education, and the need in that area is not as high as upper level education.”
- 23 year-old male post-baccalaureate student: “I had a 5th grader come out and say that he liked boys but he knew it was ‘wrong’ and had a hard time accepting the fact. The teacher and I worked together to get the student comfortable with their own skin and to help accept the parts of themselves that make them unique and fantastic. In high school, we had LGBTQ discussion boards where students would be able to go to a judgment free zone and discussion questions and educate themselves about the topics.”

The second coded category about any training students might have had in their university courses was “Some exposure in their multicultural education class,” seventeen (17) surveyed students had answers that ended up falling within here. Six (6) respondents were male and eleven (11) were female. Of the seventeen, two (2) students are bisexual. There are fourteen (14) baccalaureate students and three (3) post-baccalaureate students. Noted comments are below:

- 27 year-old “straight” male post-baccalaureate student: “we learned more about different cultures, there needs to be more training for LGBTQ students to aid in my attempts at inclusion. I would gladly welcome any!”
- 24 year-old “straight” female post-baccalaureate student: “Very little briefly talked about in Multicultural Education Course.”
For the next coded area, six (6) students did respond that they had specific LGBTQ training. Of the six students, four (4) were female and the other two (2) male. All six students consider themselves “straight,” and only one (1) student was post-baccalaureate. There are three responses noted here:

- 21 year-old male baccalaureate student: “I received two class sessions worth of training, but the main focus was awareness and awareness of the privileges that I have as a straight person.”
- 21 year-old female post-baccalaureate student: “Just a class with the leader of the Diversity Center [at our college].”
- 22 year-old female baccalaureate student: “I have received some training in pronoun usage and what certain terms may exist.”

In the final coded area, five (5) female students (baccalaureate students with one being bisexual) responded with comments about “safe space” or student safety. One student (19 year-old “straight” female) wrote, “Safe Space…on campus and gave a 2-day presentation on LGBTQIA+ students.”

Not as easily coded due to its open-ended nature, are the researchers’ second survey question for this paper: “As a novice teacher, what topics regarding LGBTQ would you like to learn more about?” There were, however, five coded themes and then “Outliers or other.”

The coded theme for nineteen (19) of the students’ responses revolved around “Resources, training and keeping LGBTQ students safe.” Fifteen (15) of the respondents were female and four (4) male. Only one student of this group was post-baccalaureate, and sixteen (16) noted they were “straight”, while the others (3) consider themselves bisexual. Two responses from this theme are noted below:

- 24 year-old “straight” male baccalaureate student: “Any wants and needs that those students feel may differ from the norm, and maybe just more information on how LGBTQ played a roll [sic] in my curriculum, it would be nice to know more authors that vary from the typical white, straight male.”
- 20 year-old “straight” male post-baccalaureate student: “I would like more a resource set given to me so that I would not have to create one myself. No topic about LGBTQIA+ particularly interests me.”

There are ten (10) responses coded to the theme of “Appropriate language or pronoun use for classroom discussions.” There were an equal number of male and female respondents and all ten considered themselves “straight.” Of the ten, eight (8) were baccalaureate students and the other two (2) post-baccalaureate students. Here are two noted responses for this theme:

- 21 year-old male post-baccalaureate student: “What the proper things to say to them so I don’t offend them.”
- 22 year-old male post-baccalaureate student: “pronoun use and how much offense is taken when the wrong pronoun is used.”

The next coded theme focused more on “Training about legal issues, privacy issues, and policies surrounding LGBTQ.” Eight (8) respondents considered themselves “straight” with five (5) being female and three (3) male. The baccalaureate and post-baccalaureate numbers were even at four each. Some noted responses are as follow:

- 22 year-old male post-baccalaureate student: “I guess legally, if I were to treat an LGBTQ student the same as everyone else (a gen ed student) can I be liable for not making accommodations? Technically they do not by law require special accommodations or modifications.”
- 22 year-old male post-baccalaureate student: “I would like to know how much we are allowed to talk to other students about it. We talk about diversity, but if we bring in books with different families will heterosexual families be upset?”
- 21 year-old male post-baccalaureate student: “I would specifically like to learn about the intersex gender and how school policy relates to student who are intersex. For example, what resources are the schools equipped with to help the student”
- 24 year-old female post-baccalaureate student: “I would like to learn more about whether or not LGBTQ acknowledgement or their LGBTQ status, or whether or not they want to pretend
nothing is different. I would also like to learn about the possible legal implications of discussing LGBTQ matters within my classroom.”

- 22 year-old male baccalaureate student: “ Regards to course of action with conflicting clothing policies.”

A fourth coded theme with eight (8) respondents was about “How to work with or relate to students who are questioning.” All eight students’ respondents are “straight” with six (6) being female and only two (2) males. Seven (7) students are baccalaureate. One noted response from this theme came from a 22 year-old male baccalaureate student. He wrote, “I would like to learn more about the psychological issues that come about from this topic and how to be a better listener to student in order to better supply support of students.”

Before getting to the “Outliers or other,” it should be noted that three of the respondents (two male and one female – all “straight”) wrote that they did not want to learn anything more about LGBTQ. Two simply wrote “none,” but one student (23 year-old female baccalaureate student) wrote, “None. I don’t think that I should provide any kind of special treatment for LGBTQ students just as I wouldn’t provide special treatment for any of my students. Sexual orientation does not affect learning styles or intelligence therefore I don’t believe I need any special education on how to teach LGBTQ students. I would and will teach them the same inclusion, consideration, and care as I would and will with ALL of my students.”

Finally, due to the open-ended nature of the research question, here are some noted responses that did not quite fit into one of the themes, or perhaps fit into several for possible placement (and so it is noted here).

- 26 year-old “straight” male baccalaureate student: “I would like to get to know more people that struggle with their sexuality. I’ve never known someone well that is open about their struggles with sexuality.”
- 22 year-old “straight” male baccalaureate student: “Why it is becoming prominent.”
- 22 year-old “straight” male post-baccalaureate student: “What exactly am I required to teach on this subject in my primary grades?”
- 21 year-old “straight” male baccalaureate student: “If you can help me understand how the brain decides you are going to be LGBTQ that would be great. Otherwise incorporate strategies like the LGBTQ book I discussed a few questions ago.”

Recommendations

Results from both questions indicate that pre-service teachers need more training and education that is LGBTQ specific. In order for future educators to feel informed and ready to address LGBTQ students, or issues surrounding LGBTQ students, the post-secondary institute (the researches’ institute in this case) must decide where training and education belongs in the pedagogy. Currently there is very little education or training through the Multicultural Education course of which many respondents noted.

A few survey respondents commented or questioned whether or not LGBTQ education or training is needed for primary level educators. However, research indicates that some primary grade students are questioning and it may be important for primary level teachers to have education and training should those questioning students approach their teachers about personal feelings. In addition, parents of questioning primary level children, may ask the school’s teachers to comply with their children’s sexual orientation preferences (if opposite of their birth gender) as they search for self-discover.

Pre-service educators, no matter what level, indicate they need reliable resources, training about legal and policy issues surrounding LGBTQ, and how to work with and relate to LGBTQ students, including understanding correct language and pronoun use. It is recommended that this university (and others perhaps), consider curricula or trainings to help pre-service teachers have comprehensive understanding of LGBTQ issues, legalities, and possible school code questions once they acquire their first jobs.
References


Corporate Personhood: The Implications for Business, People, and Society.

Georgia Holmes, Sue Burum
Minnesota State University, Mankato

In a headnote to the case of Santa Clara County v. Southern Pacific Railroad, J.C. Bancroft Davis, a Supreme Court reporter and former railroad president, noted:

Before argument Mr. Chief Justice Waite said: “The court does not wish to hear argument on the question whether the provision in the Fourteenth Amendment to the Constitution, which forbids a State to deny to any person within its jurisdiction the equal protection of the laws, applies to these corporations. We are all of opinion that it does.” (Jorezak, 2014).

This statement raises an important question – are corporations just as much persons as natural people and should they enjoy all the protections and freedoms held by natural persons? This paper will examine the history of corporate personhood, which is far more nuanced than this incorrect headnote implies, from the days of Chief Justice John Marshall (1801-1835) to Citizens United (Citizens, 2010), Hobby Lobby (Burwell, 2014), and now to the potential implications from Obergefell v. Hodges (Obergefell, 2015). The paper will also examine the reasons corporations might want these rights and other rights that could be contained in corporate personhood. Finally, this paper will consider the potential implications to corporations, society, and people if corporate personhood is allowed to continue and expand. These writers question if a corporation should have all the rights of a natural person. These writers will also suggest that, if corporations are given all rights of a natural person, they should lose some protections from being incorporated. If corporations can enjoy the rights of natural people, they should be subject to the same civil and criminal liabilities in the exercise of those rights.

Development of Corporate Personhood

In early colonial times and after the revolution, original corporate charters were given by the crown or state. Therefore, the crown or state was in control of the corporation. Corporations were considered artificial beings created to advance public interests. They were legal constructs to facilitate commerce and make it possible for corporations to hold property, enter into contracts, and sue and be sued. In England and in colonial America, corporations were extensions of the government. They were a type of delegated jurisdiction under the King and, later, the state’s exclusive prerogative (Guisado, 2015). One early British trading company was the East India Company, which functioned as an early version of a for-profit business with investors who shared in the profits. However, it also operated as a vehicle to extend the military and political power of the British government and to act as a bank that could lend money to the monarchy. To maintain control of the business, the monarchy granted exclusive charters for this and other corporations for only a specified time period, thereby ensuring the monarchy’s ability to renegotiate terms (Coates, 2015). This practice of issuing exclusive charters continued in early America and until the middle of the nineteenth century in the United States. Eventually, public opinion turned against the exclusivity and cronyism that resulted. The public was very anti-monopolistic and in
favor of the regulation of business (Guisado, 2015). New York passed the first general law of incorporation in 1811. The issuing of corporate charters became a ministerial governmental function. But government also began to regulate and control the life of the corporation through the charters (Coates, 2015). This began a period of hyper-regulation where states began to control all aspects of the life of the corporation (Guisado, 2015). An early case considering the rights of corporations was *Dartmouth College v. Woodward* (Dartmouth, 1819). In 1769, the British crown granted a charter to the trustees of the college. Later, the state of New Hampshire tried to force the college to become a public institution and placed the ability to appoint trustees in the hands of the state legislature. The U.S. Supreme Court cited the Constitution in concluding, “no State shall make any law impairing the obligation of contracts.” The charter was not dissolved by the revolution and the state could not take over the college. The Court stated, “A corporation is an artificial being, invisible, intangible, and existing only in contemplation of law. Being the mere creature of law, it possesses only those properties which the charter of its creation confers upon it” (Dartmouth, 1819). The Court did not say that corporations do not have constitutional rights. The Court, in fact, held that the corporation was entitled to protection under the Contracts Clause. This was the first time the Supreme Court recognized that corporations may exercise a right of a natural person.

During the nineteenth century, the territory of the United States, as well as its people and businesses, expanded. New Jersey began a push to deregulate by allowing corporations to purchase stock in other corporations. Other states began to follow New Jersey’s lead so as not to lose business to the other states. This began a shift in thinking from the idea that a corporation was an artificial entity belonging to the state to the idea that a corporation owed its existence to the people who formed it (Guisado, 2015). These individuals contracted with each other to organize and utilize a corporation for their mutual benefit. This began the aggregate theory of corporate personhood and started an anti-regulatory approach to corporate law. The rights and duties of corporations were the rights and duties of the people who composed it. The corporation was not a separate entity because the corporation could not exist without the individuals in it. Individuals created the corporation for their own benefit, not the benefit of the public.

This approach can be seen in the Supreme Court’s decision in *Santa Clara County v. Southern Pacific Railroad* (Santa Clara County, 1886). This 1886 case concerned the taxation of railroad properties. Multiple railroad corporations alleged that California’s state and local governments violated the Fourteenth Amendment’s Due Process and Equal Protection clauses by taxing railroad property differently from that of natural citizens. The Court’s decision never addressed corporate personhood or whether the protections of the Fourteenth Amendment should extend to corporations. The Court decided in favor of the railroads because the taxes were improperly levied under the California state constitution. Justice Harlan explained in the decision that there was no need to reach the Fourteenth Amendment claims. The inaccurate heading, which was not a part of any opinion in the case, became the precedent for the case. Was Mr. Davis, the writer of the headnote, mistaken or did he deliberately misinterpret the decision? Chief Justice Waite fell ill and died before the opinion was published. Therefore, we may never know. Conspiracy-types blame Justice Stephen Johnson Field. He was a railroad attorney and the fifth Chief Justice of California before becoming a Justice on the Supreme Court in 1863. He advocated for corporate personhood throughout his career, and some believe he may have influenced Mr. Davis (Jorezak, 2014). Regardless, the case now stands for the idea that a corporation is a person for Fourteenth Amendment purposes and a corporation’s property cannot be taxed differently from that of a natural person. If this were the true holding in the case, it would be an example of the aggregate theory because the rights and duties of an incorporated association would be the same as the rights and duties of the people who were in the association, not the rights of an imaginary being.

In 1888, Justice Field wrote the Supreme Court opinion in *Pembina Consolidated Silver Mining Co. v. Commonwealth of Pennsylvania* (Pembina, 1888) in which a Colorado mining company tried to avoid Pennsylvania’s licensing and tax requirements on out-of-state
corporations that did business in the state. While affirming Pennsylvania’s right to regulate out-of-state corporations, Justice Field wrote, “Under the [Fourteenth Amendment’s] designation of a person there is no doubt that a private corporation is included.” He went on to explain that the equal protection that corporations “may claim is only such that is accorded to similar associations within the jurisdiction of the State.” Nothing in the Constitution prohibited a state from “discriminating in the privileges it may grant to foreign corporations” (Pembina, 1888). Taken together, the opinion says in-state corporations should be taxed the same. Out-of-state corporations may be taxed more, but the tax must be the same for all of the out-of-state corporations. Thus, Equal Protection applies to corporations, but what is allowed depends upon which group the corporation belongs to.

The turn of the twentieth century produced another shift in thinking concerning corporations. Corporations increased in number and size. This led to the idea that corporations were conceptually and legally distinct from investors, managers, and others involved in the operation of the corporation. Corporations were no longer tied to the few investors who created them. The corporation itself was now an entity. It was neither an artificial entity nor a sum of its parts. It was a full-fledged, living, real entity that had its own personality. It had “a collective consciousness or collective will that results from discussions and compromises among the individual members, and may not reflect the particular preferences of any one person” (Guisado, 2015). The corporate entity should, then, have the same rights as people, given that corporations also had to answer for their own debts and torts. Corporate legal rights and responsibilities increased under this approach.

**Personal Rights Currently Possessed By Corporations**

Corporations have First Amendment speech and press rights. In 1936, in *Grosjean v. American Press Co* (Grosjean, 1936), the Supreme Court recognized Freedom of the Press rights for publishers, broadcasters, and advocacy organizations. The Huey Long administration in Louisiana levied a separate tax on newspapers with a circulation over 20,000. The tax was an attempt to tax newspapers critical of the administration into silence. The unanimous Court held that corporations were persons and possessed Freedom of Press rights. In 1978, in *First National Bank of Boston v. Bellotti* (First, 1978), the Supreme Court held that corporations have a Freedom of Speech right to make contributions in ballot initiative campaigns. Massachusetts tried to bar several corporations, including the bank, from contributing in a ballot initiative as the state concluded that the corporations were trying to influence the election. The Court concluded that it was Massachusetts that was interfering with corporate speech rights. The first Amendment was designed to foster individual self-expression, but it also had a role to play in providing the public access to information and ideas. The free flow of information, even commercial information, to the public should not depend on the source of the information. Thus, both corporations and individual speakers have a role to play in public debate and discussion.

These two cases paved the way for the 2010 decision in *Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission* (Citizens, 2010). Central to the decision in this case is the issue of whether a corporation, by virtue of being an artificial entity rather than an organic one, was enough reason to be able to impede the speech rights guaranteed by the First Amendment. Relying on *First*, the Court rejected the argument that the political speech of corporations should be treated differently than natural persons. Justice Scalia commented, “The [First] Amendment is written in terms of ‘speech,’ not speakers. Its text offers no foothold for excluding any category of speaker, from the single individuals to partnerships of individuals, to unincorporated associations of individuals, to incorporated associations of individuals…” (Citizens, 2010). Thus, the majority looked more to the scope of the right, instead of who the speaker was.

Freedom of Association in the First Amendment is another constitutional right that businesses have already acquired. A private organization, under certain criteria, is allowed to exclude a person from membership. In the 2000 Supreme Court case of *Boy Scouts of America v. Dale* (Boy, 2000), a private organization was allowed to exclude a person from membership when “the
presence of that person affects in a significant way the group’s ability to advocate public or private viewpoints.” Opposition to homosexuality was a part of the Boy Scouts’ message and having adult homosexual leaders, it was felt, would interfere with that message. While not a business or a corporation, Freedom of Association rights have been extended to associations. The Boy Scouts do now accept gay scouts and even gay leaders, if the leader is endorsed by the sponsoring troop. This change came from internal reflection in the organization; it was not forced upon the organization by a law or court case. Public pressure certainly weighed heavily in the internal decision.

Other rights found in the Bill of Rights have extended to corporations. While corporations do not have a right to privacy equivalent to that of an individual, the corporation is protected from unreasonable searches and seizures (Silvestri, 2015). Also, corporations do not have right against self-incrimination, but they do have Fifth Amendment rights against double jeopardy (Silvestri, 2015). The Sixth Amendment right to trial by jury and the right to counsel applies to corporations, but a corporation does not have the right to a public defender. Finally, corporations also have Fourteenth Amendment rights, as illustrated in the history section of this paper.

**Personal Rights That Could Be Held By Corporations**

It has not been decided yet whether corporations have First Amendment Freedom of Religion Rights. For-profit corporations, at least closely held ones, have freedom of religion rights under the Religious Freedom Restoration Act of 1993 (Freedom, 1993). In the 2014 case of *Burwell v. Hobby Lobby* (Burwell, 2014), the Court held that Health and Human Services regulations that imposed a contraception mandate violated the Religious Freedom Restoration Act (RFRA). The Court did not find that corporations had Freedom of Religion rights under the First Amendment of the Constitution. The Court decided that the mandate substantially burdened the free exercise of religion under the RFRA. Corporations do not have to provide the contraceptive coverage if the corporation holds sincere religious objections to the mandate. The majority said, “A corporation is simply a form of organization used by human beings to achieve desired ends” (Burwell, 2014). An established body of laws specifies the rights and obligations of the people (including shareholders, officers, and employees) who are associated with a corporation in one way or another. When rights, whether constitutional or statutory, are extended to corporations, the purpose is to protect the rights of these people. This is more of an aggregate approach to corporate personhood. The aggregate approach could be used to give corporations Freedom of Religion rights under the First Amendment. However, this theory might not apply when a corporation is not closely held, meaning, the ownership of the company is mostly held by relatives and it is not publicly traded.

It is not clear whether corporations have Eighth Amendment rights against cruel and unusual punishment or excessive fines. It is also not certain whether corporations have Third Amendment rights against being forced to quarter soldiers (Silvestri, 2015). For example, a hotel could not be forced to room soldiers in time of emergency. Could corporations have Second Amendment rights? In the 2008 case of *District of Columbia v. Heller* (District, 2008) and the 2010 case of *McDonald v. City of Chicago* (McDonald, 2010), the Supreme Court affirmed the right of “natural persons” to keep and bare arms. The Justices focused on the personal right of self-defense and the right to have the ability to band together for self-defense. Corporations may well have the same needs to bare arms and band together for self-defense, although these writers believe this area will not have requests for litigation before requests for Freedom of Religion.

**The Next Frontier In Corporate Personhood**

*Obergefell v. Hodges* presents the same type of challenges to corporations that were encountered in *Hobby Lobby*. This case requires states, under the Fourteenth Amendment, to issue marriage licenses to same-sex couples as well as to recognize these marriages when they are validly performed out-of-state (Obergefell, 2015). The decision will have no effect on how most businesses operate. They will continue to hire gay people, supply their workers with benefits, and sell their products to all buyers. However, some business owners could find that providing
services to gay couples for their marriages is tantamount to endorsing and accepting gay marriage, which is against their religion. The first groups of business people to be affected are likely to be small businesses that do not want to participate in gay wedding ceremonies by providing things like wedding cakes, catering, or by taking photos at same sex weddings.

For many people, it may seem strange that businesses even can be challenged to have to provide services. However, there are many arguments that can be used to challenge the idea that services must be provided. These two writers are making these arguments as strongly as they can. First, the practice of religion—a fundamental right—is deeply tied into how some people express with whom they associate and what business practices they endorse. This was the argument used in *Hobby Lobby* to opt out of providing certain contraceptives. A private business’s decision not to provide services to same-sex couples does not directly affect the couple’s right to marry. They do not need those services by that particular company to marry. A marriage certificate is issued by the state and does not require cakes, catering, or photos. If really wanted, these services can be acquired elsewhere. Same-sex couples have found many businesses that will provide wedding cakes, food, and photographers. There is no real harm in a particular business denying these services. The same sex couple is just inconvenienced in that they have to acquire the nonessential services at a different place. For example, refusing to provide services for a same-sex wedding is not the same thing as refusing to provide services to someone because they are black. In Jim Crow days, services were not offered by any business. Anti-discrimination statutes do not always cover discrimination based on sexual orientation, and the business is not discriminating because the person is gay. Business owners are refusing to provide a service or product because the participation in the wedding is against their religion.

Second, there is no right to a wedding cake or a photographer. In a free economy, the exchange of money does not make it acceptable to force someone to work for one. Some could argue that individuals choose to engage in business. If they choose to run a business they must accept all government regulation of their business. This argument counters the very idea of civil liberties. The Lockean concept of natural rights does not come from the government. Freedom of Religion comes from God or nature. It is something people possess because they are human. The government cannot pass any law it chooses to control peoples’ free expression of religion. This argument can be compared to saying that if one chooses to speak then the person must accept all government regulations that accompany that speech, even if those regulations trample other fundamental rights. This perspective, the corporation will argue, is not acceptable as it interferes with the natural right to speak freely. Thus, small businesses and closely held corporations will certainly go to court to ask for religious exemptions to providing services. Putting people out of business for expressing their religious beliefs may be too high a price to pay compared to requiring the same-sex couple to seek the services elsewhere. Generating many of these cases could overburden the courts, but these cases may also result in finding a constitutional right to religion, thus expanding corporate personhood. If it is found that the right applies to corporations, then the Court will use strict scrutiny when a law interferes with Freedom of Religion. To survive the challenge, the government that made the law will have to show a compelling need for the law and will have to draft the law in the least restrictive fashion. As the government bears the burden of proof in strict scrutiny cases, the government has a high probability of losing the case. These writers believe this area will now be the next for the potential expansion of corporate personhood—following the arguments raised in *Hobby Lobby*, the owners of corporations will use arguments like those presented here. These will be difficult cases because courts will be challenged to choose between fundamental constitutional rights when those fundamental rights clash.

Other types of problems will occur for churches and religious affiliated institutions. These organizations that receive benefits from the government could lose the benefits if they refuse to accept or participate in same-sex weddings. First, churches will not want to marry same-sex couples in their churches if it is contrary to the teachings of their religion. Pastors of these churches will not want to participate in these weddings. They may not want particular groups to
use their facilities either. They may be happy to have a Boy Scout troop use the church for meetings, but they may not want a same-sex couple to have even a wedding reception at the church as they may believe they are then accepting the concept of same-sex marriage. Second, religious affiliated organizations such as those that provide adoption services may object for religious reasons to providing adoptions to same-sex couples. Instead, adoption organizations may prefer to place children with couples of the opposite sex. Given that they also receive government support for doing this type of work, they could encounter regulations that—if not followed—could result in a loss of funds or even curtail their ability to continue to provide adoption services. Third, religious colleges could face the loss of tax-exempt status as well as federal or state funding, accreditation, and student access to loans if they refuse to provide a married same-sex couple access to student family housing.

Fourth, while the Supreme Court has already decided that the Boy Scouts could exclude gay leaders, there will still be challenges in this area. The Boy Scouts left the decision regarding whether or not to accept gay leaders to each troop. Many churches sponsor troops as well as conservative non-religiously affiliated groups. These troops may not accept gay leaders despite the Boy Scouts’ indication that they may do so if they wish. These writers expect potential gay leaders to challenge these sponsoring groups if they are denied acceptance as leaders. As the Supreme Court has already established that private groups could limit members, these cases will present the Court with the opportunity to not only affirm the prior holding that the private groups have Freedom of Association rights, but also extend Freedom of Religion rights to private associations or corporations. Arguments seeking Court intervention in favor of religious rights will involve the notion that these different situations are not really a barrier to the rights of same-sex couples to marry; weddings and receptions can be booked at other locations. There are other adoption services that allow same-sex couples to adopt children. Students can still attend religious colleges, but they might have to find housing off-campus. Finally, the writers believe that the question of whether Boy Scout troops and other groups can bar gay leaders is a different issue than was decided in the Obergefell case, in which the focus was on the right of same-sex couples to marry. Again, these potential problems represent many potential cases that could provide opportunities for courts to give businesses First Amendment religious rights.

Benefits and Problems from Corporate Personhood

Businesses

Why do corporations want speech and religious rights, which are considered to be personal freedoms? Initially, the desire for Due Process and Equal Protection rights may have been mostly for economic reasons. A corporation would not want to be treated differently from a private person in business, lest the corporation find itself at a competitive disadvantage to the individual businessman. If regulations require a corporation do more or provide more than a private person in business, this extra regulation could result in added costs for the corporation that a private businessperson would not have. However, for some companies, the purpose for attaining Corporate Personhood may now involve the exertion of a more proactive influence on society. This may involve the ability to support candidates who share values with the owners of the corporations or simply the opportunity to be heard on social issues. If a corporation has more money to spend than a natural person, the corporation has a better chance of being heard. If the company was founded in part on religious principles, it may be the desire to exercise those beliefs through work. It is not enough for many religious people to simply be able to believe what they wish. Those beliefs may seem hollow if one is not allowed to practice those beliefs and share their experiences and successes through their work and actions. In the case of same-sex marriage and business, both small business owners and large corporations may desire to not serve same-sex couples with wedding services or supplies because they want to practice their religious beliefs concerning the sanctity of marriage.

Furthermore, corporations need to be careful for what they wish. The liabilities of corporations are not attributed to the owners (Morton, 2014). In the case of a small business, the owner of the
photography shop can be personally sued for failing to agree to photograph a same-sex marriage. If the owner does not win on religious grounds, the owner’s damages are not limited solely to what is invested in the business. The owner could become bankrupt and lose many personal assets. If the photography studio is actually a corporation, then the corporation can be sued when it discriminates or it is negligent. On the other hand, the owners may personally be protected. Their liability may be limited to what they invested in the corporation. However, could this protection change if owners are able to assert their rights through their businesses? An owner is not liable for tort damages for corporate negligence because the owner is separate from the business. If an owner can assert rights through the business, then the corporation is not separate from the owner. If the corporation is not separate, then an owner should receive no liability protection. The legal theory of the owner’s place in the corporation needs to be consistent.

Could owners or investors be held criminally responsible for a corporation’s wrongdoing? Scholars are split on this issue (United, 2015). Bringing a civil case is easier because one only needs to establish simple negligence. When a company does something criminal, there needs to be a person in the corporation who did a criminal act with criminal intent. That person can then face criminal charges. It is harder to go after owners or shareholders of the corporation. A foundation of criminal law is that criminals have guilty minds; they choose to do wrong. Given that they choose to do wrong, they are blameworthy and can be punished (Baker & Haun, 2013). It is harder to make a case that an investor in the company shares the same criminal intent with the person in the corporation who chose to use the corporation to commit a crime. To demonstrate criminal intent, one must intentionally commit a crime or at least be found to be reckless. If the board hired a guilty person, despite some indication the person was of poor character, then the board would be reckless. If it was the board’s job to oversee this person’s work and the board refused to do so despite warnings of potential problems, then the members of the board could potentially have acted recklessly. Shy of this, it looks more like an accident on the board’s part and it becomes harder to attach criminal intent to people in a corporation who were not directly involved in the criminal activity.

**Same-Sex Couples and Individuals**

Despite the Court’s ruling, same-sex couples may feel that business people from religions who find same-sex marriage morally problematic are forcing the couples out of town or are trying to totally ignore them and put them back in the closet. Exercising corporate religious beliefs may make same-sex couples feel they have not achieved the right to marry. Same-sex couples do not just want a license—holding a marriage certificate alone is not really what these couples fought for. What is truly wanted is acceptance of the marriage. They truly desire to have their same-sex marriages treated exactly the same as all other marriages.

Is there any harm in sharing personal freedoms with a corporation? There may be harms to individuals. In the case of free speech, if a corporation can spend whatever amount it chooses to influence elections, the election process could become complicated. Politicians and the public may listen to a corporation that has a large pocketbook. However, an individual with different views and a much smaller pocketbook may encounter trouble being heard by anyone. This does not contribute to the goal of the First Amendment, which is to present as many views as possible to the electorate so voters can hear many different ideas, weigh those ideas, and vote based on what they believe to be the best solutions. Fewer ideas will be heard.

In the case of Freedom of Religion, people who work for companies, such as Hobby Lobby, that deny benefits to certain types of contraception to their workers may believe that they are having the owners’ religious views imposed on them. At a minimum, they may be inconvenienced in that they have to acquire the contraceptives elsewhere. At the maximum, they may believe they are not able to exercise their choices over their bodies. They may believe their rights to privacy in the area of birth control are being compromised because of someone else’s religious beliefs. In the same way, same-sex couples may feel discriminated against if a company can refuse to marry them, provide partner benefits or adoption services, or make a cake for their wedding.
There is also a feeling of a loss of respect when services are denied to a same-sex couple that other couples enjoy without difficulty or inconvenience. It may convey the sentiment that, while there is a marriage, it is a second-class marriage. It may convey that there is something strange about the people in the marriage, or that there is something wrong with the marriage. Also, it may also be too easy for a business to get out of generally applicable laws simply by stating it violates the owner’s religious principles. Courts are not good at judging what beliefs are central to different religions or the sincerity of business owners’ religious beliefs.

Courts

The Supreme Court in particular, and all lower courts in general, will be very busy indeed. The problem is that courts will become endlessly entangled in issues of religious dogma. The hardest cases seem to be when two rights clash. The more expansive the courts become in finding rights for businesses, the more likely it will be that those new rights will clash with other rights held by natural persons. The law does not have as many tools to resolve conflicts when both sides have fundamental constitutional rights at stake. There will be a tendency to anger one side or the other. There will be attacks on the courts for being too activist and making policy from the bench. This does not mean courts should shy away from taking tough cases. Courts and society simply need to realize there is a potential cost to having policy changes made from the bench rather than from the legislature. The people have more control, in a timelier fashion, over legislatures and executives through elections. They cannot influence nine unelected people on a Supreme Court who hold their jobs for life. Courts that legislate from the bench may create feelings of a lack of legitimacy from the citizens, given that courts are not the legislative bodies.

Are There Any Solutions?

In the past, the courts lessened problems of corporate personhood simply by recognizing the difference between for-profit and non-profit corporations. In the past, courts extended limited rights to non-profit groups, but the courts did not give for-profit groups extensive protections, given that they were less ideology driven and were mostly focused on maximizing profit. This distinction may not be appropriate for the future. Sharp lines are not always driven between for-profit corporations that are supposed to focus on maximizing their shareholders’ profits and non-profit corporations that are driven by factors such as the public good (Nelson, 2015). Ben & Jerry’s Homemade, Inc. provides a good example of problems that can arise from dividing companies into only two categories. In 1978, Ben Cohen and Jerry Greenfield co-founded an ice cream company in Vermont with a $12,000 investment. The company’s goals were to make the best ice cream, support progressive causes, and share the success with shareholders. The company grew, but the for-profit corporation did not place profits first. The company committed 7.5% of its profits to a charitable foundation. The foundation engaged in activities such as in-store voter registration, lessening the use of industrial chemicals in foods, using biodegradable containers, and buying ingredients from suppliers who employed disadvantaged people. The added focus on advancing progressive social goals lessened profits and angered shareholders who were primarily interested in monetary returns on their investments. Unilever, a multinational conglomerate, acquired Ben & Jerry’s in 2000. This sale made other socially responsible companies nervous, especially when it was learned that the board forced the founders to sell their company to a giant, multinational company focused on making profits for shareholders (Dasari, Vargas, & Vargas, 2014).

For a decade, socially conscious businesses tried to change the laws that primarily focused on enforcing “shareholder value.” After failing to achieve success, Maryland passed the country’s first “Benefit Corporation” statute in 2010. A benefit corporation allows the corporation to focus on making profits while also being committed to the advancement of public good, which could lessen maximum profits. This type of corporation is growing. By the summer of 2014, benefit corporation statutes had been passed in 27 states, while another 14 legislatures considered such legislation (Desari et al. 2014). Additionally, it was estimated in 2012 that this type of corporation produced nearly 3.5 percent of the country’s GDP and employed more than ten
This new form of corporation blurs the line between for-profit and non-profit. This type of corporation will also allow the Supreme Court to extend corporate personhood rights more easily to businesses because they will see a business entity that has a natural person conscience. To give corporations personal rights, a court could argue that an entity with a conscience may be similar to a natural person and is therefore deserving of person-like protections. Thus, new models of corporations will not lessen the problems from corporate personhood, but allow the expansion of natural person rights to business organizations. Thus, these hybrid businesses will also be very attractive to owners who have religious beliefs and wish to run their businesses according to their beliefs. Sharp divisions between for-profit and non-profit corporations are simply no longer possible.

Will a change in the way corporations are characterized do anything to lessen potential problems stemming from calling a corporation a person? Corporations were initially considered artificial beings created by and under the control of the state. Later, corporations evolved into being considered an aggregate of the people who invested in it. A corporation had the rights and duties of the people who created it. A corporation was not separate because it could not exist without the investors in it. Finally, corporations were considered legally separate from investors. It was its own entity with its own personality. The aggregate approach allowed a closely held business in Hobby Lobby to exercise religious rights under the Religious Freedom Restoration Act (Freedom, 1993). Considering a corporation a full-fledged individual entity could allow any corporation, not just benefit corporations or closely held corporations, to easily assume the rights of natural people both under the Religious Freedom Restoration Act and the Freedom of Religion clauses in the Constitution. The conception of a corporation that most separates it from natural people is the theory that considers a corporation an artificial person that is completely controlled by the state. It has only those rights the government gives it, and the government periodically reviews the corporate charter and can change its terms.

However, going back to the idea of corporations being simply creatures of the state will be difficult. When Congress passes a law, and the Supreme Court interprets it differently from Congress’ intent, Congress can simply rewrite the law to make the wording closer to what Congress originally intended. Congress wrote the Religious Freedom of Restoration Act. If Congress does not want courts to include corporations under the act, Congress can simply change its law and state that the word “people” in the act does not include corporations. Congress can then tell the Supreme Court that the law does not mean what the Court first thought it meant. This would stop the Hobby Lobby case from having precedential value in future cases. However, when the Supreme Court interprets the Constitution as the Court did in Citizen’s United when it concluded corporations have Freedom of Speech rights under the First Amendment of the Constitution, Congress cannot come back with simple legislation and change the Court’s interpretation. When the Supreme Court concludes that rights in the Constitution apply to people, and that corporations are people just like natural people, then the only way to change what the Court decided is through a constitutional amendment. The Supreme Court, not Congress, is the final authority on what the Constitution means. Constitutional Amendments do not pass easily, as demonstrated by the fact that only twenty-seven have passed in over two hundred years of the Constitution’s existence. This is the only way to check the Court when they make a constitutional interpretation.

With the decision in Obergefell, the Court can expect many new cases. It is easy for these writers to envision religious rights of corporations and business owners clashing with the rights of couples in same-sex marriages. Cases where fundamental rights clash are not easy to resolve. The desire and ability to extend First Amendment religious rights to corporations and other businesses will be high, but the Court acts at its own peril when it becomes too activist and tries to take on the job of legislatures.

J.C. Bancroft Davis, the court reporter, introduced in the beginning of this paper, who wrote the incorrect headnote in Santa Clara, may have had a crystal ball. While the Court in Santa
Clara did not create corporate personhood, this concept certainly seems to be a part of constitutional law now. Perhaps the best way to keep corporations under control would involve keeping theory consistent and taking away civil liability protections—and maybe even some of the criminal liability protections that investors have—from being in a corporation. If there is no distinction between people and corporations for the enjoyment of constitutional rights, then there should be no special criminal or civil liability barriers either. This would at least force corporations, like people, to be fully responsible criminally and civilly for their actions.

References
The Development of a Pre-Test and Post-Test Assessment Survey for an Introduction to Cultural Anthropology Course

Sean M. Daley,  
William McFarlane,  
Johnson County Community College  
Qing Yu,  
Christine M. Daley,  
Byron Gajewski,  
University of Kansas Medical Center

Abstract

This paper describes the development and application of a pre-test/post-test assessment survey for an introduction to cultural anthropology course at a community college. The assessment survey was designed to measure student comprehension of course content in reference to the course’s learning objectives prior to taking the course versus after taking the course. This paper focuses on the process by which the assessment survey was developed, tested, and validated. This paper also addresses corrections and revisions made to the survey based on the initial validation process. As a result of the validation process, two questions were replaced and four questions were modified, leaving a validated assessment tool for this introductory course. This tool can be modified for use with other introduction to cultural anthropology courses.

Introduction

Assessment is defined as “the ongoing process of: establishing clear, measurable expected outcomes of student learning; ensuring that students have sufficient opportunities to achieve those outcomes; systematically gathering, analyzing, and interpreting evidence to determine how well student learning matches our expectations; using the resulting information to understand and improve student learning” (Suskie, 2009, p. 4). Over the past few years, assessment has become a buzzword in higher education. “In higher education circles, there is something of a feeding frenzy surrounding the issue of assessment. …accrediting organizations want assessments of student learning outcomes; state agencies want assessments to prove that tax dollars are being spent efficiently; institutions want internal assessments that they can use to demonstrate success to their own constituencies” (Nelson, 2014). Because of this focus, more and more institutes of higher learning are creating formal assessment procedures. The manners in which these assessments are being conducted, as well as the measures being used, are as varied as the colleges and universities conducting assessments, yet few of them are validated.

On August 20, 2010, the Department of Anthropology at Johnson County Community College (JCCC) had a departmental faculty meeting during which faculty members were informed that they were to start conducting formal learning assessments of their courses. The first course for which a formal assessment tool was developed was Anthropology 125, “Cultural Anthropology.” “Cultural Anthropology” is an introductory course that familiarizes students with some of the theories, perspectives, and methodologies that cultural anthropologists use when studying cultural and social traditions in communities around the world. “Cultural Anthropology” was selected for the first assessment tool because it is one of the department’s more popular courses. During an average semester the department offers five face-to-face sections, three on-line sections, and one television self-paced section (pre-recorded course materials are televised at specific times on the college’s television network via cable and satellite providers); this adds up to over 250 students in the course per semester. The course’s popularity is largely because it fulfills...
several general education/cultural studies requirements for the college and is transferable to all four-year colleges and universities in the state of Kansas.

There were two motivating factors for the establishment of an assessment measure for not only “Cultural Anthropology,” but also for many other general education and required courses at JCCC. One was the revision of the General Ed Learning Outcomes (GELO) into the new Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) at JCCC in early 2011, which was done as one of the college’s new strategic planning initiatives. The GELO approach was to collect assignments from specific courses and assess if they were meeting the General Education learning outcomes at the time. However, the GELO approach was not very rigorous and did not provide objective data. JCCC leadership decided that all courses would address, at a minimum, one of the eight SLOs. The primary SLO that “Cultural Anthropology” addresses is SLO 4: “Demonstrate an understanding of the broad diversity of the human experience and the individual’s connection to society” (JCCC, 2014, p. 6).

The second motivating factor was JCCC’s Higher Learning Commission Accreditation review in 2010 and 2011, during which JCCC adopted the Academic Quality Improvement Program process of reaccreditation. According to this process, JCCC general education courses were to assess one of the SLOs. The Department of Anthropology decided to also assess course objectives based on recommendations from the Kansas Board of Regents and the Kansas Core Outcomes Group that had been handed down beginning in 2009. These recommendations were to align course outcomes, objectives, and competencies with anthropology departments at the other Kansas colleges and universities to ensure the transferability of courses from JCCC to other schools.

Upon learning of the need for an assessment tool, the anthropology department’s faculty members met as a group and decided a pre-test/post-test survey would be the most appropriate tool for evaluating this course. This decision was partially influenced by the fact that another social science department, sociology, had previously piloted a pre-test/post-test survey with some success. All faculty, full-time and adjunct, who teach “Cultural Anthropology” were involved in the development of the survey. Each faculty member developed multiple choice questions that addressed each of the learning outcomes of the course. The learning outcomes for “Cultural Anthropology” are:

1. Trace the development of anthropology and its relationship to other social sciences.
2. Describe the connection between cultural anthropology and the other subfields of anthropology - physical anthropology, archeology, linguistic anthropology and medical anthropology.
3. Identify and analyze numerous anthropological theories and perspectives.
4. Identify and apply established anthropological research methods.
5. Analyze environmental factors which influence the development of various subsistence patterns and associated technologies.
6. Discuss the roles power and social inequality play in cultures and societies.
7. Investigate the major forms of kinship and family organization found throughout the world.
8. Discuss selected Western and non-Western religious and worldview traditions.
9. Compare and contrast major political and economic institutions.
10. Describe aesthetic traditions, including visual arts, music and dance, from around the world.
11. Investigate and describe the connection between language and culture.
12. Describe and evaluate the effects of globalization on world cultures.

In October of 2010, faculty members met and chose questions that addressed each learning outcome from the pool of questions. An initial 13-question survey was developed using the selected questions (see Appendix A). An effort was made to avoid anthropological jargon and provide real-world situations and examples that would allow determination of a student’s competency with concepts central to each objective. Initial testing of the survey was done only with face-to-face sections of the course for consistency. The first survey was administered in January of 2011.

Since the survey was first administered, the manner in which it has been administered each semester has not changed. The pre-test survey is administered in-person during either the first or second class
meeting before any course content has been taught. The survey is then administered on either the last day of class or at the final exam meeting prior to the final exam being administered, once any teaching of the course’s content has concluded.

The assessment survey is not administered in the two alternative formats in which “Cultural Anthropology” is currently offered - on-line and television broadcast. Because these formats lack the control of face-to-face courses, it is difficult to ensure that the assessment is completed by the student enrolled in the course. Therefore, there were concerns about the validity of any assessment surveys from courses taught in those formats.

Since the survey was first administered in 2011, the anthropology department has been collecting assessment data; however, little formal analysis of the data has taken place. Likewise, the survey was never validated. Because the JCCC anthropology department faculty members are not proficient in survey validation techniques, they reached out to the faculty and staff at the University of Kansas Medical Center’s Center for American Indian Community Health (CAICH) and Department of Biostatistics. The JCCC Department of Anthropology has been working with CAICH and the biostatistics department on other research projects for several years.

Methods

Seventeen sections of the course that were offered between 2012 and 2014 were selected for validation of the survey. Students’ answers from the assessment surveys were entered into a database by two different research assistants, then compared and cleaned to ensure no errors in data entry. Unique numeric student identifiers were used for pre-test/post-test comparisons to eliminate potential confusion due to similarities in student names. Confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) was used to test the validity and reliability of the assessment survey. Model fit was determined by two statistical fit indexes: Comparative Fit Index (CFI) and Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA). A CFI of 0.90 or greater and RMSEA of 0.06 or less indicate acceptable model fit (Hu and Bentler, 1999). The Lavann package from R 2.15.3 was used to fit the CFA model and validate the assessment. The CFA estimated the standardized loadings for each item. The reliability was estimated by using output of the CFA. The entire reliability (Alonso, Laenen, Molenberghs, Geys, and Vangeneugden, 2010) describes the reliability of the entire instrument and each domain within the instrument. The squared loadings are interpreted as item reliability which tells the reliability of any one particular item. Shrout’s interpretations of reliability were employed: 0.00-10 is virtually none; 0.11-0.40 is slight; 0.41-0.60 is fair; 0.61-0.80 is moderate; and 0.81-1.0 is substantial reliability (Shrout, 1998).

A total of 448 students completed the pre-test survey; 204 students responded to both the pre- and post-test surveys. This represents 17 course sections for the pre-test and 12 course sections for the post-test. The gap in the number of pre-test surveys and post-test surveys is due to student attrition and the fact that in five of the 17 sections of the course professors forgot to administer the post-test survey at the end of the semester. A paired t-test was used to test the relationship between pre- and post-test data.

Results

Data were recoded as correct/not correct (binary data) according to an answer key and invalid answers were coded as not correct. Three questions (items 1, 11 and 12) were excluded because they were not able to be recorded as binary data. The remaining 10 items were fit into a one factor CFA model on binary data. A one factor binary CFA model is an acceptable model with a CFI of 0.941 and RMSEA of 0.047 (Table 1). However, question 6 is not significant in the model. Therefore, a one factor CFA model may not fully describe the data. Subsequently, question 6 was excluded and a two factor CFA model with 9 items was run. One factor – “Self” - included items 2, 5, 7 and 8; the second factor – “Other” - included item 3, 4, 9 and 10. The factor “Self” was labeled as such because upon analysis we noticed that the questions and responses were grouped based on how an individual would respond emotionally to a situation and how his or her opinion enters into the scenario. The questions and responses associated with the factor “Other” appear to be grouped less on opinions and emotions and more on fact and some critical thought.
The two factor CFA models have higher CFI (0.981) and lower RMSEA (0.03) than the one factor model. They also have higher average reliability and entire reliability. Table 1 shows that entire reliability of the model is substantial (0.861).

Descriptive statistics of the instrument and item reliability are summarized in Table 2. Reliability of question (Q) 13 is moderate. Reliability of Q2, Q5, Q8, Q3, Q4 and Q9 are slight. The results of Q7 and Q10 are virtually none.

Figure 1 displays the factor structure of the “Cultural Anthropology” assessment survey. The entire reliability of the domain “Self” is moderate while the entire reliability of the domain “Other” is fair.

The results of the pre- and post-test are listed in Table 3. There is a significant difference between pre- and post-test data for each domain with a p-value <0.05. There is an average increase of 0.25 for the domain “Self” and 0.30 for the domain “Other.”

**Conclusion**

The assessment test designed for “Cultural Anthropology” at Johnson County Community College proved a valid assessment of the students’ knowledge before and after taking the class. Further, it provided an effective means of assessing whether or not all course instructors were providing their students with a basic understanding of the essential tenets of cultural anthropology, as defined by the department. The assessment tool also provided information on two different domains of student knowledge, including their internalized view of themselves (Self) and the way they think about and judge others (Other). Though there is greater reliability in the domain of “Self” than that of “Other,” students improved their scores in both domains over the course of the semester.

Throughout the process of validating the assessment tool, several things were learned. First, early on several concerns emerged concerning the assessment survey itself, including specific concerns about two of the questions. Question 11 on the assessment stated:

A male friend of yours is dating a woman from another country and her first language is not English. You notice that when she is with males she generally avoids eye contact and speaks slowly and deliberately. She does not, however, do this when she is with females. You are unsure why she does this, so you:

a. ask your friend why she does this when she is not present.
b. ask your friend if she has a some kind of disability.
c. ask her why she does it.
d. avoid the topic all together.
e. do a little research on your own via the Internet, books, magazine articles, etc. to see why she does it.

This question was designed to focus on language; it was intended to determine subtleties of language and communication. When written, the intended correct answer was choice “c” - ask her why she does it. However, we noticed that males consistently answered the question one way (choice “c”), while females consistently answered it another way (choice “c”). It was determined that the question was biased toward gender; female students were more apt to ask the woman directly. It would be wrong to consider a male student’s response to do research rather than talk to her as incorrect because there are gendered roles to communication that must be considered. To correct this issue, the question was replaced with a different question concerning language (see Appendix B).

Another problematic question on the assessment, question 12, stated:

You are filling out forms for an application. There are a couple of optional questions, one of which asks you to identify your race. Do you:

a. choose your actual race.
b. ignore the questions because it’s not anyone’s business.
c. choose the race you wish you were.
d. choose all of the above because the concept of race is an illusion.
This question was written to address the complexity of race. The intended correct answer was choice “d” – choose all of the above because the concept of race is an illusion. It is stressed in the course that race, as we know it today, is a social construct with no real biological foundation. However, the overwhelming majority of students who took the assessment survey chose “a” – choose your actual race. From an anthropological perspective, the fact that students could not separate themselves from an erroneous misunderstanding of race that has been engrained in them from birth, even after taking a course in which this misunderstanding was addressed at length, only adds to the complex anthropological conversation on race. But for an assessment survey, this is problematic. While we left the question because we believe it gets at an important concept, we did reword the answers to make it less ambiguous and confusing (see Appendix B).

To improve our ability to understand how students were answering the assessment, we added a few basic demographic questions, including gender, age, academic class standing, and place of birth, on the revised assessment for future analysis. We believe there may be some important connections between how a person responds to a question and his or her demographic background.

Though this assessment tool was developed for a specific course at a specific college, we believe the procedure for its development and the concept behind assessing competencies in a way other than a typical final examination can be used by other institutions. Our questions were designed as real-world examples where a student would need to think about how he or she would react rather than simply testing factual knowledge as is normally done in an examination. Students responded well to the exercise, showing that they learned something in the course that could be applied to the real world rather than just rote memorization of facts to pass the class. This was exciting to us because most of our students take the class as a cross-cultural general education requirement, not because they plan to become anthropologists. The fact that they learned something applicable to their lives from anthropology shows the usefulness of a course such as this one for students.

Recent discussions during departmental meetings have revealed that the concept of the assessment is sound, but the delivery of the assessment and subsequent tabulation of the results can be improved. Moreover, it would be useful to develop a rubric for assessing intangibles, such as critical thinking and sensitivity concerning human diversity. Currently, the anthropology department is the only department or program on campus to address SLO 4 with a pre- and post-test survey. We are planning to develop similar assessments for our other courses.
Table 1: Model Fit of Confirmatory Factor Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>Entire Reliability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One Factor</td>
<td>0.941</td>
<td>0.047</td>
<td>0.783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Factors</td>
<td>0.981</td>
<td>0.030</td>
<td>0.861</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Summary of Cultural Anthropology Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Correct (n/%)</th>
<th>Not Correct (n/%)</th>
<th>Reliability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>138(30.80)</td>
<td>310(69.20)</td>
<td>0.338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>163(36.63)</td>
<td>282(63.37)</td>
<td>0.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>270(60.27)</td>
<td>178(39.73)</td>
<td>0.098</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Summary of Pre-Test and Post-Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>mean</th>
<th>std</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self</td>
<td>pre</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>post</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>diff</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>1.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>pre</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>post</td>
<td>1.94</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>diff</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. diff: the difference between pre and post data
References
Appendix A: Cultural Anthropology Assessment Survey Questions (Fall 2011)

1.) I selected a course offered by the Department of Anthropology because I want to learn about:
   a. other people and diverse groups from a comparative and global perspective.
   b. the social causes and consequences of human behavior.
   c. the roles of thought, emotion, and experience in individual and social behavior.
   d. how material resources are manufactured, distributed, and consumed by individuals and groups.
   e. the relationships underlying political events and conditions at a local, national, and international level.

2.) At the end of this semester I expect to have a better understanding of:
   a. human biology and behavior from an evolutionary perspective.
   b. events in the past through the materials that people left behind.
   c. how language allows people to communicate and understand their world.
   d. the factors that promote health and disease in communities around the world.
   e. how learned behaviors and ideas shape the beliefs and traditions for groups around the world.

3.) Your new next door neighbors are a household of one wife with three husbands. Your initial reaction is:
   a. to call the police.
   b. to introduce yourself and get to know them.
   c. to discuss this unnatural situation with friends and family.
   d. to treat them like all of your other neighbors.

4.) You are interested in learning about how American Indians in Washington State traditionally fish for salmon. Which one of the following would be your first choice to learn more about this topic?
   a. Google it or look it up on the Internet.
   b. Read books about it.
   c. Go to Washington State and speak with American Indian fisherman.
   d. Watch documentaries about it on educational channels such as the History Channel, Discovery Channel, National Geographic, etc.
   e. Discuss the topic with non-Native fisherman to see what they know about it.

5.) A friend of yours is passed up for a job and tells you that the person hired was a member of a minority group. Your initial reaction is that:
   a. the person hired was probably better qualified for the job than your friend.
   b. the person hired only got the job because of his or her minority status.
   c. the person hired is probably lazy and not a hard worker.
   d. Affirmative Action laws are working and providing opportunity to all.

6.) Every day on your way to school you pass by the same homeless man. He is probably homeless because:
   a. he is lazy and doesn’t want to work.
   b. wealth, power, and prestige are unequally distributed in the US.
   c. he lost his job and can’t find another.
   d. he is an alcoholic.
7.) You’re planning a trip to the United Kingdom and learn that throughout history in Europe, it wasn’t uncommon for first cousins to marry. Do you:
   a. make a mental note to look for signs of inbreeding while there.
   b. wonder why they chose to do something like that and even go so far as to research it.
   c. shrug it off— to each their own, that’s what you say.
   d. go to Ancestry.com to see if there is anything like that in your family.

8.) You and your boyfriend (or girlfriend) are friends with an engaged couple who are Catholic. You know they use birth control and skip mass on Sundays. When you asked them why they still want to be Catholic if they can’t follow the rules, they said that their parents and grandparents would be disappointed if they left the church and didn’t raise their future kids as Catholics. You think about this and decide:
   a. they don’t want to lose their inheritances.
   b. they are hypocrites.
   c. family traditions are more important to them than religious beliefs.
   d. they should repent by going to confession and practicing penance.
   e. they don’t really believe in the tenets of their religion.

9.) When we look at cultures around the world, we can observe that in regards to leadership and power:
   a. some small groups have no system of authority and are able to achieve totally equality among all members.
   b. every group has some means for defining authority.
   c. every group has one individual that controls the group, such as a president, king, or tribal chief.

10.) You are at an ethnic arts festival in downtown Kansas City, Missouri, and one of the artists is from Kenya, Africa, and one of his traditional wooden masks reminds you of Bart Simpson. You are surprised by this. Your first response is to:
   a. walk away, thinking the artist is a fake and a fraud.
   b. ask the artist about this mask.
   c. stand and stare at the mask until the artist approaches you.
   d. laugh at it and walk away.
   e. see if the artist has any other masks that resemble cartoon characters.

11.) A male friend of yours is dating a woman from another country and her first language is not English. You notice that when she is with males she generally avoids eye contact and speaks slowly and deliberately. She does not, however, do this when she is with females. You are unsure why she does this, so you:
   a. ask your friend why she does this when she is not present.
   b. ask your friend if she has a some kind of disability.
   c. ask her why she does it.
   d. avoid the topic all together.
   e. do a little research on your own via the Internet, books, magazine articles, etc. to see why she does it.

12.) You are filling out forms for an application. There are a couple of optional questions, one of which asks you to identify your race. Do you:
   a. choose your actual race.
   b. ignore the questions because it’s not anyone’s business.
   c. choose the race you wish you were.
   d. choose all of the above because the concept of race is an illusion.
13.) “Globalization” is a complex process that is resulting in the economic, political, and cultural interconnectedness of people around the world. This process:
   a. is clearly positive because it is helping to modernize backward peoples.
   b. is clearly negative because without it primitive cultures would be able to remain unchanged.
   c. has both negative and positive effects on communities that have traditionally been isolated.

Appendix B: Revised Cultural Anthropology Assessment Survey Questions (Fall 2014)
1.) I selected a course offered by the Department of Anthropology, rather than another social science department, because I want to learn about:
   a. other people and diverse groups from a comparative and global perspective.
   b. the social causes and consequences of human behavior.
   c. the roles of thought, emotion, and experience in individual and social behavior.
   d. how material resources are manufactured, distributed, and consumed by individuals and groups.
   e. the relationships underlying political events and conditions at a local, national, and international level.

2.) At the end of this semester I expect to have a better understanding of:
   a. human biology and behavior from an evolutionary perspective.
   b. events in the past through the materials that people left behind.
   c. how language allows people to communicate and understand their world.
   d. the factors that promote health and disease in communities around the world.
   e. how learned behaviors and ideas shape the beliefs and traditions for groups around the world.

3.) Your new next door neighbors are a household of one wife with three husbands. Your initial reaction is:
   a. to call the police.
   b. to introduce yourself and get to know them.
   c. to discuss this unnatural situation with friends and family.
   d. to discuss this with religious leaders in your community.

4.) You are interested in learning about how American Indians in Washington State traditionally fish for salmon. Which one of the following would be your first choice to learn more about this topic?
   a. Google it or look it up on the Internet.
   b. Read books about it.
   c. Go to Washington State and speak with American Indian fisherman.
   d. Watch documentaries about it on educational channels such as the History Channel, Discovery Channel, National Geographic, etc.
   e. Discuss the topic with non-Native fisherman to see what they know about it.

5.) The Sami are the indigenous people of northern Europe. Traditionally they were reindeer herders, and in the old days they herded on foot and by sleds pulled by reindeers. Now the Sami who still herd reindeer use snowmobiles. The Sami who use snowmobiles are:
   a. less traditional then the Sami who used reindeers and sleds.
   b. are simply adapting new technologies introduced by outsiders.
   c. should go back to using sleds and reindeers because it is better for the natural environment.
   d. should stop herding reindeer altogether as it is an antiquated way of life and should focus on a more modern way of making a living.
6.) Every day on your way to school you pass by the same homeless man. He is probably homeless because:
   a. he is lazy and doesn’t want to work.
   b. wealth, power, and prestige are unequally distributed in the US.
   c. he lost his job and can’t find another.
   d. he is an alcoholic.

7.) You’re planning a trip to the United Kingdom and learn that throughout history in Europe, it wasn’t uncommon for first cousins to marry. Do you:
   a. make a mental note to look for signs of inbreeding while there.
   b. wonder why they chose to do something like that and even go so far as to research it.
   c. shrug it off – to each their own, that’s what you say.

8.) You and your boyfriend (or girlfriend) are friends with an engaged couple who are Catholic. You know they use birth control and skip mass on Sundays. When you asked them why they still want to be Catholic if they can’t follow the rules, they said that their parents and grandparents would be disappointed if they left the church and didn’t raise their future kids as Catholics. You think about this and decide:
   a. they don’t want to lose their inheritances.
   b. they are hypocrites.
   c. family traditions are more important to them than religious beliefs.
   d. they should repent by going to confession and practicing penance.
   e. they don’t really believe in the tenets of their religion.

9.) When we look at cultures around the world, we can observe that in regards to leadership and power:
   a. some small groups have no system of authority and are able to achieve total equality among all members.
   b. every group has some means for defining authority.
   c. every group has one individual that controls the group, such as a president, king, or tribal chief.

10.) You are at an ethnic arts festival in downtown Kansas City, Missouri, and one of the artists is from Kenya, Africa, and one of his traditional wooden masks reminds you of Bart Simpson. You are surprised by this. Your first response is to:
   a. walk away, thinking the artist is a fake and a fraud.
   b. ask the artist about this mask.
   c. stand and stare at the mask until the artist approaches you.
   d. laugh at it and walk away.

11.) You and a friend are at the supermarket buying apples. You get a bag of red apples, but your friend says that you did not get apples, but rather you picked up a bag of large red berries. Your friend is from Africa and in her native language there is no word for a “red apple”; in her language, apples, by definition, are green. You realize that:
   a. your friend is joking with you.
   b. languages do shape how individuals view the world and the “things” in it.
   c. since your friend grew up in Africa, where apples are not that common, she does not fully understand what defines an apple.
   d. she grew up in an area with a limited variety of apples.
12.) You are filling out forms for an application. There are a couple of optional questions, one of which asks you to identify your race. Do you:
   a. choose your actual biological race.
   b. ignore the question because it’s not anyone’s business.
   c. choose the race you wish you were.
   d. answer the question even though you realize that the question is problematic because race is a false biological category.

13.) “Globalization” is a complex process that is resulting in the economic, political, and cultural interconnectedness of people around the world. This process:
   a. is clearly positive because it is helping to modernize backward peoples.
   b. is clearly negative because without it primitive cultures would be able to remain unchanged.
   c. has both negative and positive effects on communities that have traditionally been isolated.

14.) Which gender below best describes you?
   a. Male
   b. Female
   c. Other

15.) To which age group do you belong?
   a. 21 or below
   b. 22 – 29
   c. 30 – 49
   d. 50 – 67
   e. 68 or above

16.) What is your current class standing in college?
   a. Freshman/First-Year
   b. Sophomore/Second-Year
   c. Junior/Third-Year
   d. Senior/Fourth-Year
   e. Other

17.) Where do you consider yourself to be from?
   a. Kansas
   b. Missouri
   c. Somewhere else in the United States
   d. Outside the United States
Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: Preparing for College Success

Rebecca S. Davis
Kathie Good
Eastern New Mexico University

The United States of America offers the “American Dream” to all citizens. An essential element of achievement of that dream has often been the completion of high school and transition to college and career. A college degree has been viewed by the broad public as a sure and expedient pathway to success. The National Center for Educational Statistics notes that approximately 25% of individuals between the ages of 18 and 24 were enrolled in a college or university in the year 1967. The most current information based upon 2012-2013 data indicates that the number had risen to 41% with one in ten college students identifying as an individual with a disability (Davies, Scheelly, & Spooner, 2013). While an interesting statistic, the number do not adequately reflect the “facts” in regard to students with learning disabilities. In contrast to their typical peers, students with identified learning disabilities are less likely to matriculate to postsecondary education within four years of graduation. Those who do make the transition from high school to higher education are less likely to graduate, have lower GPAs, do not attempt programs with rigorous coursework, and are more likely to drop out prior to completion (Lightner, Kipps-Vaughn, Schulte, & Trice, 2012). Given these statistics, it is not unrealistic to propose that students with disabilities are more prone to failure than to success once they exit from the public school arena. While research proposes multiple explanations for lack of success in higher education (Lightner, et al., 2012; Barnard-Brak, Lechtenberger, & Lan, 2010; Sparks & Lovett, 2014; O’Neill, Markward, & French, 2012; Shepler & Woosley, 2012), the practices most likely to result in student success are not necessarily those conducted by the college student. Success—or at very least the potential for success—can be directly linked back to the public schools and the report prepared by the school diagnostician/assessment professional within the constructs of the transition plan. To better understand the phenomenon, it is helpful to consider the differences between legislation that guides K-12 practice and higher education, the differences between exiting high school seniors and college freshmen, and the accommodations/modifications typically supported in both settings.

While special education is guided by IDEA 2004 (IDEIA, 2014) and the provisions of FAPE, the same cannot be said for higher education. Once exiting the public schools and becoming college students, students with disabilities receive protection under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA, 1990) and/or Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act (1973). Under these ground-breaking provisions, the emphasis is one of “access” to education with very distinctive requirements for eligibility. Section 504 (1973) is applicable to any program (including college) or activity receiving federal financial assistance and ensures that persons with disabilities have, to the maximum extent possible, the opportunity to be fully integrated into mainstream American life. All qualified persons with disabilities, regardless of whether special education services are required in public, elementary, secondary or postsecondary settings are eligible. Section 504 does not list specific disabilities but establishes the criteria of diagnosed or perceived physical or mental impairment substantially limiting one or more major life activities as evidence of eligibility (Section 504, 1973). Under Section 504, the individual with a disability must self-identify and provide appropriate documentation and is financially responsible for the expense of an evaluation for eligibility. Services, auxiliary aids, and academic adjustments may be provided in the regular education settings.
Section 504 requires a written accommodation plan. In this venue, FAPE is modified to mean an education comparable to the education provided to students without disabilities.

The ADA (1990) extends to public or private employment, transportation, accommodations, and telecommunication regardless of whether federal funding is received. The ADA ensures that all persons with disabilities have broader coverage than even that provided by Section 504 in all aspects of discrimination law. The ADA uses the same criteria for eligibility as Section 504 and also includes HIV, contagious, and noncontagious diseases as evidence of disability. All qualified persons with disabilities and qualified non-disabled persons related to or associated with a person with a disability are covered under the act as long as the disability involves substantial limitation in one or more major life activities. Similar to Section 504, the individual with a disability must self-identify, provide varied documentation determined to be appropriate by the individual university, and is financially responsible for any expenses related to eligibility determination (ADA 1990). Services, auxiliary aids, and accommodations are provided through the institution’s ADA coordinator based on the documentation provided by the student. Specialized plans are not developed. Accommodations are identified and communicated to faculty members via email. Students must choose to either request and utilize accommodations or not.

The reality of academia is often very different from the public school environment for students with disabilities. While in public school, parents, teachers, and others actively advocated for accommodations and modifications to nurture student success. FERPA prevents those practices on the college campus. It is up to the student to request assistance. Many freshman college students “drop out” during the first semester of college, often without self-identifying or requesting accommodations that might both prolong their college careers and result in graduation (Lightner, et al., 2012; Cawthon & Cole, 2010; Sheplet & Woosley, 2012). Those students who do stay beyond the first semester often have very limited accommodations compared to what could be requested and approved by the university.

Most college students who do self-declare receive limited supports with only extended time on testing and are rarely given access to accommodations that are not typically provided in high school settings but which are instrumental to college success (Troiano, Liefeld, & Trachtenberg, 2010; Cawthon & Cole, 2010; Lightner, et al., 2012). In addition to extended time, students could receive a plethora of services under the auspices of accommodations that include but are not limited to preferential seating, alternate test format, assistive technology, classroom assistances, lab assistants, note-takers, access to faculty lecture notes, specialized residence halls, course waivers or course substitutions, preferential registration, and reduced student load for financial aid eligibility (O’Neill et al., 2012). Since accommodations in higher education are based upon documentation provided by the student, the parameters established by the public school transition team, and particularly those determined by the diagnostician/assessment professional, are paramount to future student success and college completion.

Offices of Disability Services at universities across the United States indicate that the documentation that students typically provide did not give them the information that they needed to make informed decisions about college coursework accommodations (Sparks & Lovett, 2014; Troiano, et al., 2010; O’Neill et al., 2012). Specifically, Section 504 (1973) requires that documentation must include five key elements: a diagnosis of current disability; the date of the diagnosis; how the diagnosis was reached; the credentials of the professional conducting the evaluation; an explanation of how the disability affects a major life activity and how the disability affects academic performance. Many universities continue to require the evidence of “discrepancy” between ability and performance while the public schools have increasingly replaced that method of eligibility determination with Responsiveness to Intervention (RTI). In addition, errors of omission of assessment data and the failure to include recommendations based upon both standardized assessment data and skilled observation made the approval of many accommodations difficult at best. Inter-related assessment practices have been identified, which if remedied, could result in greater access to student accommodations and success. All begin and end with the assessment report generated by the school diagnostician/assessment professional and can be categorized as issues with either currency, inclusiveness, or specificity.
The currency or recentness of documentation was consistently noted as problematic. While the ADA amendments of 2008 called for a more commonsense approach to disability acknowledgement, documentation must nevertheless describe how the condition impacts the student at the current time within the current circumstances (Association on Higher Education in Disability, 2012). Many assessment reports did not indicate when the disability was diagnosed or, if included, were not considered to be representative of current information. Testing batteries had often been conducted five or more years prior to college entry (Sparks & Lovett, 2014). Narratives accompanying the data referred to issues encountered by young adolescents rather than burgeoning adults. Consequently, potential accommodations could not be granted.

Assessment data presented as evidence of disability was considered to be inconclusive due to multiple factors (Sparks & Lovett, 2014). Some assessment reports reported only psychological assessments from a single measure, usually an IQ test, and failed to include measures of academic performance related to reading, writing, and mathematics. Accommodations related to college academics could not be granted on the basis of IQ alone. Reports that did include measures of academic skills reported test results in terms of age or grade equivalencies instead of reporting standard scores or percentiles. While age and grade equivalencies may be a common, if not acceptable indicator within the K-12 public school setting, a corresponding indicator does not exist within higher education. Assessment reports including standard scores and percentiles were considered more helpful when determining college accommodations. In addition, test selection was called into question. Dubious measures with unclear relevance to the disability were noted (Lovett & Sparks, 2014) as rational for the denial of accommodations.

Section 504 (1973) requires that evaluations be conducted by individuals qualified to both assess and report the results. Although college students presented assessment documents which were typically signed, many did not include the credentials of the individual conducting the assessment. As a result, the value of the documents could not be determined (Lovett & Sparks, 2014; Troiano, et al, 2010).

The most common, and arguably most preventable documentation-related reason for denial of accommodations was that the assessment report presented as evidence of disability failed to draw a clear connection between the diagnosed disability and the impact of the disability upon academic performance and other major life activities. Similarly, the report failed to establish a historical record of successful accommodation and the need for accommodations beyond high school (Lovett & Sparks, 2014; Troiano, et al, 2010). Consequently, accommodations could not be approved.

The reports generated by assessment professionals determine more than eligibility for special education and related services. These diagnostic catalysts are critical to the continued educational success of the student who will transition from public education to college and career. Long before the student applies for college entry, the IEP team should examine its practices in regard to documentation. The team must consider multiple factors that should be reflected in both the assessment report and in the IEP. A connection between the assessment and the recommended services must be clearly established. Meaningful accommodations must be included with historical evidence of success. Although not required for IDEA, the corresponding construction of a 504 plan can assist the student in preparing for the next phase of his/her educational journey. Forward-thinking professions can provide a bridge that is easily traversed by constructing assessment reports that conform both to IDEA and to ADA. Simple steps that open the gateway to college success.

References


---

**Accommodation Questionnaire**

1. Has the student been a true member of the IEP team? Is he/she able to articulate the nature of the disability and how it impacts academic, social, and emotional variables?
2. Have I considered the student’s educational and career goals after graduation? Are they the goals of the parent or of the student?
3. Does my report indicate areas of strength and challenge?
4. Does my report specify how the challenges impact performance?
5. Does the data support ways that accommodations can support both strengths and challenges?
6. Which accommodations currently in place provide historical evidence of success?
7. What type of assistive technology might be useful beyond high school?
8. Could this student benefit from services available at the college level that are not routinely implemented in a k-12 setting?
9. How easily could the IEP be translated into a 504 plan? Does my report meet the guidelines established by ADA?
10. Have I established a defining relationship between the diagnosis of the disability and:
    a. The impact of the disability upon student performance in terms of academics (reading, mathematics, writing) and other major life activities;
    b. Recommendations for accommodations extending beyond the k-12 setting.
A 10-Year Linear Gender Equity and Salary-Trend Study:  
A Glance at Superintendents’ Pathway to the Superintendency

Beth Gregory  
Missouri Western State University

Abstract

In previous studies, researchers found men more often occupied the role of superintendent and male superintendents received higher salaries than female superintendents on a national scale (Conroy, 2007; Gewertz, 2004; Hollingworth & Dude, 2009; Olsen, 2005). However, an updated study of Midwest superintendents, specifically those in Missouri, was lacking. Furthermore, a study of the trends in superintendency was nonexistent. This study sought to fill the void of information and investigate trend information of Missouri superintendents to determine the percentage of male and female superintendents over the past 10 years and investigate the trend of average superintendent salary by gender over the past 10 years. The study examined gender equity by salary and the percentage of male and female superintendents by school district enrollment and region of employment. Additionally, the study examined the pathway superintendents took to achieve the top position in a school district.

Findings concluded a significant inverse trend developed in the Missouri superintendent population, reflected by the growing the annual number and percentage of female superintendents over time, linked to a simultaneous decrease in the annual number and percentage of male superintendents. Statistics revealed three times as many male superintendents as female superintendents in all 10 years of the study. The percentage of female superintendents increased during the study, but men still largely outnumber women in the superintendency role.

Trend data has proven that the gap in salaries has narrowed very minimally. Bizarrely, qualitative findings revealed that male and female superintendents believe no difference exists in salary by gender. In all 10 years of the study, superintendents in large districts (> 1,000 students) had the highest mean salary, followed by superintendents in medium-sized districts (401–1,000 students). Superintendents in small districts (≤ 400 students) had the lowest mean salary.

Importance of the Study

This study added to the knowledge base on the progression of educational gender equity in the Missouri superintendency. Gender-based inequity in salary and representation is important to women as they consider superintendency as a career. Women should be aware of the implications of employment. This trend study added to the growing number of studies focused on superintendent equity in an individual state. Additionally, understanding the pathway male and female superintendents take to achieve their positions is important. This study will enable future leaders to achieve positions in the superintendency, with consideration of gender.

Statement of the Problem

This trend study addressed three separate problems. The first problem was the lack of current research concerning the percentage of male superintendents to female superintendents in the State of Missouri. The second problem was that a previous research study (Alexander, 2002) found a significant difference in Missouri salaries of male and female superintendents. The third problem was differences and trends in salary and that the percentage of male and female superintendents in Missouri is unknown.
Purpose of the Study and Research Questions

The purpose of this study was to (a) seek trend information to determine the percentage of male and female superintendents over 10 academic school years (2002–2012), (b) investigate linear salary trends based on gender, disaggregated by school-district enrollment and Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) region of employment during the 2002–2012 academic school years, and (c) investigate the employment path of Missouri superintendents.

This article addresses two main research questions:

1. What are the summary statistics reported by DESE Core Data for (a) superintendents’ gender for the 10-year period (2002–2012 academic years) and (b) superintendents’ salary, district enrollment, and region, aggregated and disaggregated by gender from 2002–2012?

2. What were superintendents’ employment paths to the superintendency?

Literature Review

When Ella Flagg Young assumed the role of superintendent of Chicago Public Schools in 1909, she stated, “In the near future, we will have more women than men in executive charge of the vast education system” (as cites in Glass, 2000, p. 28). In contrast, according to the American Association of School Administrators superintendent study, only 21.7% of superintendents are women (Glass & Franceschini, 2007) in comparison to 75% of educators being women (Blount, 1998; Cotter, Hemsen, & Vanneman, 2004). Changes have occurred for the top-leadership positions; however the changes have been slow (Hollingworth & Dude, 2009) over the past 50 years.

Studies in the past have reported gender inequity exists in the workplace (Cotter et al., 2004), in the educational arena (Mertz, 2006), and in the superintendency (Glass & Franceschini, 2007). Although workplace changes have occurred with gender equity (Cotter et al., 2004), gender inequity persists (Cotter et al., 2004; Jacobs, 1995). With a few notable female exceptions, men have dominated the superintendency (Smith, 1979). Furthermore, Alexander (2002) found lower salaries for women and more male representation in superintendency roles in a one-time study of the Missouri superintendency.

The percentage of female superintendents has increased; however, the position of superintendent has not made similar advances compared to other school-administration positions (Mertz, 2006). Skrla (1999) discovered “men are more than forty times more likely than women are to advance to the superintendency from teaching” (p. 4). Similarly, “women … are dreadfully underrepresented in the field” (Glass & Bjork, 2003, p. 271) of superintendent. Gewertz (2004) found the enrollment of the district affects superintendent compensation. Nevertheless, female superintendent salaries continue to lag behind the salaries of male superintendents (Alexander, 2002; Conroy, 2007; Gewertz, 2004; Hollingworth & Dude, 2009; Olsen, 2005).

Women are also slower to advance to the superintendency than their male counterparts. Women remain in the classroom longer before accepting their first administrative position (Grogan & Brunner, 2005). The mean age of a woman when she obtains a position as a superintendent for the first time is 47.3 years compared to 43.9 years for a man (Berg, 2008).

Design of the Study

Using a mixed-methods design, I gathered qualitative and quantitative data. Through quantitative methods, I could analyze trends in the Missouri superintendency. Quantitative methods allow the use of “postpositivist claims for developing knowledge, employs strategies of inquiry such as experiments and surveys, and collects data on predetermined instruments that yield statistical data” (Creswell, 2003, p. 18). This study used archival data from DESE Core Data. Through qualitative methods, I investigated the pathway of men and women to the role of superintendent.
Population of the Study
This mixed-methods study focused on two sets of data. I obtained the first set of data from an official at DESE through the Core Data tracking system. I obtained the second set of data from nine individual superintendent interviews.

Quantitative Data
The focus of this trend-analysis research spanned 10 years (academic school years 2002–2012), studying full-time superintendents employed by school districts in the State of Missouri during these years. The criteria for selection of these school districts and superintendent participants follow.

Criteria for selection of superintendents and school districts: All Missouri K–12 superintendents employed by public school districts that met the following criteria were included in the quantitative data: (a) districts that had a full-time superintendent, identified by the School Core Data for the academic year, and (b) districts that reported the superintendent’s salary and the school-district enrollment. I used only data received from a DESE official. If data for a school district were missing for an academic year, I did not use those data; however, I still included the other 9 years reported. As of the 2010 school year, 524 public school districts employed superintendents; I analyzed these to determine how many met the criteria.

Source of data: The data source for historic and public-record information was DESE. A DESE official provided the following information from the academic years 2002–2012: a list of all Missouri superintendents, school-district name and county code, school-district enrollment, gender of superintendent, employment status of superintendent, and salary of the superintendent. DESE officials compiled and presented the data on Missouri public schools as 2002–2012 School Core Data to multiple organizations, government offices, school districts, and individuals, upon request. The data were self-reported by district officials through a web-based system six times during the year (August, October, December, February, April, and June).

Qualitative Data
I used quantitative data from the academic school year 2011–2012 to classify male and female superintendents. I assigned each superintendent a number using a random-number generator to choose five male and five female superintendents to interview. When a superintendent did not respond or consent to participate in the study, I generated another number as a replacement. I made one attempt for each superintendent that did not respond.

Quantitative Findings and Analysis
I addressed one quantitative research question in this article on descriptive statistics: What are the summary statistics reported by DESE Core Data for (a) Missouri superintendents’ genders from 2003–2012, and (b) Missouri superintendents’ salary, enrollment, aggregated by region and disaggregated by gender, from 2003–2012?

Number of superintendents: The annual variation in the number of Missouri school superintendents reported to DESE who met the qualifications for this study each year from 2003 to 2012 is illustrated in Figure 1. The total number of superintendents increased from 436 to 459 between 2003 and 2007, dropped to a low of 388 in 2009, and subsequently increased to 455 by 2012. The total annual number of male superintendents exhibited a similar pattern. The total annual number of female superintendents increased from a minimum of 66 to 99 between 2003 and 2007, dropped to 79 between 2008 and 2009, then increased to a maximum of 98 between 2010 and 2012.

Annual variations in the percentage of male and female Missouri school superintendents (as a percentage of the annual total) each year from 2003 to 2012 is illustrated in Figure 2. Between 2003 and 2007 the percentage of male superintendents that met the qualifications for this study fell from a maximum of 84.9% to a minimum of 78.4% in 2007, then increased to 80.3% in 2008, and subsequently fell to 78.5% between 2009 and 2012. The percentage of female superintendents that met the qualifications for this study increased from a minimum of 15.1% in 2003 to a maximum of 21.6% in 2007, then fell to 19.7% in 2008, followed by an increase from 20.4% to 21.5% between 2009 and 2012.

Superintendents’ salary: The mean annual salary of the female superintendents increased from a minimum of $76,922 in 2003, climbed to a maximum of $103,590 in 2010, but declined thereafter to $99,526 in 2012 as illustrated in Figure 3. The minimum mean annual salary of the male superintendents...
was $87,316 in 2003 ($10,334 higher than the females). The mean salary of the male superintendents then increased to $105,476 in 2009, dropped to $104,466 in 2010, but climbed to a maximum of $108,703 in 2012 as illustrated in Figure 4. The maximum mean salary of the male superintendents in 2012 was $9,177 higher than the maximum mean salary of the female superintendents in 2012. Although this article focuses mainly on summary statistics and qualitative measures, Tables 1-3 are included in the appendix for more quantitative information.

Superintendents’ salary by enrollment of district: The descriptive statistics for K–12 enrollment across the 10 districts are presented in Figure 5 for female superintendents and Figure 6 for male superintendents. The mean enrollment with female superintendents increased from 1,400 in 2003 to a maximum of 2,302 in 2007 then fell to a minimum of 1,541 in 2012. The mean enrollment with male superintendents fluctuated less, ranging from a maximum of 2,100 in 2003 to a minimum of 1,858 in 2008, rising to 2,017 in 2012. Tables 4-5 are included in the appendix for more quantitative information about superintendents’ salary by enrollment of district.

The mean annual salaries of superintendents, disaggregated by three categories of enrollment versus years, are visualized by line graphs in Figures 7 for women and 8 for men. The reader can visualize a clear trend for an increase in salary between Enrollment Category 1 (43–400 students); Category 2 (401–1,000 students), and Category 3 (> 1,000 students) for male and female superintendents. Although this article focuses mainly on summary statistics and qualitative measures, Tables 6-7 are included in the appendix for more quantitative information.

Following the data collection and the analysis of the quantitative data, the following results emerged:

- School districts employed three times as many male superintendents as female superintendents in all 10 years of the study. Men still dominate the position of superintendency. This research shows that women are still “dreadfully underrepresented in the field” (Glass & Bjork, 2003, p. 271) of superintendency.
- The percentage of female superintendents increased by 6.4% from 2003–2012. This finding suggests that the gap in the number of male and female superintendents may be starting to close, but, at the present rate, it will take several more decades for women to obtain as many superintendent positions in the State of Missouri.
- Male superintendents’ mean salary was higher for each year of the study than female superintendents statewide and in every region of the state except the northwest region. This finding suggests male–female wage discrimination is still evident in the Missouri superintendency. Women were not earning the same salaries as their male counterparts.
- In all 10 years of the study, superintendents in large districts (> 1,000 students) had the highest mean salary, followed by superintendents in medium-sized districts (401–1,000 students). Superintendents in small districts (≤ 400 students) had the lowest mean salary. This reinforces Gewertz’s (2004) previous research that found district enrollment affected superintendent compensation.
- The mean salary of male superintendents was higher than that of female superintendents who were employed in small-sized school districts (≤400 students) for every year in the study.
- The mean salary of male superintendents was higher than that of female superintendents who were employed in medium-sized school districts (401–1,000 students) for every year in the study except 2010.
- The mean salary of male superintendents was higher than that of female superintendents who were employed in large-sized school districts (> 1,000 students) in 2003, 2004, 2005, 2006, 2007, and 2012. Female superintendents in large school districts had a higher salary in 2008–2011.
Qualitative-Interview Method

The interview method employed was a phenomenological qualitative study (Creswell, 2007) that used participant interviews with full-time Missouri superintendents. I interviewed nine full-time superintendents who were employed in the 2011–2012 school year. I classified superintendents into two groups: men and women (according to DESE data).

The interview question was intentionally broad for participants to better expose themselves: What was your employment path to the superintendency? Following the interview questions, I used probes to clarify information. This grand-tour question was supported by a literature review that either reinforced or contradicted the findings. I transcribed all interviews following the interview process and coded all transcripts using an open-coding system. I determined commonalities between the interviews and determined themes from resounding data.

**Interview creation:** I conducted Random sampling (Merriam, 1998) to choose five female superintendents and five male superintendents from a list of full-time superintendents obtained from the Missouri DESE. The list of full-time superintendents from 2012 included 99 female superintendents and 356 male superintendents. I used a random-number generator to select five men and five women, regardless of the employment region in Missouri or the enrollment of the district where the superintendent was employed.

After randomly choosing potential participants, I contacted the superintendents chosen by e-mail and invited them to participate in the study. Four female superintendents and one male superintendent responded to the initial invitation. I e-mailed each potential participant who responded a copy of the informed-consent letter and participant form. I asked potential participants to provide a telephone number to use for the interview and a day and time that would be convenient for the interview. I instructed potential participants to sign and return the consent form prior to participating in the interview.

After several days, I sent another invitation to the potential participants who did not respond. I offered them the ability to interview by an asynchronous Internet application instead of a telephone interview, to accommodate their schedules. None of the superintendents responded to the second invitation. By e-mail, I disseminated five subsequent invitations to four male superintendents and one female superintendent, to obtain additional potential participants. These invitations garnered four male participants and no female participants, resulting in a total of nine participants: five men and four women.

**Interview-participant demographics:** Nine full-time superintendents in Missouri agreed to participate and signed consent forms: four women and five men. For purposes of anonymity, the regions and district enrollment where the superintendents were employed will be kept confidential. I reference participants by masculine or feminine pseudonyms. I assigned female participants the pseudonyms Jill, Ella, Kami, and Megan; the male participants by Alex, Beau, Clay, Drew, and Ty.

**Interview setting:** Originally, I intended interviews to be conducted by telephone. Due to lack of response from the initial e-mail, when subsequent invitations were sent, I gave participants the option to choose a telephone interview or an asynchronous application. Eight participants chose a telephone interview and one participant chose to complete the interview via an asynchronous application.

**Qualitative Data Collection**

Telephone interviews were lighthearted, which allowed participants the ability to gain trust, and be able to share information openly. The process of using an asynchronous application allowed for an open-ended discussion with questions flowing between the participant and researcher. Both data-collection techniques provided for thick, rich descriptions by participants (Merriam, 1998).

The interview process took place over a 3-week period. Several e-mail exchanges happened with each participant prior to conducting the interview to determine the day and time of the interview. Telephone interviews ranged from 5 to 20 minutes in length. The telephone interviews took place at the convenience of the participant; some participants chose to be interviewed early in the morning whereas others chose to have day or evening interviews. Eight participants shared a large amount of information, whereas one participant was more reserved in sharing information, resulting in a less descriptive interview.
Qualitative Data Analysis and Findings

After each interview, I created a transcript to be used in analysis. I employed Creswell’s (2007) phenomenological method of analyzing participants’ transcripts for the data analysis. Changes to the transcript included amending the interview questions as needed, based on previous participants’ comments, reading through the completed transcripts for an overall feeling of the interview, identifying significant phrases and topics in the interview, and identifying emerging themes common to other participants’ responses. Finally, I consulted literature about each theme as it emerged to provide a richer examination of the themes. The resulting themes conveyed an in-depth look at the phenomenon of superintendents’ pathway to the superintendency.

Ensuring external and internal validity of the study entailed using multiple qualitative research methods. To ensure respondent safeguards, I gained Institutional Review Board approval, issued consent letters to all participants stating their rights as participants in the study, and collected informed-consent forms from all participants prior to pursing the interviews. To ensure validity, I used an adequate sample size and conducted interviews until achieving saturation of data. I employed the use of thick rich description of the phenomenon (Creswell, 2003).

Researchers achieve triangulation of data by using data collected through several methods. Creswell (2003) discussed the use of many sources as a way of increasing the reliability of the study. In this study, I achieved triangulation by evaluating the interview transcripts with the quantitative data and findings gathered from the study and with previous literature.

For themes to emerge, I began by reading each transcript. After reviewing each transcript, I began coding with four highlighters of various colors. The various colored highlighters represented the common phrases and ideas that emerged through the nine transcripts. Additionally, I listed significant statements that coalesced to form the themes.

Theme 1: District enrollment affects salary.

Participant input. A theme that emerged from participant interviews was a discussion of school enrollment. All nine superintendent participants shared the belief that enrollment size affects superintendents’ salary. Two participants in smaller districts believed they could make just as high a salary teaching or being a principal in a larger district. Beau, who was a principal at a larger school, then took a superintendent position in a smaller district, shared, “When I came to [the school], it was a smaller school, so I took quite a pay cut there. I am just now making about what I made at [my former school] as principal.” Ty, a superintendent in a smaller district, reinforced that idea by stating, “I’d probably be within less than $10,000 of what I’m making now and that’d be as a teacher.”

Literature-review input: Supporting the findings in this study, Gewertz (2004) discovered that large urban districts paid superintendents the highest salary. Salaries declined in a pattern: those in medium urban districts, then suburban districts, and then small-town districts earned less. Rural-district superintendents made the least.

Theme 2: Time in the classroom.

Participant input: Another theme that emerged from participant interviews was the amount of time spent in a classroom teaching. All nine superintendents described the number of years they served as a classroom teacher, number of years as an administrator prior to becoming a superintendent, and number of years as a superintendent. All female superintendents interviewed taught for more than 10 years prior to becoming an administrator. All male superintendents interviewed taught for 10 years or less prior to becoming an administrator. Megan, a female superintendent, shared the following, “I never planned to be an administrator, I don’t think anyone plans to be one.” Ty, a male superintendent, shared that “every job I’ve had I’ve always gravitated to the leadership role or management. It’s been a natural gravitation. When I got started in [the job], … usually within 6 months I’m in some supervisory role.” Ty said, “the same thing happened when I got into teaching.”

Literature-review input: Consistent with the findings from this study, previous research showed women remain in the classroom longer before accepting their first administrative position (Grogan & Brunner, 2005). Consistent with this study, researchers showed almost 40% of male superintendents have
5 or fewer years of experience in the classroom (Grogan & Brunner, 2005). Similar to a couple of female superintendents in the study, Young and McLeod (2001) found out that many women do not aspire to administration early in their careers. Additionally, Berg (2008) discovered the mean age of a woman when she obtains a position as a superintendent for the first time is 47.3 years compared to 43.9 years for a male.

**Theme 3: Gender.**

**Participant input:** Another theme that emerged from participant interviews was the topic of gender and its role in salary and administrative opportunities. Seven of the nine participants (four men and three women) believed that gender did not affect superintendents’ salaries. Two participants (one man and one woman) believed that gender does affect a superintendent’s salary. Two superintendents shared that they believe gender can affect one’s ability to be considered for the position of superintendent.

Several superintendents discussed their beliefs about if a superintendent’s gender affected salary. Clay, a male superintendent stated, “I think [the school board] decide what they’re going to pay usually up-front” prior to interviewing candidates. Ty, another male superintendent, agreed “gender doesn’t play into it as far as the salary schedule.” Other superintendents felt that gender did affect salary. Ella, a female superintendent, said “I still believe that women are not seen as heads of household and therefore are seen as not needing to make the same kinds of salaries as men in the same position as heads of households.” Beau, a male superintendent, discussed the topic of salary saying, “I would say if [my salary] had been affected by gender, it’s been in a positive way. I realize probably as a female, I may have come in and they may have paid me less.”

Although some superintendents discussed salary, other superintendents focused on the opportunity of administrative positions for women. Ty stated,

> Gender, doesn’t play into it as far as the salary schedule. Now, in my opinion, that there are areas of the state, there are areas of the country that gender may play into whether or not you get the job. That’s the culture of wherever that place happens to be.

Ty continued, saying, “There’s that predisposition of a woman doesn’t need to be in this job.” Jill, a female superintendent agreed with Ty, stating, “I do think there are some districts that would not hire a woman administrator.” Jill continued by saying, “I do think in some rural areas you might be able to be a principal, but I don’t think they would ever hire a female superintendent.”

**Literature-review input:** Although the majority of participants interviewed did not believe that gender affects a superintendent’s salary, the majority of research shows that it does. Although women’s salaries have improved, female-superintendent salaries continue to lag behind the salary of male superintendents (Alexander, 2002; Conroy, 2007; Gewertz, 2004; Hollingworth & Dude, 2009; Olsen, 2005). Alexander (2002) found that male superintendents in the State of Missouri received about $10,000 more per year than female superintendents.

Although literature affirmed that women’s salaries are lower than men’s salaries, women also have a difficult time being hired for a superintendent position. VanTuyle and Watkins (2009) discovered that female superintendents face numerous barriers in their climb to the top position. A superintendent in Gulick’s (2009) study stated, “the hardest part is getting the job.” She continued by saying “The best part is that once I got it, I never felt like I was being compared to a man. It’s almost as the gender line just vanished” (¶ 9).

**Theme 4: Teaching level.**

**Participant input:** All nine participants taught at the high school level prior to becoming a superintendent; none of the participants were previous elementary teachers. Ella stated, “I started in teaching the advanced science classes at the high school level.” All but one of the male superintendents mentioned coaching along with teaching. Alex, a male superintendent stated, “I started out as a math teacher and a coach.”

**Literature-review input:** Glass and Franceschini (2007) supported the findings from the study, finding that more secondary principals advance to the superintendency than elementary principals. Glass et al. (2000) found that the elementary teaching experience limits the possibility of attaining future administrative positions. VanTuyle and Watkins (2009) believed that “women aspiring to the
superintendency should be informed of the most successful pathways to the superintendency” (p. 148). VanTuyle and Watkins addressed secondary principalships as a vehicle to achieve a superintendency position.

Summary

Statistical evidence addressed the quantitative research questions. A significant inverse trend developed in the Missouri superintendent population between 2003 and 2012, reflected by the growth in the annual number and percentage of female superintendents over time, linked to a simultaneous decrease in the annual number and percentage of male superintendents. Statistics revealed three times as many male superintendents as female superintendents in all 10 years of the study. The percentage of female superintendents has increased by 6.4% from 2003–2012, demonstrating that men still largely outnumber women in the superintendency role.

Trend data has proven that the gap in salaries has narrowed very minimally. In 2003 the mean salary of women was $10,344 lower than that of men. Ten years later, in 2012, the mean salary of female superintendents was still $9,177 lower than that of men. Thus, in 10 years, minimal changes occurred regarding the difference in salary for female superintendents compared to male superintendents. Bizarrely, qualitative findings revealed that male and female superintendents believe no difference exists in salary by gender.

In all 10 years of the study, superintendents in large districts (>1,000 students) had the highest mean salary, followed by superintendents in medium-sized districts (401–1,000 students). Superintendents in small districts (≤400 students) had the lowest mean salary. The mean salary of male superintendents is higher than that of female superintendents who were employed in small-sized school districts (≤400 students) for every year in the study. The mean salary of male superintendents is higher than that of female superintendents who were employed in medium-sized school districts (401–1,000 students) for every year in the study except 2010. The mean salary of male superintendents was higher than female superintendents who were employed in large-sized school districts (>1,000 students) in 2003, 2004, 2005, 2006, 2007, and 2012. Female superintendents in large school districts had a higher salary in 2008–2011.

I conducted interviews with nine participants. I presented an examination of the transcripts, coupled with a second literature review. Common themes of district enrollment, time in classroom, salary, and teaching level emerged.

Concluding Remarks

A multitude of salary and gender percentage trends in the Missouri superintendency were evident. In the ever-changing world of education, the trends will continue to grow and change. Aspiring superintendents would do well to remember that many paths exist to the superintendency, but some may be more successful than others. Additional research should be completed to widen the scope of understanding of the trends apparent in the Missouri superintendency and the pathways to the superintendency.
References
Glass, T. (2000). Where are all the women superintendents? The School Administrator, 57(6), 28–32.
Figure 1. Number of Missouri superintendents versus years.

Figure 2. Percentage of male and female Missouri superintendents versus years.
Figure 3. Mean annual salary of female superintendents ± 95% confidence intervals.

Figure 4. Mean annual salary of male superintendents ± 95% confidence intervals.
Figure 5. Annual mean enrollment with female superintendents.

Figure 6. Annual mean enrollment with male superintendents.
Figure 7. Mean annual salaries of female superintendents disaggregated by enrollment.

Figure 8. Mean annual salary of male superintendents disaggregated by enrollment.

Table 1
Linear Regression of Annual Salary vs. Year for Male Superintendents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regression</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>R²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-5026763</td>
<td>-13.29</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slope</td>
<td>2552</td>
<td>13.56</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 2
*Linear Regression of Annual Salary vs. Year for Female Superintendents*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regression</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>$t$</th>
<th>$p$</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-5940573</td>
<td>-7.56</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
<td>6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slope</td>
<td>3004</td>
<td>7.68</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3
*ANCOVA to Compare Linear Regression of Annual Salary vs. Year by Gender*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Null Hypothesis</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>$p$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercepts are equal</td>
<td>2.443E11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.443E11</td>
<td>232.844</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slopes are zero</td>
<td>2.533E11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.533E11</td>
<td>241.454</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slopes are equal</td>
<td>2.427E10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.427E10</td>
<td>23.135</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>4.624E12</td>
<td>4408</td>
<td>1.049E9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4.616E13</td>
<td>4411</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Total</td>
<td>4.894E12</td>
<td>4410</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4
*Regression of Enrollment with Female Superintendents vs. Years*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regression</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>$t$</th>
<th>$p$</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-54028.398</td>
<td>-.597</td>
<td>.551</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slope</td>
<td>27.837</td>
<td>.617</td>
<td>.537</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 5

*Regression of Enrollment with Male Superintendents vs. Years*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regression</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>R²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>30287.314</td>
<td>.704</td>
<td>.482</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slope</td>
<td>-14.092</td>
<td>-.657</td>
<td>.511</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6

*ANOVA for Effects of Year and Enrollment on Salary of Female Superintendents*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>4.452E10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4.947E9</td>
<td>9.676</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment</td>
<td>3.981E11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.991E11</td>
<td>389.351</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year X Enrollment</td>
<td>9.129E9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5.072E8</td>
<td>.992</td>
<td>.467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>4.187E11</td>
<td>819</td>
<td>5.113E8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 7

*ANOVA for Effects of Year and Enrollment on Salary of Male Superintendents*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Type III Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>2.005E11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.227E10</td>
<td>40.007</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrollment</td>
<td>1.745E12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.724E11</td>
<td>1567.057</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year x Enrollment</td>
<td>4.128E10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2.293E9</td>
<td>4.119</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>1.966E12</td>
<td>3532</td>
<td>5.567E8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mapping Knowledge: Teaching and Learning Tools

Taralynn Hartsell
The University of Southern Mississippi

Introduction

Concept and mind maps have benefits in teaching and learning of new material. Educators use maps to display major and minor topics pertaining to a course, to select what content to include, develop instructional objectives and materials, and assess learners through map construction. As a visual diagram, maps accommodate learners of various styles, particularly visual learners. Maps help learners make connections and associations between existing knowledge and new information being taught. As part of map creation, learners actively participate in the knowledge construction as both old and new information complement one another and help make abstract concepts more understandable.

Students learn information and content through various means. Based upon learning styles of the individuals, acquiring information depends upon using strategies that work best for them. Some require aural or auditory cues to help them assimilate and recall learned material, while others prefer observation and more physical approaches toward acquiring a new skill. Visual learners rely upon graphics, diagrams, and images to help them retain information and integrate new knowledge with the old. With these differences in mind, educators need to consider using different instructional strategies that meet learners’ requirements. Recognizing a person’s learning style “is enhanced by instruction that is tailored in some way to that student’s learning style” (Pashler, McDaniel, Rohrer, & Bjork, 2008, p. 108) and the “match between format and preference promises to facilitate learning processes and to enhance learning performance” (Kolloffel, 2012, p.697).

Presenting instruction through graphical means assist learners to improve their comprehension and retention of information. This process is referred to as visual learning (O’Bannon & Puckett, 2010). Concept and mind maps can be used as a method for accommodating different learning styles through visual representation. These tools provide a mechanism for students to grasp and comprehend complex material as, “Information and content presented in text-based formats can be more easily understood once images and links between the concepts, supplemented with words and notes, are offered” (Hartsell, 2015, p.203). Visual learning methods such as concept mapping and mind mapping provide a tool for understanding knowledge and concepts, regardless of whether the maps are provided by teacher or created by students (Davies, 2011).

This paper defines and discusses practical uses of concept and mind maps in relation to their applications in teaching and learning. Benefits of implementing mapping tools in education are described for various topic areas. Suggestions and recommendations for using maps in certain contexts are offered to demonstrate how mapping accommodates different learner needs based upon the author’s experiences.

Definition

The implementation of concept and mind maps in instruction is not an archaic idea. Both originated in the 1970s from two individuals. Concepts maps were originally based on the research performed by James Novak at Cornell University and mind maps by Tony Buzman (Hegazy, Ali, & Abdel-Monem, 2011). Novak and his team of researchers tried to determine how first and second grade children acquire basic science concepts and what effect this learning would have on their later schooling. Concept maps were invented as a result of this research that integrated Ausabel’s subsumption theory for creating meaningful learning by bridging existing knowledge with new knowledge (Novak, 1980; Novak & Canas, 2006). Learners were tasked to make connections between concepts given in visual diagrams, tying the
old with the new to formulate improved cognitive structures. Mind maps invented by Buzman (1991) revolved around the idea of brainstorming ideas in creative ways. He did not want creators to be limited to just known facts, but to also integrate individual thought processes. Thus, according to Buzman right or wrong answers do not exist. Both forms have expanded beyond serving education as business, government, healthcare, engineering, and science fields also use these as brainstorming and organizational tools.

Concept maps are basically diagrams showing relationships among concepts, ideas, etc. Eppler (2006) defines concept maps as, “a top-down diagram showing the relationships between concepts, including cross connections among concepts, and their manifestations” (p. 203). Concepts or ideas are represented with shapes called nodes. Shapes could be circles, squares, and other forms to help the creator indicate different levels of concepts. Concepts are connected with labeled lines with or without arrows called links. The links demonstrate relationships between the nodes and could be unidirectional or bidirectional. Some links have a linking word or phrase to explain the relationship between concepts such as "needed to show," "may generate," "absorbed by," or "includes." Although these linking words are not necessary, they do serve to help the viewer make connections and understand the flow of ideas presented.

Mind maps are constructed similarly to concept maps with some differences. Concepts and ideas are still presented, but not necessarily through shapes. Mind maps often use images and colors to indicate relationships. Eppler (2006) defines mind maps as “a multi-coloured and image-centred, radial diagram that represents semantic or other connections between portions of learned material hierarchically” (p. 203). Although mind maps still have links, they are often in the form of branches like a tree. Some say that mind maps allow more creativity on part of the creator to show understanding, thought processes, or representing a larger system (e.g., environmental conditions). Mind maps are created with a freestyle process, without being restricted to a particular structure (Wheeldon, 2011). In other words, mind maps can become crazy based upon the expression of the creator. Regardless of the type, both techniques are complementary. They help the creator develop various skills such as identifying key concepts, organizing ideas, recognizing patterns, and form a better understanding of the context.

Implications in Teaching and Learning

Concept and mind maps have practical applications in education. As visual learning aids, maps provide an alternative method for acquiring and understanding information as they, “assist both instructors and learners in facilitating the presentation and acquisition of knowledge. Information and content presented in text-based formats can be more easily understood once images and links between the concepts, supplemented with words and notes, are offered” (Hartsell, 2015, p. 203). Serving as a graphic organizer to present information to learners to help with memorization, recall, comprehension of material, note-taking, brainstorming, and more, maps are an avenue to help instructors teach abstract material and learners to grasp it.

Teaching with Maps

Concept and mind maps are valuable instructional resources for educators. Primarily, maps help educators in three ways: (1) prepare and review curriculum, lesson plans, and instructional materials, (2) serve as an instructional material and resource, and (3) provide a method for evaluation and assessment (Edwards & Cooper, 2010). Maps assist educators to plan, organize, manage, and adapt their instruction to meet learners’ needs. They provide educators with a way to "design units of study that are meaningful, relevant, pedagogically sound, and interesting to students” (Martin, 1994, p. 28).

Maps are effective planning devices for instruction. As part of lesson preparation, maps assist educators in identifying exactly what they want their students to learn. The question of what topics should be taught to students now becomes “what do they want their students to learn or gain?” The focus shifts away from the content and to the learners. This may lead toward better development of learning objectives as educators concentrate more on what they expect learners to know and do as a result of instruction, than focusing solely on covering as much content possible. This occurs during the map’s development as key areas are identified. Curriculum materials and assessment measures are then created as result of this focus.
When creating a course or lesson map, educators can begin to obtain a holistic picture of the content being taught and make some key decisions. As the map develops, educators can begin to see relationships between topics and identify areas that appear trivial. For instance, in teaching about the American Revolution, what an educator thought to be an area of significance (e.g., timeline of major battles) becomes less so when creating the map (e.g., location and major figures begin to dominate the map). The educator can then switch the train of thought in the lessons and direct attention to other major areas. Further, during map development educators can also begin to discover themes to emphasize. The educator has not only identified that knowing the timeline is minor, but sees (a) events that helped Americans win the revolution and (b) the key individuals involved in this victory as major themes to direct more attention to. In fact, the educator may want to go further in-depth on just these two thematic areas in the American Revolution and omit the rest. Thus, maps help identify areas to focus upon that could lead toward creating more effective objectives and materials.

Maps themselves serve as an instructional resource. Maps created by educators can provide students with effective learning and study tools. As a course overview, maps allow students to see the entire picture and areas that will be covered. This provides students with a preview of what is to come and what areas are focused upon more heavily. Students can then begin to plan their learning by using the maps. Teacher-created maps also help visually explain the relationship between topics and learning objectives in the course. As a prompting tool, maps can be used in conjunction with other instructional strategies and materials such as cue cards or matched with presentation slides (Edwards & Cooper, 2010). As a summary tool, students can focus on key topics and remain on target (Edwards & Cooper, 2010). This relates to maps being graphic organizers that permit learners to examine patterns and relationships through the visual representation of information as a whole (Lerner, 2000). Being able to see a summary of general course concepts can increase the ability to provide meaningfulness through the integration of concepts.

Concept and mind maps also support learning assessment. Traditional examinations often focus on having students regurgitate facts in the form of questions, essays, fill-ins, matching, reordering, etc. Maps could be used in a similar way, but through visual cues. Students could be given a map with just the central idea or topic (e.g., Environmental Protection) and then asked to complete the map with everything they know about the topic and their relationships (e.g., is related to recycling that is related to reducing landfill). Other ways to use maps as an assessment is to return the course or lesson map created without text in the nodes and have students complete the map as given to them prior. This would help in assessing recall of information that is directly tied to the learning objectives.

Overall, maps help educators design courses that are well-integrated, coherently sequenced, and ensure continuity from one term, lecture, or lesson. Teacher-created maps help educators plan for instruction and aid in the creation and use of instructional materials and assessments that measures specified learning objectives. Maps can also be distributed among students to benefit their learning and comprehension of the course topics to be covered.

Learning with Maps

Learners benefit from maps as both a learning and study tool. As a learning support tool, maps can be used “as a scaffold to understand or to consolidate educational experiences, as a medium to improve affective conditions for learning, as an aid or alternative to traditional writing, and as a way to improve critical thinking” (Arruarte, Elorriaga, Calvo, Larranaga, & Rueda, 2012, p. 795). These areas represent how maps can assist learners to perform certain tasks as required by the teacher.

Learning content that is meaningful and relevant is important. Maps address personal learning styles and prior experience, especially when learners personally make connections between concepts and topics based on what they know. Davies (2011) mention five ways that maps can help improve learning: (1) meaningful learning occurs through maps, (2) presentation of new material is to build upon existing knowledge, (3) information presented is usable, (4) maps complement the way learners remember information, and (5) build new and meaningful knowledge through active engagement. First, when new learning is integrated into the “knowledge structure and prior concepts of the student, meaningful learning occurs” (Davies, 2011, p. 290). Student-created maps allow learners to connect new knowledge based
upon prior experiences, thus making the maps relevant to them. Second, maps are useful in presenting new material that builds upon prior knowledge or “knowledge to be learned must be relevant to other knowledge and must contain significant concepts and propositions” (Hay, Kinchin, & Lygo-Baker, 2008, p. 297). If prior knowledge is well-defined and not misconceived, new learning can be scaffolded through the construction of maps. Maps provide the cues to aid in learning and retrieval of information. Further, maps provide a way for learners to use the information and link it to what they already know. Studying or creating a map based upon what learners know improves learning because the information is now usable to them. In addition, maps complement learners by helping with cognitive load. Memory has limitations to the amount of information it can maintain. The structure of maps can help learners remember more because the information is chunked into categories and presented visually through colors and images. Finally, student-created maps provide learners with the opportunity to actively partake in their knowledge construction. Once learners become actively and mentally engaged, learning once again becomes meaningful. Thus, the information is retained longer in memory if learners have not participated in the knowledge construction (Hay, Kinchin, & Lygo-Baker, 2008).

Requiring learners to create their own concept and mind maps help them learn complex material more effectively (Harris & Zha, 2013). Student-created maps permit learners to examine content from their own perspectives and experiences, and graphically display this new knowledge and understanding in a map. Creativity is involved as students design the maps to represent their thinking and personal reflection. Images, color, text, links, and notes are integrated as learners design and develop maps. This in turn motivates learners to delve deeper into the content, perform research, collaborate with fellow learners to obtain ideas and feedback, and share their maps with others (Paxman, 2011). The end result is a longer retention of information.

There are several uses of student-created maps. A primary use is to help the learner brainstorm, organize, and research information related to a project. For instance, learners of any age have difficulty in writing and knowing what information to include. If students use maps as a way to brainstorm and organize their ideas, this will help with the writing process. The process is similar to creating outlines, but maps provide the visual learning aspect that allow more creativity in the representation of ideas. Further, because learners now see the entire picture on one-page, they can begin identifying areas that would be more relevant and restructure those areas to form an outline for the written project. Another use of maps would be to storyboard projects, particularly multimedia and web sites such as presentations and video (O’Bannon & Puckett, 2010). Maps, like individual slides or wireframes, can help learners construct and organize the flow of ideas from one slide or page to another. The maps serve as a foundation for the creation of more detailed storyboards later as learners begin to describe and sketch the layout, content and image placement, audio narration, text content, interactivity, etc. into the formal storyboards. Further, maps can be used as part of poster and research presentations. As part of the presentation, learners construct maps to demonstrate results of their research to fellow classmates. Maps are aids to demonstrate the process, idea, concept, etc. discovered by the learner by showing how the connections, conclusions, and relationships between different ideas or concepts during the research process are formalized. In short, maps can be used in many instances to promote active learning.

**Practical Applications**

Concept and mind maps have practical uses in teaching content, assessing learning, and assisting students to acquire new information. This author has used concept maps to either summarize course content or require students to create concept maps of their own (Hartsell, 2015). As a result, this author has some practical suggestions concerning the creation and integration of maps in teaching and learning. With the assistance of technology programs and software, creating maps has become simpler, more appealing in structure and design, and adaptable to different situations (e.g., make changes to pre-created maps instantly when ideas change). Map making software are available commercially or for free, and each have its benefits and limitations. The following content describes how maps have been used in the author’s courses and the types of software used.
Examples of Using Maps in Teaching

Maps, as opposed to outlines, have provided learners with a graphical overview of topics covered in the courses. The author has provided a course map as a summary tool to help learners, particularly graduate students, obtain an overall perspective of what areas will be covered in the course. Textbook chapter maps have also been created to help guide learners to recognize and focus on key points presented in the reading material. The graphical chapter maps assist students in associating words, terminologies, examples, etc. in the readings with nodes, images, color, categories, and notes given in the maps. Instructionally, maps have been designed to keep learners on track as they make connections between the maps and the course materials and readings.

Inspiration software has been used for creating these maps. Using commercial software like Inspiration has permitted the author to integrate various features such as color, images, notes, links, and hyperlinks to Web sites and to other files. The author is able to transform concepts into a map that is both appealing and functional to assist learners to understand course content. Another nice feature of Inspiration is the simple conversion of the maps to Word documents, PowerPoint, graphic files, and even Web pages. This permits flexibility on part of the author to make the maps and their content accessible to students who do not have Inspiration software on personal devices. For learners who are more text-oriented, Inspiration allows the graphic map to be shown as a traditional outline with a click of a button. This feature helps accommodate learners with various needs.

Examples of Using Maps in Learning

As a learning tool, maps have been assigned to learners as part of course projects such as summarizing a chapter, creating maps for their future classrooms, identifying key concepts of a topic to be shared with others, and storyboarding media projects. In a technology applications in education course taught by the author, pre-service teacher education students are required to create a map on either a textbook chapter or a topic that they would teach in a future K-12 classroom (e.g., math, history, science, language arts). Students have used Inspiration to create these maps. This easy to use commercial software program provides students in the course an opportunity to utilize features not available in a pen-and-paper method. Students are allowed to use Inspiration in the computer labs, or download a thirty-day trial on personal devices to complete the map. The project is intended to introduce this type of instructional method to pre-service students that they could use in future classrooms, as well as using various technology software to develop instructional materials.

For an assignment in a graduate instructional technology course, the author has required students to create a map to contrast three different learning theories and its implications on technology and design. Software for this project is Spicynodes. This online software is available for free and a little different from other concept mapping programs. The program allows students to create nodes, enter notes or descriptions, insert images, and select different styled themes. The map, once created, is displayed online through a Web address. The display of the map is different from other mapping software in that the entire map is not shown. Instead, as a person wants to view the sub-topics and its topics, the map itself expands and displays just the topic area leaving everything else minimized. Some students find this cumbersome with the map’s minimizing and expanding effects. Others like this feature because it allows the viewers to hone and focus on one area at a time. Another limitation of the program is that this map cannot be saved to the computer or printed.

The author has also required students to create maps as part of a storyboard project for developing instructional course Web sites. Students create a map for their soon-to-be-created online course site and pretend that each node would become a Web page in itself. For each node, students would create a more detailed storyboard with sketches, images, instructions, etc. describing the Web page. Graduate students use a free mind mapping software, Text 2 Mind, to create this map. This program is available online and allows the student to enter their main ideas and topic areas into an outline form that transfers to a map. This is a very simple program, and thus, a limitation. A student can change the font and color of nodes and links, but that is about all. Images cannot be inserted and no text notes are allowed. Basically, students get what they see online. However, the program does have its benefits in that the map can be saved to a computer as an image file or PDF and printed.
Suggestions on Using Maps

If an educator decides to integrate mapping as a form of classroom activity, certain processes and steps should be followed. A lesson this author has learned is to not assume students have a working knowledge of concept mapping or can pick-up the idea from reading a few articles. For the undergraduate course, students meet physically in the classroom so the instructor (author) has a chance to formally lecture about concept mapping and its applications in education, provide examples of concept maps, and then demonstrate Inspiration software. Students have a chance afterwards to work on the maps during classroom with the instructor present. Questions often emerge during this time such as “Does this map look all right?” “Do the categories look OK?” “I am not sure what topics I should have, can you help?” “Can you understand what I have here?” and “What should I include in the notes?” These questions are opportunite time to further talk about the practicality of maps, consider what their future students would be seeing and making sense from the maps they create, and how the maps could be used in teaching. As a result, undergraduate students seem to have a better grasp on the uses of maps in education. In the graduate courses, this experience is different because the course is offered online and the instruction about maps is from reading some articles. The instructor is not there to provide on-site guidance as these students create maps, thus the impact of concept mapping may not be as effective. In short, consider the context in which the maps are being created. Plan how the maps will be taught, what types of examples to use, when and where the instruction will occur, and how the instructor will be available to help.

If the instructor is not readily available, as in the case of online instruction, providing students with detailed criteria is beneficial. The criteria should not be too specific as to stifle creativity, but enough for students to know what is required or what is expected. Providing a rubric or checklist is useful for students to identify what they need to include and where they can be flexible. Criteria can include features such as the use of images, the number of notes needed, topic areas to include, the use of color and font style, relativity of the concepts with each other, the use of links to demonstrate relationships, etc. Other areas of consideration would be the design such as layout, size, and direction. Criteria given to students could also include questions for students to think about such as, “If I looked at your map right now, could I see how each topic is related to each other?” “If I looked at your map right now, will I be able to read the text and see the links?” and “If I saw your map printed in black and white and on one-page, will I be able to see everything and make sense?” Loosely defined criteria can be given to students, but only to those more advanced in developing maps.

Conclusion

Concept and mind maps help educators teach course content and assist learners in making connections between existing and newly acquired knowledge. Educators use maps as a planning, summary, and assessment tool when designing instruction. Maps provide educators with a way to organize course content, develop appropriate learning objectives, and decide what types of instructional materials are needed. Maps, given to learners, serve as a course or lesson summary that could be used as a study tool or for assessment. Learners use maps to brainstorm ideas for projects, create useful note-taking and study tools, and display their learning to others through a visual graphic. As a brainstorming tool, maps offer learners a way to sketch out projects and written reports. Student-created maps help learners actively participate in the knowledge creation process that can be shared with other learners, making feedback possible. Maps can be created manually with a pen and paper or through more advanced modes such as software programs. Either mode, they help the creators understand content, organize ideas into a tangible form, and supplement their creativity. In the end, maps provide educators and learners with a means to represent their ideas and understandings visually, or in other words, make the learning visible.

References


An Inquiry into the International Distribution of Anti-Environmentalism Sentiment

Allen F. Ketcham, Texas A&M University—Kingsville
Jeffrey T. Schulz, Central Community College—Grand Island

Abstract
This article is the final paper of a two-part study that analyzes and synthesizes the responses of 909 respondents from 20 colleges located in the following states: California, Minnesota, Nebraska (2), Ohio, Oklahoma (2), Texas (3), & Wisconsin and countries: Australia, China, England, Germany, Japan, Mexico, Nigeria, Philippines, & Turkey concerning the extent of the respondents’ anti-environmentalism opinions. The earlier article in the study focused instead on the sample’s views of pro-environmental attitudes. This concluding study focuses on the opposite: anti-environmental opinions. This analysis develops a four by three research matrix to probe the set of responses. The four rows include: Anthropocentric (considering the world in terms of human values), Biocentric (considering all life as having inherent equal value), Spiritual (considering the environment as a sacred matter), and Extreme (exaggerated actions that exceed the norm). The three columns include: Traditional, Modern, and Postmodern viewpoints.

Introduction
Literature related to college students’ anti-environmental attitudes is minimal at best. Studies comparing both United States college students and international students’ anti-environmental attitudes are virtually nonexistent. Our research seeks to address this gap in the anti-environmental attitudinal literature. The overwhelming majority of environmental studies examining college students indicate that most have pro-environmental attitudes. Some recent supporting studies include (Levine and Strube 2012; McDougle et al. 2011; Cordano et al. 2010; O’Brien-McElwee and Brittain 2009; Koestner and Houlfort 2001; and Thapa 1999). In fact, attempting to find studies in the existing literature related to United States college students or international college students having anti-environmental attitudes has proven difficult. Our study, however, provides evidence that some college students, both domestic and international, don’t always possess positive views toward the environment. Our study is exploratory in nature and will observe this phenomenon.

Review of the Literature
Thapa (1999) suggests, “There have been a number of studies of college students focusing on their environmental attitudes, intentions to practice environmentally responsible behaviors, and self-reported behaviors” (p. 434). Thapa believes studying college students’ environmental attitudes and behaviors merits attention because they will be future educators, policy makers, planners, and administrators of future environmental issues. Her study suggests that college students, even if they have positive ideas about the environment, still show they are not willing to sacrifice materialistic comforts for the sake of the environment. The conclusion of her study was that overall, college students were sympathetic toward the environment, but when it came to behaviors, they were not very participative beyond recycling.
Brief Summary of Available Anti-Environmental Literature

Ash Allen (2010), a senior writer for the 24/7 Wall St. website, contributed to a book entitled *The Green Movement* (2010) by Debra A. Miller and discusses the irony of some companies claiming to be “green.” He suggests many companies are trying to show the government, the public, and their shareholders that they are trying to improve the environment yet they are still among the most prolific polluters.

Science correspondent Ronald Bailey of the publication *Reason* discusses in *Conserving the Environment* (2006) how with technological improvements, environmental issues such as air quality have improved dramatically. He suggests that the U.S.’s cleaner air has resulted in what he calls “twin contexts,” rising wealth and economic efficiency. He states that air quality has improved significantly since the 1970s and that American companies, consumers, and the government invest over $40 billion dollars each year on air pollution controls (Bailey 2006). Additionally, Bailey (2006) claims the government has spent $540 billion in water pollution control efforts since 1970 and that the EPA estimates that between 60% and 70% of lakes, rivers, and streams meet state quality goals. He also debunked Paul Ehrlich’s I=PAT theory and the theory back in 1970 that most species would be extinct by this point in time.

Jon Entine (2009) published a chapter in the book *The Environment* (2009), where he dismisses many European leaders’ views that the United States is a “slacker” in reducing greenhouse gas emissions. He believes that the U.S. starts from a higher base because of the longer transportation distances and larger homes. When these two differences are normalized, American greenhouse gas emissions or (GHGs) are in line with most European nations. He also makes the important point that the U.S. was the only industrialized country in which greenhouse gas emissions fell during the year of 2006. Compared to its Kyoto-protocol participants, U.S. emissions increased 6.6%, while other countries increased an average 21.1%.

United States of America

The findings of Levine and Strube (2012) claim that most Americans in general have positive attitudes about the environment; however, the relationship between environmental attitudes and ecological behaviors varies widely. Levine and Strube (2012), offer three reasons for this. First, the focus of much environmental research has been on respondents’ self-reporting of environmental attitudes. The second reason has to do with the Theory of Planned Behavior in which research has attempted to trace the paths of influence between attitudes and behavior. In other words, attitudes affect behavior to the extent that they influence intentions. The third focus in most environmental research has been the respondents’ environmental knowledge. Levine and Strube (2012) posit “Overall levels of environmental knowledge are not very high” (p. 311).

Kozar and Connell (2010) conducted a study on upper-vs. lower-classmen and socially responsible knowledge. The researchers discovered that upper-classmen in the study were more likely to be better informed about labor issues and abuses in apparel production and tended to boycott a retailer brand because of labor abuses and pay a premium price for goods produced in a socially responsible manner. Lower-classmen seemed less influenced by a company’s socially responsible practices and policies when making apparel purchasing decisions. Very few of the lower-classmen and upper-classmen, however, boycotted because of labor or environmental abuse.

Clayton (2000) conducted a study on environmental justice and is aware that not everyone supports the idea. She defines “environmental justice” as: “The responsibility to other species and to future generations, and the rights of the environment” (p. 459). She suggests if people are aware of new factors such as decreased availability of resources, or a shift to long-term rather than a short-term perspective, it may lead people to change their original positions on environmental issues, and become more accepting of other people’s perspectives on environmental issues.

In a recent study by Klotz et al. (2014) on how college-age students perceive environmental sustainability, they suggest that students from different majors have different ideas of what successful environmental outcomes may be. For example, engineering students see success as improving quality of
life and saving lives; however, in other fields of study such as the social sciences, the focus is on saving people from disease, poverty, and helping provide them with more opportunities. The researchers suggest that students from various majors may have different foci and may measure success in the environmental movement quite differently based on their major field of study.

**Canada, China, and Africa**

It must be stated that there was virtually no literature on international college students’ anti-environmental attitudes. The focus of the literature for international countries was primarily geared toward professors’ teaching pro-environmental behaviors and socially responsible environmental behaviors to their students. The studies would then focus on whether or not students had the motivation to be socially responsible and act in a pro-environmental way after being taught these behaviors.

In the case of some Ontario University students, a recent study by Martinello and Donelle (2012) found that many of Canada’s young adults have a limited inquiry into environmental concerns. However, as in the study by McDougle et al. 2011, Martinello and Donelle (2012) have found that while young Canadian students may not be “physically present” or involved in organizations related to the environment, they are, however, active in a different way when expressing concerns about the environment, and this is through online social networking. To date, Martinello and Donelle (2012) suggest that there are four themes young Canadian students are interested in: “Built Environment” which focuses on housing and transportation; “Natural Environment” which includes air quality, pollution and water quality; “Environmental Restoration” which means how young students plan for environmental recovery. Finally, “Engagement and Activism” which discusses students’ use of online social networking sites for environmental advocacy. The underlying concern in their research focuses on the few existing studies that focus on the perceived social, economic and environmental issues and concerns of young adult Canadians (18-24 years of age).

In a 2001 study on the risks of recycling and college students at McGill University in Canada, Koestner et al. found that when an attractive person was discussing the benefits of recycling to students who were very much against it and had an anti-environmental outlook, the college students reported significantly more favorable thoughts about the anti-recycling messages than when they were attributed to an unattractive source.

In China, Guixin (2010) states that environmental education is of significant importance for humankind. Guixin also suggests that the purpose of conducting environmental education for students in China’s colleges and universities is to raise awareness of the environment for future teachers, and equally important, to train environmental education postgraduate students. Guixin also believes environmental education is important in China due to the contradiction between the needs of its population and availability of its resources.

According to Waktola (2009) “Lack of environmental awareness is one of the underlying causes of severe environmental degradation in Africa. Sixty-five percent of sub-Saharan Africa’s agricultural lands are estimated to be degraded” (p. 589). In many cases, poor families lack the resources and knowledge to keep from degrading their own environment. Their fragile and limited resources, poorly defined property rights, and limited access to financial resources prevent them from investing in environmental protection (Waktola, 2009). Waktola (2009) reaches a similar conclusion to what Guixin (2010) spoke of in China, that if the continent of Africa can offer quality education which relies on well-qualified teachers to teach about the environment, then environmental rehabilitation there can be successful. Further, Waktola believes two important measures can be taken to help Africa’s environmental degradation: First, by reviewing the college curriculum from multiple vantage points; and second, reintroducing outdoor-oriented environmental education in current academic spaces in universities in Africa.

This research attempts to show the differences in domestic and international college students’ responses to anti-environmental questions and scenarios. The reasoning behind why college students’ responses to anti-environmental questions and scenarios is complex. But, the self-emerging patterns in this study to the anti-environmental questions help to clarify vagueness in the literature on anti-environmental attitudes of college students.
Methodology

This is a massive study where questions were designed to study two categories: pro and anti-environmental sentiments. Because of space limitations, this paper examines the anti-environmental questions only. The pro-environmental category was investigated in a prior article, (Ketcham and Schulz, 2014). During the 2010-2011 time period, 909 college students in the United States, Australia, China, England, Germany, Japan, Mexico, Nigeria, Philippines, & Turkey filled out an attitudes questionnaire concerning the environment. Respondents generated 59,085 data points and the set of respondents was selected via a convenience sample. Before administering the instrument to students, the questions were well examined. Three universities studied the questions in focus groups. The pre-testing universities included Texas A&M University-Kingsville, University of Nebraska-Kearney and Humboldt State University. The pre-testing greatly enhanced the reliability of the instrument. The convenience sample was taken from the following schools:

See Table One

The bi-dimensional Signification Model was then used as the foundation of the methodology (Ketcham et al., 2000, p.p. 4-7). The model navigates four “Value Clusters”. These value clusters represent the thought-eras suggested by Jean-François Lyotard et al., in his The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge.

What makes this study unique to current literature on this anti-environmental topic is that it develops a bi-dimensional four by four research matrix to probe the set of responses. The four environmental rows include Anthropocentric (considering the world in terms of human values), Biocentric (considering all life as having inherent equal value), Spiritual (considering the environment as a sacred matter), and Extreme (exaggerated actions that exceed the norm). The four self-emerging columns include Religious, Midwestern, Left-Progressive and Near/Far East data-point clusters. Following are the Self-Emerging Groupings:

See Table Two

How to Read the Graphs: The Clock

The graphs used in this paper are generally referred to as radar graphs. The authors chose to use these graphs because of the complexity of the data. The authors endeavor to use a clock metaphor. The very top of the graphs represents noon, a quarter way around the chart clockwise represents 3:00, the bottom is 6:00 and three-quarters around the graph clockwise is 9:00. When viewing the graphs clockwise, the sample closest to noon most agrees with the statement. So, as we move around the clock from noon to 11:30, we move from the most agree (noon) to the least agree (11:30). The “disagrees” are not in any particular order, except that the disagree scores are placed wherever the sample happens to lie in the agree

Results

A. Anthropocentric

Graph 1. First Anthropocentric Question

A quick summary of the graph below shows that the three religious schools answer in a very Anthropocentric way from noon to two using the clock analogy. This religious set includes: Oklahoma (Oral Roberts University), Nigeria (Dutch Reformed), and Minnesota (Gustavus Adolphus College). On the other hand, China, and Japan disagree with this whole-heartedly. We can only speculate that the reason for China and Japan answering this way is because man is not separate from the environment, but part of it as depicted in Buddhism, Taoism, and Confucianism. Along with the Far East group, some of the Left-Progressive also do not accept this scenario as noted from about 8 to 11:30. What makes this graph truly unique is that it has the highest number of “agrees” toward anti-environmentalism.

Graph 2. Second Anthropocentric Question

This graph shows that the poorest countries: Nigeria, Mexico, and the Philippines agree with this statement the most (noon to one). The Left-Progressive portion of the sample agrees the least with this question (from 9 to 11:30). However, the outlier here is clearly how Australian college students
responded to this question. Beside a low level of agreeing, nearly 60% of Australian students disagreed with this statement. Clearly they are the outlier.

Graph 3. Third Anthropocentric Question

Noticeably, this question evokes a large degree of “disagree.” The Mexican and German sample reject this idea at over 80% each. Generally, the Left-Progressive (from about 7:30 to 11:30) do not care for this scenario. Nigeria accepts this idea the most. The Midwestern respondents tend to cluster (from 2:30 to 7) with a more “middle-of-the-road” approach.

Biocentric

Graph 4. First Biocentric Question

The Near/Far East group shows general agreement with this scenario (noon to 3:30). The Left-Progressives tend to cluster in agreement a tad less from 1 to 6. The Midwestern portion of the sample disagreed with this statement (8 to 11:30).

Graph 5. Second Biocentric Question

In this graph, Mexico and China have the strongest level of disagreement. However, when examining this graph from the top (noon) and winding around to 8 o’clock, there is a large amount of agreement (about 40% to 60%) among 16 of the 20 respondents.

Spiritual

Graph 7. First Spiritual Question

This graph shows that 15 of the 20 represented colleges and universities agree with this statement at a rate of 60% to almost 100%. What is curious about this graph, however, is that the Far East and Left-Progressives do not care for this scenario (Wisconsin: 6:30 to 11:30).

Graph 8. Second Spiritual Question

Many of the respondents disagree with this statement at a level of 50% to 60%. The Left-Progressive do not care for this statement (California: 8:30 to 11:30). The Midwestern group tends to agree from 2 to 6:30. The two most religious schools, Oklahoma (Oral Roberts University) and Nigeria (Dutch Reformed) agree the most (noon to 12:30). This fits with their other positive answers with man-centered views reflected in this study.

Graph 9. Third Spiritual Question

This graph shows that this statement is strongly rejected by most countries except Nigeria, which strongly agrees with this statement. Turkey tends to agree with this question at 39.6%. However, the Left-Progressive highly reject this statement at a rate of 60% or slightly higher as the star shape graph reflects. It is interesting that Japan has only 7% agree and 43% disagree, whereas China has just about the same agree and disagree (both near 40%).

Extreme

Graph 10. First Extreme Question

This is one of two graphs where the “disagrees” overwhelm the “agrees.” (Table 12 is the other Graph). The “agrees” can only be seen because of the transparency. Both of these “overwhelming” graphs are in the Extreme category. This graph demonstrates how this idea is strongly rejected by the Left-Progressive. Also, disagreeing in a strong way, at nearly 70%, is Mexico.

Graph 11. Second Extreme Question

This graph is interesting because the Near/Far East grouping (clustered from noon to 3:30), Japanese, Chinese, Turkey and Philippines portion of the sample tend to agree at levels of 50% to 60%. The Midwestern (middle-of-the-road) using the clock metaphor, are clustered from about 3 to 8. Finally, the Left-progressive (clustered from 9:30 to 11:30) are very much against this statement.

Graph 12. Third Extreme Question
This is the other graph in the Extreme category where the “disagrees” overwhelm the “agrees.” As with Table Ten, the “agrees” can only be seen because of the transparency. Turkey, Japan, and Australia agree with this statement the most, but at a low level. Another interesting find in this graph is that Left-Progressive strongly disagree with this statement (8:30 to 11:30). But, the entire sample does not reject environmentalism.

**Conclusion**

This study can be framed by Justin Farrell’s concepts of “pro-wolf and anti-wolf.” In the mid-1990s an “ecological” controversy developed over reintroducing wolves to Yellowstone Park. Farrell documents that this debate involved the official actions of six presidents, $12,000,000 of research, dozens of congressional hearings, 120 public hearings, 160,000 public submissions to committees and, of course, opposing and to some degree contradictory technical reports from the “Pros” and “Antis” in this environmental struggle. Farrell states that this ecological “wolf-war” continues unabated, with a “quasi-spiritual” quality to it.

However, Farrell demonstrates that below this environmental and scientific debate lies political and moral underpinnings. While claiming to be discussing “true” and “false” they are actually making claims concerning “right” and “wrong.” Farrell’s research fits well with the results of our study and the patterns in our findings because he is concerned with anti-environmentalism and its quasi-spiritual overtones. Our anthropocentric, biocentric, spiritual, and extreme research structure found patterns in the data that we did not expect. The researchers noticed natural groupings in the data grounded on religious, political and geographic cultural predisposition. These groups self-emerged from the data and imposed meaning on the data.

1) The Religious grouping is mankind-centered as opposed to environment-centered. These Christian universities clustered together when questions/scenarios placed “human” needs in contradistinction to the “earth.” This may have to do with the content of Table 7. — “people are made in God’s image.” Judeo-Christian traditions view the earth as made for man’s benefit, stewardship or custodianship (Genesis 2:15, Then the LORD God took the man and put him into the Garden of Eden to cultivate it and keep it. New American Standard Bible). Therefore, with their focus on “man,” it follows that the Religious grouping would see environmental questions in a more anti-environmental framework then other groupings.

2) The political clustering is the clearest of the self-emerging groups. The authors ascertain two groupings in the political sector: Left-Progressive and Midwestern. The Left-Progressive group clustered more than any other grouping. They clustered in ten of the twelve graphs. The Left-Progressive could also be called the “Greens” and includes Germany, where, according to a Guardian Newspaper poll, 68% of the people say they are liberal against 9% that say they are traditional. This grouping rejects most of these anti-environmental questions in the study. They generally hold the 8 to 11:30 positions in the clock metaphor. They are very stable in their pro-environmental positions and do not care for the questions in this study.

3) The Midwestern grouping consists of 7 Midwestern states. This group clearly clusters in over half of the graphs. The Midwestern grouping holds more “middle-of-the-road” opinions. They tend to be to be optimistic about environmental concerns and, therefore, slant slightly towards “anti-environmental.”

4) The Near/Far East grouping includes Turkey, Philippines China and Japan. The study indicates that China and Japan, rather than being “environmentalist” or “mankind centered,” are nature centered. When the scenario is set up where nature “wins” China and Japan agree in consort. This can be seen in the Biocentric section (Tables 4, 5 and 6).

5) The category had the greatest number of agreements in the sample. However, when this category was framed in a spiritual manner it evoked a considerable degree of “disagrees.” There were only two countries that answered in a non-Anthropocentric way on one of two questions. Nigerians disagreed with the question “Environmental issues aren’t as big as they seem” and Australians, at 60%,
disagreed with the question “The most pressing global issue is the unjust human condition—like wealth gap.”

6) The biocentric category focuses on nature. The sample tends to accept the power of nature, especially the Far Eastern respondents. Philippines, China, Minnesota, Nigeria, Turkey, Germany, Japan, California, and Texas 2 most agree with this category.

7) The spiritual category revealed ambiguity. Generally there was a mixture of agree and disagree responses. Nigeria, Turkey, Oklahoma 2, Nebraska 2, Texas 2, Ohio, and Oklahoma 1 were most likely to have favorable views toward the spiritual category.

8) The extreme category has the least accepted scenarios. The sample, understandably, is not attracted to an extreme position such as “I reject environmentalism”. Nigeria, Turkey, and Japan were most likely to possess “extreme” views on anti-environmentalism.

References


### Table One: Sample Population

**United States**
- California - Humboldt State University
- Minnesota - Gustavus Adolphus College
- Nebraska 1 - Central Community College
- Nebraska 2 - University of Nebraska at Kearney
- Ohio - University of Toledo
- Oklahoma 1 Northeastern State University
- Oklahoma 2 - Oral Roberts University
- Texas 1 - Midwestern State University
- Texas 2 - UTSA
- Texas 3 - Texas A&M University Kingsville
- Wisconsin - University of Wisconsin La Crosse

**Foreign**
- Australia - Swinbourne University of Technology
- China - Xi’an Jiaotong University
- Germany - Universitat Postdam
- Japan - University of Tokyo
- Mexico - Universidad Iberoamericana
- Nigeria – Mkar University
- Philippines - University of the Philippines, Diliman
- Turkey - Fatih University
- United Kingdom - University of London
Table Two: Self-Emerging Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religious</th>
<th>Midwestern States</th>
<th>Left-Progressive</th>
<th>Near/Far East</th>
<th>Non-Pattern</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Oklahoma-2</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Oklahoma-2</td>
<td>Nebraska-1 &amp; 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma-1</td>
<td>Minnesota-2</td>
<td>Nebraska-1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>Nebraska-1</td>
<td>Texas-1,2,&amp;3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td>Nebraska-2</td>
<td>California</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebrasaka-1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>Minnesota-2</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas-1,2,&amp;3</td>
<td>Minnesota-2</td>
<td>California</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(sometimes</td>
<td>Nebraska-2</td>
<td>Nebraska-1</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>Japan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota)</td>
<td>Nebraska-2</td>
<td>Nebraska-1</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>Japan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Graph 1. First Anthropocentric Question

The earth is meant to be enjoyed by humans

- Agree
- Disagree
Graph 2. Second Anthropocentric Question

The most pressing global issue is the unjust human condition—like wealth gap

Graph 3. Third Anthropocentric Question

Viewed spiritually, environmental issues are not as big as they seem
Graph 4. First Biocentric Question
Nature will defeat humans at every turn

Graph 5. Second Biocentric Question
Biodiversity cannot be preserved, because of many factors, including natural extinctions
Graph 6. Third Biocentric Question

It is useless to try to change the course of Nature because Nature’s ways are too complex

Graph 7. First Spiritual Question

Humans are special, because people are created in God’s divine image
Graph 8. Second Spiritual Question

Science should be about saving people and not saving the Earth

 Agree  Disagree

germany  turkey
minnesota [R]  nebraska-2
wisconsin  texas-3
philippines  ohio
ohio  china
texas-1  philippines
california  australia
minnesota  nebraska-1
oklahoma-1

Graph 9. Third Spiritual Question

Worrying about the environment detracts from my spiritual relationships

 Agree  Disagree

japan  turkey
nigeria [R]  ohio
minnesota [R]  china
germany  nebraska-2
wisconsin  australia
united kingdom  nebraska-1
texas-1  oklahoma-1
california  mexico
philippines  texas-2
oklahoma-1  texas-3
Table 10. First Extreme Question

Environmentalists do more harm than good

Table 11. Second Extreme Question

Recycling is acceptable, but extreme environmentalism goes too far
Table 12. Third Extreme Question

I reject environmentalism

Agree  Disagree

Turkey  Nigeria [R]

Japan  Australia

Mexico  Oklahoma-1

Texas-2

Wisconsin

Germany  Philippines

California  United Kingdom

Minnesota [R]

Texas-1  China

Nebraska-1  Nebraska-2

Ohio

I reject environmentalism
The Admiral, The Mayor, and the General: 
The Battle of New Orleans, 1862

William M. Kirtley
Central Texas College

Patricia M. Kirtley
Independent Scholar

Introduction

General Robert E. Lee surrendered his army at Appomattox courthouse on 6 April 1865 thus ending the Civil War. The war of words continues one hundred and fifty years later. The Library of Congress holds over 70,000 volumes on every aspect of the Civil War (“The Present Past,” p. 25). This paper adds a nuanced and in-depth analysis of the 1862 Battle of New Orleans using letters, personal correspondence, and newspapers of the times to this formidable amount of literature.

This paper, first examines the personalities and relationships of Admiral David Glasgow Farragut, Mayor John T. Monroe, and General Benjamin Franklin Butler. Then it chronicles the Admiral’s brilliant campaign, his use of Commander David Porter’s mortar ships to reduce Confederate defenses, the brave dash of Farragut’s ships through a gauntlet of fire, and the unexpected arrival of his warships at the docks of New Orleans. Lastly, this paper describes the reaction of Monroe to his surprising situation and Butler’s civil and military programs to pacify New Orleans.

The mayor and many of the people of the Crescent City challenged the legitimacy of the federal government. Officers of the United States military considered their action rebellious, an “organized movement aimed at the overthrow of a constituted government” (Department of the Army, 2007, p. 1-1). Butler implemented programs to suppress this insurrection, established institutions loyal to the Union, and prepared the way for Louisiana to re-enter the Union. His initiatives involved political, economic, military, and civil actions. Ironically the most reviled general in the history of the United States originated many of the concepts of modern insurgency warfare. The thesis of this paper is Butler’s ideas form the bedrock of modern counter-insurgency doctrine, regardless of history’s verdict on this complex man.

Background to the Battle

The First Battle of Bull Run on 21 July 1861 indicated a single armed conflict would not end the war. General Winfield Scott, ill and unable to command U.S. forces, outlined a long-range strategy, the Anaconda plan, in a letter to George Brinton McClellan, General in Chief of the Union Army. Scott called on the U.S. Navy to blockade the major ports of the South thus preventing the Confederacy from selling cotton to England in exchange for arms, ammunition, medicine, and warships. Scott argued a naval action, followed by an expedition to control the Mississippi River, would strangle the Confederate economy and achieve victory, with less bloodshed than conventional land warfare (Scott, 1861, p. 1).

Seizure of New Orleans was integral to the Anaconda plan. The Crescent City was the third largest port in the United States and with 140,000 inhabitants was the most populous city in the Confederacy. Thirty-three steamship lines served the Queen of the Mississippi, generating over 500 million dollars in trade a year (Hearn, 1995, p. 41). In an article, “The Importance of the Capture of New Orleans: A British View of the Situation,” The London Morning Herald (1862, May 4) enthused “New Orleans is the commercial metropolis of the South and West. It is the emporium of the vast tracts traversed by the Mississippi and all the tributaries of the most mighty of rivers” (p. 1)
New Orleans led the United States in the slave trade from Africa until Constitutional provisions outlawed this nefarious business in 1808. New Orleans auction houses formed the hub of the domestic slave trade. The bankers and merchants of New Orleans facilitated a cotton economy based on the yoke of slavery. These aristocrats took the lead in advocating secession and contributed many of their sons to the Confederate cause (Hickman, 2015, p. 1).

According to sociologist Elizabeth Fussell of Brown University (2007), in her article “Constructing Race: A population history of New Orleans” in the Journal of American History. New Orleans experienced four population characteristics pertinent to the battle of New Orleans. First, white American citizens numbered 44.9% of the city’s population. The elite and the poor working classes belonging to this group formed the core of support for the Confederates. Second, the city experienced 366 per cent growth from 1830 to 1860 (p. 846). Foreign nationals from Ireland, Germany, and Sicily sought work in the city. They formed 39.8% of the total population. (p. 846). Third, the number of African Americans in the city declined after the end of the slave trade. Slaves residing in the city (8.3%) worked mainly as household help. Free Blacks (7%) engaged in a variety of skilled occupations (p. 846). Some even owned slaves and formed their own regiment in the state militia. Fourth, during and after the War, slaves on nearby plantations sought freedom and opportunity in the city. As a result, the number of Blacks in New Orleans increased by 25% from 1860 to 1870 (p. 846).

Fort Jackson and Fort St. Philip, located seventy miles downriver, guarded New Orleans. Commodore David Dixon Porter, a brilliant, self-absorbed, naval officer, conceived the idea of using 13-inch mortars mounted on ships, scows, and barges. He planned on hiding these vessels behind brush and intervening terrain. The high parabolic trajectories of the mortars could reach targets shielded by earthworks and pulverize the two garrisons into submission. He presented the idea to Gideon Welles, Secretary of the Navy. Welles and Porter visited the White House the same evening and rousted President Lincoln from his bed. Lincoln, clad in his nightshirt, gave his support to the plan (Hickman, 2015, p. 1).

The next day Welles, Porter, and Lincoln visited McClellan. The General-in-Chief warned to the idea of mortars, but warned he could not spare any troops, except perhaps those under command of a pesky political general adept at lobbying in Washington, Butler. McClellan loathed Butler and thought the scheme was an excellent way to dispose of him. Author and Civil War historian Chester G. Hearn (1997) in his book, When the Devil Came Down to Dixie, observed McClellan mistakenly believed Butler’s credentials as a Democrat would endear him to the populace of New Orleans (p. 42).

Welles asked Porter to help him select the commanding officer of a joint Navy-Army task force. After considering all 33 officers on the Captain’s list, they decided on Porter’s adopted brother, Farragut. Welles asked Porter to interview his brother, even though Porter was the junior officer. Brotherly affection overcame the awkwardness of the situation (Hearn, 1997 p. 43). Porter tendered and Farragut accepted command of the West Gulf Blockading Squadron with the title of Flag officer. The Admiral stipulated Porter command the mortar boats and accepted Butler as commander of the Army forces. Lincoln authorized a naval expedition on 12 November 1861 with the objective of capturing New Orleans and implementing the Anaconda plan (Porter, 1889, p. 175).

The Admiral

Farragut, self-possessed and imperturbable, possessed the experience of a lifetime at sea in peace and war. His father was a merchant Captain from the island of Minorca and served as a Navy Captain during the American Revolution. As a five-year old, Farragut journeyed down the Mississippi River to New Orleans. When he was very young, his mother died of yellow fever. His father put him out for adoption with the navy family of David Porter. Farragut received a commission as Midshipman in the United States Navy at the age of nine. The British wounded him in action during the War of 1812 and he served with distinction in the Mexican War of 1846 (Farragut, 2015, p. 1).

The Admiral sailed his forty-three-ship fleet from Hampton Roads, Virginia on 20 January 1862. A shortage of manpower led him to recruit African American sailors who served with distinction in fully integrated crews (Reidy, 2001, p. 1). Several of his ships grounded on the shoals at the entrance to the mouth of the Mississippi River. However, the Admiral soon arrayed his forces against the two Confederate masonry forts blocking his way to New Orleans. The battle commenced on 18 April 1862.
Farragut succinctly described it, “I attacked Fort St. Phillip and Fort Jackson with my little fleet, and Commander Porter gallantly bombarded them” (as cited by Porter, 1889, p. 190).

Porter, in his *Naval History of the Civil War* (1898) enumerated the opposing forces. The U.S. Navy commanded 167 guns on wooden vessels, while the Confederate fixed defenses and naval forces contained 177 guns. He cited the consensus among naval warfare experts that one gun on land was the equal of three guns on a ship. Porter (1889) observed the Southerners enhanced the effectiveness of their cannon fire by blocking the river with an iron chain and floating blazing rafts (p. 179).

Porter led the mortar boat division, a non-descript collection of ships, boats, and scows outfitted with twenty-one 13-inch naval mortars firing 200 lb. explosive shells. He ordered U.S. Coastal Service surveyors to paddle small boats into the waters adjacent to the forts the night before the attack. They measured distances and azimuths to these fortifications. They left marking buoys in an area shielded by a bend in the river concealed by brush and trees from observation. Once the mortar boats maneuvered into position, their gunners had the exact co-ordinates of the Confederate positions. Union sailors camouflaged the masts of their vessels to blend in with the foliage. From their lofty perches, they called in adjustments resulting in devastatingly accurate high-angle fire (Porter, 1889, p. 178).

Porter’s gunners fired mortar shells at the rate of one every ten minutes for three days. The Confederate forces did not have the training to withstand this intense barrage. Historian John D. Winters (1963), author of *The Civil War in Louisiana*, accused the Confederates of making “a sorry showing” in their defense of the two forts (p. 94). He listed as causes of their defeat: the absence of co-operation, cowardice, lack of preparation, and “the murderous fire of the federal gunboats” (p. 95). Farragut, observed, “such a fire the world has never seen” (cited by Porter, 1889, p. 190).

At 2 a.m. on April 24, 1862, thirteen of the Admiral’s ships raced by Fort Jackson and Fort St. Phillip. Butler included a congratulatory letter to Farragut in his *Private and Official Correspondence*. Butler (1917) stated, “He had never witnessed a more gallant exploit” and characterized the maneuver as “bold, daring, brilliant and successful” (p. 420). But privately he wrote to his wife Sarah, claiming Farragut’s “race for glory” was “unmilitary” (p. 422). The remainder of the fleet, under Porter’s command, unloaded Butler’s soldiers in preparation for attacks on both forts. However, after another intense barrage, the garrison at Fort Jackson mutinied and deserted. Unable to continue the battle, the Confederates hoisted the white flag of surrender. According to Porter (1889), he sent a steamer to bring Butler and his troops to occupy the forts after marines and sailors took control of them (p. 187).

Butler’s version of events differed from Porter’s. According to the General, the Confederates surrendered to one of his patrols. Porter delayed providing ships to ferry the General to the defeated forts so Porter himself could gain the honor of receiving the surrender. In addition, The General diminished the effects of Porter’s mortar fire. Butler (1917) wrote the two forts remained “substantially as defensible as before the bombardment” (p. 428). Lastly, Butler charged Porter once again deliberately delayed providing ships, this time to transport soldiers to occupy New Orleans.

**The Mayor**

James T. Monroe arrived in New Orleans from Missouri at the age of twenty with only a few dollars in his pocket. He found ready work as a longshoreman on the docks. His fellow workers elected him union representative, then city council person, and finally the 16th mayor of New Orleans. He was a Mason and member of the Pickwick Club, an old-line social club that sponsored a Mardi Gras float and parade. Monroe, a resolute and tenacious man, was a popular mayor, with a penchant for socializing with the aristocrats of New Orleans and, at the same time, representing the interests of workingmen (Monroe, 2015, “Administration,” p. 1).

The capture of New Orleans shocked the world, lifted the spirits of the North, and left the people of New Orleans bewildered and defiant. A few months before they celebrated Mardi Gras (Fat Tuesday) with masquerade balls and colorful parades; now their city was vulnerable and in chaos. Since the level of the river was higher than the streets, the formidable guns of Farragut’s war ships could destroy any single target and possessed the capability of flooding the entire city by breaching its protective levees.

Porter described the events of Saturday, April 25. 1862. Farragut gave Theodorus Bailey, Captain of the first ship to run the blockade, the honor of delivering the Admiral’s letter demanding surrender and
removal of all state and Confederate flags to John T. Monroe, Mayor of New Orleans. Flags were, and 
still are, important symbols of power and legitimacy. Farragut understood the banners flying on what he 
considered federal property, the Customs House and the New Orleans Mint, were potent symbols of 
sovereignty.

Lt. George H. Perkins accompanied Captain Bailey. The two Union officers stepped onto the docks and 
demanded to see the mayor, whereupon, the crowd “erupted in outrage” (Porter, 1889, p. 235). Author 
George W. Cable described the scene. “Two U.S. Navy officers walked through the crowd, unguarded 
and alone. They looked straight ahead, neither frowning nor flinching, while the mob screamed in their 
ears, shook cocked pistols in their faces, cursed and crowded and gnashed upon them” (cited in Gooley, 
2014, p. 1).

Pierre Soulé, a former U.S. Senator and envoy to Spain, served as an intermediary between Monroe and 
Farragut. Reportedly, Soulé used his influence to guarantee the safety of Bailey and Perkins. The mayor 
received the two officers and sent a reply on Sunday, 26 April 1862. Monroe stated:

I am no military man, and possess no authority beyond that of executing the municipal laws of the 
city of New Orleans. It would be presumptuous in me to attempt to lead an army in the field, if I had 
one in my command, and I know still less how to surrender an undefended place, held as this is at 
the mercy of your gunships and mouths of your mortars. To surrender such a place were an idle and 
unmeaning ceremony. This city is yours by the power of brutal force and not by any choice or consent 
of its inhabitants. (Porter, 1889, p. 195)

As for the offending Louisiana and Confederate flags, the Mayor insisted he could find no man to haul 
them down. He reiterated his position that only Confederate General Mansfield Lovell could surrender the 
city and Lovell was unavailable. Monroe crafted his response based on advice from Soulé and Jefferson 
Davis (Monroe, Telegram to Davis, 1862). Lovell, with over 2,800 Confederate troops, remained hidden 
in the city (Lonn, 1940, p. 115). The mayor’s letters constituted a delaying action to give these soldiers 
time to escape. Lovell offered to stay and fight, but the Mayor advised him it was impossible to defend 
the city, given Farragut’s commanding position and tremendous firepower.

On the same day, Sunday, 26 April, Captain Henry W. Morris ordered U.S. Marines from the 
Pocahontas to enter New Orleans, and remove the offending flags from the Federal Mint and raise the 
Stars and Stripes. After the marines returned to their ship, members of an unruly mob, including a 
gambler named William Bruce Mumford, tore down the Union flag (Hearn, 1997, p. 70). Gunners on the 
Pocahontas fired on the mob and a flying piece of brick injured Mumford. With cheers from local 
onlookers, Mumford carried the Union flag to the Mayor at city hall. Enraged onlookers tore at the flag as 
he walked, reducing it to a rag. Captain Charles Bell sent marines back into the city, loaded his guns with 
grape shot and explosives, and raised the United States flag again (Roehl, 1987, p. G11).

The Admiral wrote the mayor once again ordering him to remove all state and Confederate flags on 
government buildings. The mayor repeated his assertion that Lovell had departed and as a civilian 
authority he could not surrender. He insisted no one in the city would dare strike the flag of Louisiana. He 
promised to try to enforce the peace, a pledge he failed to honor (cited by Porter, 1889, p. 197).

The Mayor replied immediately in writing. He claimed Captain Bailey had mentioned nothing about 
flags in their initial meeting. Furthermore, if Farragut wished to murder innocent women and children on 
a “question of etiquette,” it would constitute a heinous war crime the world would never forget (Porter, 
1889, p. 197). The Admiral replied to the Mayor “As my duties call me away, I request you send further 
replies to any vessel present” (as cited in Porter, 1889, p. 197). As historian Chester G. Hearn (1997) 
explained, “(Farragut) could now turn loose of the tiger’s tail, since the keeper of the zoo (Butler) had 
arrived” (p. 72).

On Wednesday 29 April 1862, The Admiral ordered 250 marines from the Hartford to remove the 
Louisiana State flag from the New Orleans City Hall. This accomplished, he moved the bulk of his fleet 
upriver to attack fortifications north of the city in preparation for the campaign against Vicksburg. He left 
with sadness because he never had a chance to visit his relatives in New Orleans. The only force for law 
and order from Farragut’s arrival on April 25 until Butler’s troops occupied the city on May 1 were 
soldiers of the Native Guard, a black militia, and the European Brigade composed of foreign nationals.
On May 2, U.S. Secretary of State William H. Seward blithely announced the Union had “recovered” New Orleans and the U.S. Postal Service had resumed deliveries (Appleton’s, 1862, p. 1).

The General

Farragut faced an aroused populace and an obstinate mayor who openly challenged his threat to use force. Monroe firmly believed “as a civil magistrate he could maintain his allegiance to the Confederate government and ignore the invader” (Hearn, 1997, p. 68). Farragut realized he could not compel allegiance, force a civilian authority to surrender, or breech the levies and destroy the city. He left the problem for General Benjamin Franklin Butler to solve.

Butler was born in Deerfield, New Hampshire. Shortly after his birth, Butler’s father died of yellow fever while working in the Caribbean. His mother moved to Lowell Massachusetts, a cotton mill town, where she eked out a living running a boarding house for women workers. As a boy, Butler was always a serious student. He attended Exeter Academy and Lowell High School. He failed to win an appointment to West Point, a great disappointment. He excelled in debate at Colby College. After graduation, he read law with a Lowell attorney and gained admission to the bar. Butler advocated change through legal action. Butler represented the workers in their fight for the ten-hour day. He earned a reputation as a friend of labor and represented Lowell as a Democrat in the state legislature. He also took cases from mill owners and developed a lucrative practice (Benjamin Franklin Butler Facts, 2004, p. 1).

Butler’s fight for respectability in the tough hardscrabble mill town of Lowell influenced his worldview. He despised the Boston Brahmins who used their influence to ensure their sons obtained appointments to West Point. He sympathized with the hard working Irish women who lived in his mother’s boarding house and represented their interests as an attorney and legislator.

An article in Harper’s Weekly, (1861, June 1) described Butler’s acerbic personality, “as an advocate he is distinguished by the energy with which he devotes himself to his client, and by the strong, playful, and somewhat vehement language hurled against opposing counsel” (Major General Butler, p. 1). He married Sarah Hildreth, an actress, and had four children. Butler carried on a lively correspondence with his wife during the few times the war separated them, asking her to “kiss the children for me” (Butler, 1917, p. 625). He was loyal to Sarah who always saw the best in her husband. In a letter to a friend, she discussed her husband’s dim prospects of receiving reinforcements in New Orleans. She noted, “I believe he can do more with small means than any other man” (Butler, 1917, p. 438).

Butler began his military career as a private in the Lowell militia, a predominantly Irish-American regiment. He rose in rank until its members voted him their leader with the rank of Brigadier General. His regiment volunteered for the Civil War and moved to protect Washington D.C. On his own initiative, Butler ordered his troops to occupy Annapolis, home of the U.S. Naval Academy, and Baltimore, an important seaport. The Northern press lionized Butler for preserving these cities and the state of Maryland for the Union (Benjamin Franklin Butler Facts, 2004, p. 1).

Edwin M. Stanton, Secretary of War, ordered Butler to hold New Orleans, control Louisiana, and support the campaign against Vicksburg. To accomplish this mission, he had a force of 2,500 men to control a population of approximately 140,000. In all of Louisiana, he commanded 15,000 troops, not nearly enough to defend the state or the city from Confederate troops (Hearn, 1997, p. 81). The War Department told him not to expect reinforcements, and, despite Butler’s pleas, remained true to their word. This, despite the fact, the South possessed the capability and commitment to retake the city from the hated Yankees.

Butler established the tone of his occupation on his first day, 2 May 1862. He commandeered the St. Charles Hotel as his headquarters and requested a meeting with the mayor. When Monroe refused, Butler sent several of his officers who persuaded Monroe, if he wished to remain a free man, he should visit the general. Monroe and Pierre Soulé arrived at the hotel accompanied by an angry mob. Members of the unruly assemblage loudly demanded Butler make an appearance. After Monroe unsuccessfully tried to quiet the crowd, Butler went to the window and asked, “Who calls me? I am here” (as cited in Hearn, 1997, p. 84). At this point, a U.S. Marine battery of six mobile artillery pieces (Napoleons) formed up in front of the hotel and trained their weapons on the unruly throng. The protesters quickly dispersed.
When Butler confronted the crowd, he spotted a man wearing a boutonniere made from a piece of a U.S. Flag. Butler’s soldiers identified the man as Mumford, the man who tore the flag down at the U.S. Mint. Butler soldiers apprehended him. A military tribunal convicted Mumford of high crimes and misdemeanors. The charge against him noted he was “a sporting man much accustomed to drink” and on June 7, 1862, Butler ordered Mumford hanged at the U.S. Mint, the spot where he committed his crime (Butler, 1917, p. 283).

The meeting continued that afternoon in the parlor of the hotel. Monroe, Soulé, Butler, three members of his staff, and Sarah Butler, sat down to a light dinner and commenced the discussion. Butler issued General Order No. 1, an edict announcing the continuation of martial law declared by Confederate General Lovell. Butler also outlawed the flying of any flag save the Stars and Stripes, restricted newspapers from reporting military movements, licensed businesses and required them to stay open, forbade assemblages of persons by day or by night, and required all enemies of the United States to turn in their arms.

The Mayor persisted in his argument as a civilian authority he had no standing before a military governor. For three hours, he disputed every provision of Butler’s order. As Hearn (1997) put it, submitting to “nothing less than what the conqueror was able to extract from the conquered” (p. 96). Monroe made little effort to conceal his hatred of Butler. The General, in return, remarked he disliked “hardheaded men” like Monroe (as cited in Hearn, 1997, p. 89). Butler began his eight-month rule of New Orleans in a conciliatory frame of mind, but intransigence such as Monroe’s and the defiant actions of the citizenry soon hardened his approach.

Monroe continued to elicit Butler’s unfavorable attention. Butler related in his correspondence, his belief the Mayor fomented a plot to gather volunteers, commandeer a Union vessel, and join Confederate forces. One hundred men volunteered, but the leaders of the plot called it off because they did not think they had enough men to overpower the sailors on a Union vessel (Butler, 1917, p. 499).

Next, the Mayor and Common Council invited the French fleet to visit New Orleans. The invitation mentioned historic ties with France to whom “New Orleans owes its foundation and early prosperity” (Butler, 1917, p. 496). The invitation almost begged the French to capture the city, an easy task since Farragut moved his fleet northward to besiege Vicksburg. Butler decisively responded the invitation was an insult and he alone, had the power to invite foreign naval vessels to New Orleans. He ordered the council to rescind the invitation and they complied (Butler, 1917, p. 497).

Butler discovered evidence the mayor used $20,000 of city funds to help paroled Confederates escape. In addition, Butler’s soldiers apprehended a group of six parolees who planned on overpowering Union soldiers and escaping. Butler explained the conspirators called themselves the “Monroe Guard” (p. 499). When Butler asked the mayor for an explanation, Monroe asserted his only crime was to give an escaping Confederate soldier $25 out of his own pocket. Butler replied he was tired of being played like a “weathercock” and ordered Monroe’s incarceration in prison at Fort Jackson (p. 499). A few months later, Monroe’s wife asked Butler to release him to visit to his dying son. Butler agreed on the condition Monroe take an oath of allegiance to the United States, but Monroe refused (Hearn, 1997. p. 132).

At first, Butler listened to Soulé and accepted the former Senator’s suggestion he station most of the Union troops, especially Black soldiers, on the outskirts of the city. As relationships soured, Butler realized Soulé’s loyalties still lay with the Confederacy. Butler arrested him and sent him to a military prison in New York. He listed two charges against Soulé in a letter to the Secretary of War: first, Soulé was the leader of a secret society, the Southern Independence Society, whose members swore allegiance to the Confederacy, second, he was the author of the “insolent letters” sent under Monroe’s name to Farragut (Butler, 1917, p. 432).

A modern attorney, pastor, and lecturer at the Citadel, Rudolph C. Barnes noted in The Rule of Law and Civil Affairs in the Battle for Legitimacy (2008) in counter-insurgency operations “success is not defined by winning military victory but by winning the battle for the public support needed for effective governance” (p. 4). The purpose of this paper is to examine the effectiveness of the political, economic, military, paramilitary, psychological, and civic actions taken by Butler to establish effective governance under the aegis of the of the United States.
Butler’s actions in New Orleans fall within the purview of Counter-Insurgency (COIN) as outlined in FM 3-24 (2006), an Army field manual written, for the most part, by General David Petraeus, who defined an insurgency as “the organized use of subversion and violence to seize, nullify, or challenge political control of a region” (Department of the Army, 2007, p. 2-1). This most certainly is an accurate description of the problems Butler faced.

Both generals believed the best way to combat an insurgency was to balance the measured use of force with non-military programs. They saw success lay in eliminating unrest and meeting the populace’s needs. Petraeus outlined several areas of concern: security from civil unrest and crime, provision for basic economic needs, stipulation for essential services, sustainment of social and cultural institutions, and contributions to quality of life (Department of the Army, 2007, 2-6). The following ten actions show Butler clearly understood what are today called principles of counter-insurgency.

First, he showed concern for the poor contributing $1000 from his own funds to buy food for hungry people. He fed over 1900 destitute families with beef and flour abandoned by the Confederates. He raised $300,000 for the poor by taxing cotton brokers. When the money ran out, he reinstated the tax. The secessionist Governor of Louisiana, Thomas Overton Moore, ordered the people to have no economic dealings with the occupying forces. Butler remarked, had the people of New Orleans followed the governor’s injunctions, they would have starved (Hearn, 1997, p. 93).

Second, he suppressed the newspaper that published Governor Moore’s directive and several other newspapers, but overall, was fairly lenient with the press (Hearn, 1997, p. 100).

Third, although the General sent three Protestant ministers to jail, in general, he showed forbearance toward the city’s religious leaders and institutions. The leaders of the city’s churches declared a day of penance and closed the churches at the behest of the Confederate government. Butler ordered them to stay open and pray for peace. He placed a particularly obstinate Catholic priest under house arrest. Butler was generally tolerant towards Catholics, who had always voted for him in Lowell. In fact, he supported a Catholic orphanage in New Orleans with his own money and was unstinting in his praise of nuns who cared for the poor (Hearn, 1997, p. 100).

Fourth, Butler understood the need of reviving the economy of New Orleans. His forces controlled access to food and supplies. No one could enter or leave the city without a pass. The General issued passes to steamboat captains and ensured them the protection of the federal fleet. His actions restarted commerce on the Mississippi and brought down the price of food (Butler, 1917, p. 515).

Fifth, Butler provided essential civil services for the people of New Orleans. The Mayor hired workers to clean the streets, but they did little to remove the piles of fetid rubbish. On 9 May 1862, Butler wrote the Mayor to “call attention to the sanitary condition of your streets,” he continued, “Resolutions and inaction will not do” (Butler, 1917, p. 456) He reminded the Mayor there were plenty of starving men whom the city could and should employ cleaning up the streets. When the mayor did not respond, Butler hired the unemployed workers to clean up the city.

Sixth, Butler hired locals to work on the docks and keep supplies flowing to the Union Army. He put people to work expanding the city sewer system and setting up pumps to keep the city dry. Terry Jones (2012), a professor at the University of Louisiana in a New York Times article “The Beast in the Big Easy,” credited Butler’s sanitation efforts with preventing an expected yellow fever epidemic (p. 1).

Seventh, Butler paid for his social programs by taxing the richest citizens of New Orleans. The "Robin Hood" aspects of his programs provided a broad base of political support, an extensive informal intelligence and counter-espionage organization, and provided law and order. When he discovered Southern sympathizers diverted some of the food to feed Confederate forces, he set up a commission with the power to apprehend and punish smugglers.

Eighth, Butler carried out the counter-insurgency aim of performing civilian police functions. It is usually better if the civil government continues to run the day-to-day operations of the city. If adequate civilian capacity is unable or unwilling, military forces must secure the peace. When the Mayor refused to carry out his duties, Butler replaced him with a military officer who assumed the administrative functions of city government.
The members of the New Orleans police force, except for eleven individuals, resigned rather than swear an oath of allegiance to the United States. Butler fired them and hired 500 replacements. He authorized military officers to act as judges. One month after the arrival of Union soldiers, New Orleans enjoyed the benefits of possibly the most honest police force in the history of the city.

Ninth, the General maintained escaped slaves were property of parties at war with the United States and since they were contraband, he could not legally return them to their masters. Butler followed this legal principle when Joseph Davis, the brother of Jefferson Davis, petitioned Butler to return his runaway slaves. Butler hired contrabands to build ships, repair levees, clear drainage ditches, and construct fortifications (Jones, 2012, p. 1).

Tenth, Butler gave dignity and a sense of worth to Free Blacks and runaway slaves by enlisting them in the Union Army. Free black soldiers joined the Louisiana State Militia before the war. They sought prestige, fraternity, and a way to hold their place in the hierarchy of the unique multi-racial, and cultural society of New Orleans. James G. Hollandsworth (1995), a history professor at the University of Southern Mississippi, noted in *The Louisiana Native Guards* The Native Guard consisted of 31 black officers and 731 black enlisted men (p. 1). The Native Guard remained to keep the peace when Confederate soldiers under General Lovell retreated from the city. It is not entirely clear whether Butler asked the Native Guards to join the Union Army or they came to him with the request to join. It is certain Butler was in desperate need of manpower and this African-American unit provided a solution.

The narrow defeat of Confederate forces at Baton Rouge and the understanding New Orleans was their next objective indicated Butler needed black soldiers to shore up his seriously undermanned army. Butler understood the notion of black soldiers challenged several assumptions about race. Confederate General Howell Cobb observed, “If slaves make good soldiers our whole theory of slavery is wrong” (as cited in Hollandsworth, 1995, p. 65). Many people in the North and the South believed Blacks were suited only for manual labor and unsuited for soldiery and former slaves might turn their bayonets on their former masters.

Butler recruited 3,122 free blacks and escaped slaves into three regiments of infantry, the First, Second, and Third Louisiana Native Guards, the Corps D’Afrique. At first, the Union Army used Black soldiers primarily for digging ditches and building fortifications; but as the war progressed they distinguished themselves in battle. Several Black officers credited their military experience as helping them succeed in later life. P. S. Pinchback, a Captain in the Guards, became Governor of Louisiana.

Butler correctly believed the key to control the city lay in divorcing the elite from the lower class. However, by attacking the rich so viscerally he earned their eternal enmity, a cardinal violation of the principles of counter-insurgency warfare. The following programs, however well intentioned, had negative consequences for pacification of New Orleans.

Butler recruited African Americans out of principle and necessity. The racism of many in New Orleans led to an ugly riot. The streetcar companies reserved the first car for whites. When Black Union soldiers sought to board the first car, mayhem ensued. The recruitment of Blacks so outraged Jefferson Davis, Presidency of the Confederacy on 23 December 1862 publicly called for the execution of both Butler and African-American Union soldiers (Civil War Daily Gazette, p. 1).

Butler believed the wealthy bankers and cotton traders of New Orleans made millions of dollars exploiting the work of slaves. He argued the upper classes supported treason as a means of protecting their entrenched interests. Upon the advent of war, these aristocrats financed the Confederacy. He loathed the crème de la crème of New Orleans and sought to destroy them. Butler (1917) lashed out at them in General Order No. 25 (pp. 47-48):

> They have betrayed their country. They have been false to every trust. They have shown themselves incapable of defending the state they seized upon, although they have forced every poor man’s child into their service as soldiers for that purpose, while they made their sons and nephews officers. They will not feed those whom they are starving.

The General planned to change the social structure of New Orleans by isolating the privileged class. In General Order No. 25 dated 9 May 1862. Butler (1917) blamed the uncaring elite for the starvation and destitution among the working class of the city. “This hunger does not pinch the wealthy and the
influential, the leaders of the rebellion who have gotten up this war and are now endeavoring to prosecute it without regard to the starving poor” (p. 457). Butler noted the nabobs of New Orleans burned eleven thousand bales of cotton and property worth millions to keep these assets out of the hands of the Union Army. These wasted resources were worth more than enough to feed the deserving poor.

Butler required members of the upper classes to take an oath of allegiance or lose the right to practice their professions. If they declined, he issued them a certificate declaring them enemies of the United States, and, as such, they forfeited their property. Butler sentenced members of the elite to prison. He sent three of the town’s leading ministers to Lafayette prison in New York for refusing to include mention of the President of the United States in their weekly blessings.

Governor Moore of Louisiana responded with an argument often made by Southerners who insisted wage slavery was worse than chattel slavery.

General Butler’s attempt to excite the poor against the more wealthy is characteristic of the man, and is as mean as it is contemptible. He springs from a race that has ever been purse-proud when fortune favored them and idolatrous worshipers of the almighty dollar. He comes from a section of the country that has done more than any other to degrade and cheapen and reduce the laboring man to the condition of a slave. (cited by Butler, 1917, p. 459)

Butler attracted unfavorable national and international publicity when he ordered his soldiers to treat any lady who insulted them as a woman of the town plying her avocation, i.e. a prostitute. Upper class women of the period enjoyed a certain status. When the women of New Orleans exceeded the bounds of the role expected of them, the General felt it was logical his forces should treat them as lower class women. Monroe sent a letter to Butler asserting he wanted to vindicate the virtuous women of the City. Butler (1917) replied his order did not apply to “virtuous women,” and the Mayor apologized (p. 498). In any event, the women of New Orleans occasionally resorted to dumping dishwater from the balconies of buildings on unsuspecting Union soldiers passing underneath.

Banks lost millions on deposits when Butler declared people could not use Confederate currency for payment of debt. The General included bankers. He ordered those who wished to do business in New Orleans must swear allegiance to the United States. Judah P. Benjamin, the Confederate Secretary of State, expressed dismay when his brother, Solomon, took the oath. Bankers continued to funnel Confederate deposits of gold and silver to Europe through the 18 foreign consuls in New Orleans. Butler confiscated $800,000 deposited in the office of the Dutch consul who protested he did not know how it got there (Hearn, 1997, p. 156).

Similar incidents occurred when Butler seized specie held by the Belgian, Spanish, and French consuls. The foreign ministers of these countries complained vocally and vehemently to William H. Seward, the U.S. Secretary of State. Seward sent two of his emissaries to New Orleans to investigate their complaints. His representatives recommended Butler return the funds. After doing so, Butler discovered corroborating evidence the Confederates used these funds to purchase arms in foreign countries. President Lincoln sympathized with Butler’s attempts to seize these assets, but was more concerned about alienating European powers that might recognize the Confederacy (Hearn, 1997, p. 156).

Butler’s economic incentives provided opportunities for greed, graft, and misunderstanding. Salmon P. Chase, Secretary of the U.S. Treasury, sent a warm and meandering letter to Butler warning him someone had charged him with using his military office for personal gain. Butler stockpiled coal aboard his ship on the voyage down the coast to New Orleans. When the Navy ships ran out of coal he sold it to them. Another accusation arose when Butler ordered U.S. Navy ships to carry sugar owned by his brother, Andrew Jackson Butler, as ballast on the trip back to the North. Butler (1917) was clear in his correspondence the government had the first option on purchasing the sugar (p. 534).

Chase sent two treasury agents to investigate. They suspected Butler’s brother, of profiting at the government’s expense, but could not “discover any good proof that Butler had improperly done, or permitted anything for his own personal advantage. “ He is such a smart man, it would be in any case difficult to discover what he wished to conceal” (as cited in Hearn, 1997, p. 191). The treasury agents did uncover an incident besmirching the General’s reputation. They seized a schooner smuggling salt across
Lake Pontchartrain. Butler ordered the vessel released because he had issued a pass to its Captain. The salt ended up in rebel hands and charges ensued accusing Butler of trading with the enemy. Butler knew the Union embargo had damaged trade through the port of New Orleans. The value of goods passing through New Orleans declined from $500 million to $52 million during the period 1860 to 1862 (Hearn, 1995, p. 41). The General used his extensive commercial contacts to revive commerce in the city, exporting 17,000 bales of cotton to the New England mills and re-establishing international trade. Charges of corruption swirled around Butler’s economic programs, but no one ever proved them. He was a smart lawyer and a shrewd businessman.

President Lincoln signed the second Confiscation Act of 1862, which allowed Union soldiers to seize the property and possessions of Confederate civil and military officers upon detection. In the incident in which Butler acquired the nickname “spoons,” he issued a pass for a lady to leave the city and join her husband in Confederate-held territory. Union soldiers found silver spoons hidden in her carriage and confiscated them as contraband. The lady claimed they were not her spoons, asserted they belonged to a French citizen, and demanded them back. The spoons were lost in bureaucratic red tape, but Southerners claimed the spoons ended up on Butler’s table, hence the derogatory appellation, “Spoons Butler” (Hearn, 1997, pp. 222-223).

Butler made anti-Semitic statements during his efforts to prevent the financial institutions of New Orleans from transferring funds to the Confederacy. While searching the Bank of Solomon Benjamin, his soldiers found a box containing U.S. currency in a hole in the wall. The initials of Judah P. Benjamin, Solomon’s brother and the Secretary of State of the Confederacy, appeared on the top of the box (Butler, 1917, p. 489). Butler charged Jews in the banking business conspired to prevent Union officers from confiscating Confederate funds (Hearn, 1997, p. 163). A Jewish newspaper quoted Butler as saying he would “suck the blood of every Jew, and …will detain every Jew as long as he can” (cited by Regenstein, 2007, p. 1).

Myer Isaacs, editor of the Jewish Messenger, questioned Butler’s use of language in identifying five individuals apprehended while they were trying to run the blockade as Jewish, rather than listing their nationality. Isaacs informed Butler Jewish was a religion, not a nationality, citing himself as an example. He gently reminded Butler Jews practiced a number of different professions, not just banking. Isaacs corrected Butler’s misconception that several members of the Confederate cabinet were Jewish. In an exchange of letters, Butler continued to demonstrate his prejudice by explaining he came from a small town in Massachusetts and had never met a Jew who was not a banker, admitted his misconceptions, and asked Isaacs to continue to inform him on the subject (Isaacs Correspondence, 1864, p. 1).

Conclusion

A society based on unequal distribution of wealth, slavery, and racism, resisted change for many years. Even had Butler, avoided antagonizing the elite, contained his brother’s avarice, used diplomacy with foreign bankers and consuls, and avoided the anti-Semitism of his day, nothing would have changed. Confederate sympathizers in New Orleans would have regarded any Union General as a vile and evil man. In the midst of wartime propaganda it is all too easy to forget Butler accomplished his mission. He maintained Union control of New Orleans and Louisiana.

Butler was one of the most volatile and contradictory personalities of the Civil War. He was infamous in New Orleans for confrontational proclamations and assailed for corruption. If these things were his only capabilities, he could never have held the city, or prevented Confederate forces from re-capturing it. Confederate officials and sympathizers created the false impression Union forces held New Orleans by brute military force and terror. They portrayed Butler as a corrupt money hungry totalitarian dictator. An article on History.net succinctly stated the problem of evaluating Butler’s contributions for posterity. Butler’s “genius for antagonizing powerful adversaries, not only domestically but abroad” countered his “administrative genius” (Maj. General Butler, 2015, History-net).

The expected rebel counteroffensive came on August 5, 1862 in the form of a naval and army assault on Baton Rouge, led by Maj. Gen. John C. Breckinridge. After a hard fought battle, Union forces drove Confederate forces out of the city. The significant aspect of the battle was it did not result in a popular uprising, nor widespread support for Confederate forces in Louisiana. Rebel forces failed to mount a
sustained campaign to retake New Orleans. Historians attribute this to victory on the battlefield and Butler’s consensus building, political manipulation, and broad based political support. Lincoln replaced Butler in December 1862, not because of his performance, but for political reasons. On 14 December 1862, Maj. Gen. Nathaniel Banks took command of the Department of the Gulf. Butler did not learn of his dismissal until after Banks’ arrival.

Conquerors throughout history faced the difficult task of controlling a city whose people would not submit. The Romans could not conquer what the Bible called “a stiff-necked people,” so they destroyed Jerusalem. The U.S. Army and Iraqi government forces captured, occupied, and lost Fallujah, Iraq to Islamic militants. The battle of New Orleans points out another way, counter-insurgency, i.e., pacification through the measured use of force, as well as, political, economic, and social programs.

Butler’s arbitrariness, financial dealings, interference with foreign consuls, and blatant anti-Semitism tarnished his reputation. His abrasive style provoked Southerners who gave him the lasting sobriquet, “Beast Butler.” Merchants sold chamber pots with his likeness at the bottom. Cartoonists portrayed him with the body of a fly. Yet, Butler's administration benefited New Orleans. Farragut best summed up Butler’s eight months as military governor of New Orleans, ”They may say what they please about General Butler, but he was the right man in the right place in New Orleans” (as cited in Hearn, 1997, p. 4). He kept the city both orderly and healthy. His programs saved New Orleans for the Union, hastened the end or the war, and established the paradigm for the tactics of modern counter-insurgency warfare.

References


Monroe, J. (1862). Telegram to Jefferson Davis. Tulane University, Louisiana Reserch Collection. LaRC/Manuscripts Collection M-1109.
“I’ll Drink To That (And Post It On Twitter)!: A Case-Study of Small Business Product Placement in Social Networking Marketing Plans.

Shannon M. Leinen
Concordia University, Nebraska

Abstract
Product placement within social media marketing is growing. Research has shown that this mentality has revealed a need for marketers to be strategic in how they advertise which has recently included more product placement advertising (Pompper & Yih-Farn, 2008). Many researchers are finding that social media product placement marketing is happening intentionally and unintentionally, and that it is having effects on purchasing choices social norms (Messer, Shoe, Canady, Sheppard, & Vincus, 2011; Macreanor, Lyons, Griffin, Goodwin, Moewaka Barnes, & Hutton, 2013). Small businesses and big box stores may need to compete for strategic web-space. This paper uses a case-study to examine the phenomena of product placement in hopes of producing suggestions for small businesses practices. Results reveal that small business should consider modifying large, already designed, social media marketing strategies for their own use.

Introduction
Networking has always been a part of small business success. A handshake used to “go a long way”. A shining storefront was required in a good location for entrepreneurs to “make it to the big-time”. An endorsement from a local celebrity could increase sales. And using the phrase, “Tell them I sent you” could get speedy service or a great discount. Those were the days.

In today’s world global community, e-commerce and online advertising has taken over, and brick and mortar stores everywhere are jumping onboard. However, online shopping is still shutting down small town businesses. The Internet has connected the world in a way that allows anyone to have the ability to receive information about a product with a quick Google search. A comment on a Facebook page can hurt sales. A recommendation on a well-respected blog can increase profits. Internet space advertising is competed for by big conglomerates and Mom and Pop stores alike.

In the world of instant gratification, and DVR, television shows are recorded and commercials are ignored with a few clicks of a fast-forward button. Millions of dollars are spent on commercials that may never be seen by their intended target audience. Subscriptions that provide television through Internet streaming (i.e. Netflix, Amazon Prime or Hulu Plus) are providing re-runs of movies and television programming commercial-free. Although people of all ages are spending several hours in front of their television screens per day, they have found a way to avoid being bothered with advertisements (Singer & Singer, 2001).

Many advertisers have embraced the challenge. Product marketers are moving frantically to online sources; posting their ads as pre-views to popular homemade Youtube videos and paying for ads which run alongside popular blog-sites and social-networking pages. Predictive analytics are carefully looking at product purchases by individuals and determining how they can get in touch with their target audiences in a world that is quickly shutting them out. In fact, consumers may not even purchase an item at an Internet store-front, but remnants of their shoe-surfing session at Amazon.com may linger as they check their Facebook pages. In the age of digital video recording, business advertising money is shifting from corporate public relations firms to instant small-town celebrities such as a blogger in Nebraska who has hundreds-of-thousands who read her postings. Also, sales for strategic product placement, such as within blockbuster movies and television shows, are becoming more popular in an effort to show audience-
appealing characters using products (Pompper & Yih-Farn, 2008). These products can range from a beverage to a car.

Viral campaigns are another way commercial-makers are hoping to attract attention to products and meet identified instant gratification needs of the Westernized public. The hope is that through word-of-mouth and E-link forwarding consumers will seek out the advertisement rather than the advertisement being forced on the consumer. Viewers see carefully place Starbucks, or Coke drinks, on the trays of the judges on The Voice. Viewers hear about eating at Subway, why one should eat Jennie-O Turkey, and about a celebrity’s cook-book on The Biggest Loser. Viewers even watch competitions promoting companies. On the reality show Celebrity Apprentice, Donald Trump encourages his players to build viral commercials using their celebrity status. The show The Shark Tank openly talks about the “Shark Tank Effect” on their TV show claiming that the striving entrepreneurs who are lucky enough to make it on the show must have their websites ready for the amount of orders that will come after their appearance on the show (Morabito, 2014). The hope is that people will hear about the campaign and be interested in viewing it as entertainment rather than as a promotion of a product. Also, if an advertisement is truly viral, consumers may feel as though they are unable to participate in social “loops” without viewing the commercial. This could be a reflection on Bandura’s Parasocial Interactions theories (1977).

**Purpose and Questions to Explore**

Social Networking allows for people to know intimate thoughts of others without requiring face-to-face interpersonal interactions. [S]ocial networking sites...offer novel platforms for users to broadcast personal information and get updates on other people’s lives. Such public sharing of private information blurs boundaries between private and public, raising questions about how people make judgments about disclosure and intimacy on [social networking sites] (Barzarova, 2012, p. 815).

Because social media does not require a business to brag about itself, it just requires a business to build a platform allowing customers to post about their experience, small businesses could easily join in their customer’s in the identity building process. Identity building could happen intentionally or unintentionally. For example: when a customer intentionally posts about their experience or unintentionally posts the product in their selfie, either of which might change their friends social norm of shopping (Messer, Shoe, Canady, Sheppard, & Vincus, 2011; McCreanor, Lyons, Griffin, Goodwin, Moewaka Barnes, & Hutton, 2013).

However, it may be a small businessperson’s mindset that they need large budgets to compete in social media marketing space or that only big companies can use social media strategies effectively. This research will use a case-study model to analyze the phenomena of customer broadcasting and product placement. Through the case-study an analysis of effects product placement is having (whether intentionally or unintentionally) on young media consumers and how marketers can create synergy within social media will be examined. Finally, this study will attempt to examine how small businesses can use already created social media marketing plans and implement them into their own businesses in efforts to cut costs on creating a social media marketing plan and potentially eliminate the mindset that only companies with large budgets can use social media momentum effectively. This study will use the following research questions to guide the case-study:

RQ1: Could a small businesses use a large business’ social media marketing strategy to increase business?

RQ2: Would it be beneficial to small businesses to use product placement in social networking marketing plans?

**Relevant Literature**

**Social Media Marketing**

Attraction to social media is growing because “[s]ocial networking sites are both a socialization tool and an expression of identity. Social networking sites enable users to share photographs, projects or manage their desired self-image and keep up to date with the latest trends in their environment” (Currás-Pérez, Ruiz-Mafé, & Sanz-Blas, 2013, p. 61). Donald Tapscott (2009), in his book Grown Up Digital, shares that the “Net Generation” has certain expectations, many of which have arisen out of their access
to a global network at an instantaneous speed. Tapscott emphasizes that the Net Generation has the ability to fact-check with professionals, and their friends, with a web search. They have the ability to find other Internet users, who have similar interests, using their mobile devices.

Social networking photos shared with friends could really be defined as product placement on a local level. Researchers are concerned that communication of such activities such as drinking will encourage drinking and spike a growth within the activity (Mcreanor, Lyons, Griffin, Goodwin, Moewaka Barnes & Hutton, 2013). Instead of purchasing a product due to the endorsement by famous people they admire, consumers may now be more likely to use a product their acquaintances are featuring on their kitchen table, at their BBQ, or at a local party. Consumers may not have been invited to the party, but they were certainly invited to view the Tweeted pictures of the great feast; a perfect example of unplanned branding. It should be noted that product placement within social media may have been initially unplanned; and thus uncontrolled. However, social wellness strategies are often promoted on the Internet for prosocial efforts. Some Internet campaigns target this need for identity building by endorsing positive behaviors heavily such as teen pregnancy prevention (Messer, Shoe, Canady, Sheppard, & Vincus, 2011). The hope is that viewers reached will comply with the social movement, based upon their newly discovered social norms.

**Going Viral**

Social media has a way of putting the consumer at the center of attention. Since it is Internet-based, it is more flexible to read and reach consumers at the point of their personal interests (Thackeray, Neiger & Keller, 2012). Because of self-centered consumers many companies have hired whole departments of employees devoted to reaching and marketing to potential customers managing several social media sites in hopes of creating viral marketing strategies. What corporate companies need to know, and desire to know, is how to become viral.

Adam Mills (2012) tries to define viral marketing in two points,

First, the term ‘viral’ connotes infection: rapid spreading across individuals and communities, growing exponentially with each cycle. The key to such rapid and successive spreading is that the virus is contagious and therefore distribution is both self-propelled and exponential. Second, ‘going viral’ most often refers to the spread of a thing—particularly in the context of social media—more so than information” (p. 163).

While accidental product placement might occur most often at a local level, with social networking capabilities, these advertisements, placed properly, have the opportunity to go global. The question is simply: How? Mills (2012) shares a SPIN Framework for creating viral marketing campaign which says that for something to go viral it must have four components: Spreadability, Propagativity, Integration, and Nexus (p. 166). Ultimately the marketing strategy needs to appeal to the voyeuristic tendencies of viewers (Spreadability/Propagativity) encouraging them to purchase the product in an attractive or interesting way (Integration) that they will pass the message on to their friends and family (the Nexus). Then viewers will not be “out of the loop” regarding the next pop-culture statement, public rumor, sale, or funny joke that is in the current Internet circuit.

**Small Business Marketing**

Instead of focusing on the negatives that accidentally, or purposely, implemented social networking product placement can have, it is paramount to brainstorm how society and small businesses could use the power of SPIN to get their products, stores, and ideas on the virtual map (Mills, 2012). It is hard to copy social media marketing plans from other businesses in exact form. In the restaurant business, for example, recent research has shown that there is no consistency to how social media advertising is created, therefore it is very hard to define exactly how it is affecting various businesses sales and growth (DiPietro, Crews, Gustafson, Strick, 2012). This makes sense according to Tapscott (2009) as social media provides users with the opportunity to customize their communication channels depending on their needs, wants, abilities, and visions. However, it is could be assumed that a small business could model a successfully campaign of a large business.

Small businesses should first strive to understand the difference between commercial marketing and social marketing. Smith (2006) clearly defines that there is a difference between social marketing and
commercial marketing by explaining that commercial marketing has a goal of making money where social marketing has a goal of changing cultural practices. Both have similar effects of changing the habits of the targeted audience. Small businesses should take the mindset that they are not going to make direct sales from a single Facebook status update, a Tweet, or a blog posting. What small businesses need to strive to do is build a social community that is habitually going to refer to their social networking pages (Sterns, 2007; Partala, 2011; Walther, Liang, DeAndrea; Tong, Carr, Spottswood, Amichai-Hamburger, 2011; Wesley, Yu-Hao, 2011). All items posted should reflect the interests of the consumer (Horn, 2011).

Dominic Lasorsa (2012) shares that constancy, transparency, credibility and reliability are key to building a trusting following and a social networking community membership no matter what the age group. If marketers, especially small-business marketers, do not find a niche that brings growth in their social community, they should not be discouraged. They should just try again while continuing to be open, honest, and audience focused.

Method

As the literature review revealed completely reinventing the wheel may be unnecessary for small businesses interested in implementing a social media marketing plan. There are many books, pod-casts, and websites that share various testimonies on social networking strategies for businesses. Whether the business is big or small, there may be some elements of a large social media marketing plan that can be used for a beginner. For example: On a podcast channel (found free on iTunes) called Inside Social Media by Rick (March 27, 2013) Rick interviewed Scott Monty. Scott works for Ford Motor Company as the Global Head of Social Media. In this episode, Scott shared that Ford Motor Company gave away free cars to consumers in exchange for social media postings, specifically videos of the consumers using the product, and that they received an overwhelming amount of target audience views of the videos the consumers self-produced and published via their own social networking pages. This was great P.R. for Ford, it asked the consumer do the leg-work, and also provided daily testimonials from the consumer.

Using a comparative case-study method this research strives to answer the first research question which asked: Could a small businesses use a large business’ social media marketing strategy to increase business? When analyzing Ford’s marketing strategy and use of product placement it is easy to see how a small business could use a big company’s strategy as its own. The small business, depending on what the business is selling/servicing, could potentially give away product or services in exchange for consumer testimonials. This strategy easily has the ability to follow the steps of SPIN as analyzed in the literature review (Mills, 2012). To analyze this question a small local coffee shop, The Java Café, located in Nebraska, agreed to implement elements of Ford’s campaign, specifically their product placement strategy on social media, to see if they could increase sales and teen customers. It could be assumed that the results could contribute to answering the second research question which inquired: Would it be beneficial to small businesses to use product placement in social networking marketing plans?

Large Business Campaign Analysis: Ford Motor Company

Host Rick Mulready’s podcast gives details of Ford’s product placement campaign. In the interview posed the following question to, Marketing Director, Scott Monty,

Can you give me an example of when-you know, a type of a-or an instance or a campaign ...[where] you’ve really seen an uptake because of that engagement and that communication with people... and [can]say okay, there’s a connection between the social media and the engagement that we were doing there to sales of extra [name of product]...? (Inside Social Media, 2013).

Scott replied,

Well, when we launched the original Fiesta Movement in 2009, it was only social media for the pre-launch portion of the campaign and we gave 100 cars to 100 people over the course of six months and told them you just have to make to make one video for us each month and beyond that you can do whatever you want. So, they’re out there, you know, on the streets and online with this car nobody else has and they’re out there driving around and showing it off, having fun, making pictures, making videos, tweeting, blogging, everything and it’s not Ford Motor Company that’s talking, it’s 100 individuals. And it’s perception and it’s unedited, unfiltered, uncensored.
So at the end of the campaign there, we had a 132,000 people who learned about this and they said, you know what, when this gets to the dealerships, sign me up. Tell me more about this. 83% of those people had never owned a Ford before. Maybe even never considered Ford before. And so we’re reaching a completely new demographic of a generation to people that would have not considered Ford beforehand (Inside Social Media, 2013).

With this interview in mind as evidence of social media marketing success, a comparable marketing scheme was proposed to the local coffee shop; The Java Café.

Small Business Implementation:
The social media platform the The Java Café wanted to engage with first was Twitter. The purpose of creating a Twitter account and setting up to use social media as a marketing tool was to reach a teen audience. It was paramount that the campaigns engage with high school students specifically. Tweeting is free and easy to use which paired nicely with the Java Café’s limited marketing budget. The goals set by the business owner for the first campaign were: 1. To show that the Java Café is a teen friendly business. 2. To increase awareness of their product offerings.

The Java Café felt that having teens engage with their social media platform would be most beneficial in reaching their goals. Since teens were used in this campaign and research study IRB forms were filed with the University and permission slips were signed by parents. To launch a social media campaign for The Java Café specifically designed to reach high school students, it was decided that the business owner should give away free product, as inspired by Ford, and ask only for Twitter recommendations by high school student in exchange for the product. High school student customers were hand invited to by the Java Café owner to participate in the campaign. They agreed that that they would participate at-will in the campaign. The students agreed to receive free coffee or food product from The Java Café. In exchange, the participants were asked to tweet about their experience at The Java Café. Some suggestions of what the students should tweet about included: Tweeting about what they are eating, tweeting a photograph of them and their friend having a good time at The Java Café, encouraging their friends to follow the Java café profile, take a picture of their drink and advocate the flavor, talking about the customer service that they received. In exchange for a consumable product from the Java Café they would be required to tweet about their experience 5 times. The students agreed to tag Twitter handle @JavaCafeYork in order to let the business know that they were enjoying their product and service while allowing the business to know when it was being talked about for re-tweeting purposes. The profiles of the students are in Figure 1.

Findings and Discussion
The campaign produced 30 tweets specifically talking about @JavaCafeYork and the products that they sell over a two-week period. These tweets are available for The Java Café owner to retweet. The students used product placement, naturally, in their tweets. Some examples of the tweets examples of Tweets which included The Java Café product placement are found in Figure 2, 3, and 4.

The Java Café did gain followers as the six high school students that were a part of the campaign began to follow her in order to participate in the marketing strategy. Beyond the hired participants quantitatively this campaign produced an increase of 27 Twitter followers over a two-week time-frame to @JavaCafeYork. The Java Café reported a small growth in sales and also an estimated 8% growth in teen customers after the campaign. This growth was measured by employees taking survey of ages of customers before and after the campaign implementation. The increases in followers and customers may be considered low but this could be due to the short time-frame of the campaign.

This campaign was designed to test two research questions. The first research question asked if a small businesses could use a large business’ social media marketing strategy to increase business. Although The Java Café did some alterations to meet their needs, they very successfully were able to use Ford Motor Company’s example and implement it on a scale that was manageable for them. The second research question asked if it would be beneficial to small businesses use product placement in social networking marketing plans? The Java Café campaign results share that small businesses can experience growth by making small efforts to show their product through social media. The benefits of showing the
product through customer tweets increased the small businesses social media presence. It could be argued that it increased sales from their teen-targeted audience however, further testing may be needed.

It is the results of the campaign which produce a recommendation that The Java Café follow a small social networking marketing plan with the mindset of Ford Motor Company Fiesta campaign (Inside Social Media, 2013). Ford, a large corporation, understands that social media is about building relationships within a target audience pool which small business is good at. Scott said, “[O]ftentimes in terms of relationship building and we think of advanced technology that we’re at, but really it’s bringing business back. It’s bringing it back to its very core which what lots of solopreneurs and small business owners know about (Inside Social Media, 2013).

Hopefully The Java Café, which is new to the social media, world will continue to look at this project as something that can really build growth and community.

It’s about awareness and it’s about consideration rather than about driving leads or sales. I mean obviously you’re in business to sell things and to make money and that’s what you hope all of this points to, but it won’t work unless your company has a good reputation that people trust you and that they pay attention on what you’re talking about (Inside Social Media, 2013).

Small businesses contribute so much to the communities and many could grow if they were educated on the power of social media marketing. This study not only contributed to research in understanding how small businesses and large conglomerates should use social media marketing and product placement, it also shares that entrepreneurs need to be taught how to market in this competitive space and encouraged to develop a mindset that they can be successful in ecommerce. It is time for small businesses to break out their virtual handshake in the digital community!

References
Young Adults With Film and Television Product Placements. *Atlantic Journal of Communication, 16*(1), 49-69.


**Figure 1-Student Profiles**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student</th>
<th>School</th>
<th>Met Expectations</th>
<th>Twitter Followers</th>
<th>Twitter Following</th>
<th>Grad Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Sophomore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>Junior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>424</td>
<td>Soph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Homeschool</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Nearby Town</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Senior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>freshmen</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 2-Student Product Placement Tweet #1**

Text: “Enjoying a nice Strawberry banana smoothie @JavaCafeYork!”
Figure 3-Student Product Placement Tweet #2
Text: “@JavaCafeYork great service.”

Figure 4-Student Product Placement Tweet #3
Text: “@JavaCafeYork is the place to be!”